

ARIZONA INDEPENDENT REDISTRICTING COMMISSION

Thursday, October 27, 2011
6:08 p.m.

Location

**Eastern Arizona College
Lee Little Theater
Activity Center
1014 North College Avenue
Thatcher, Arizona 85552**

Attending

Scott Day Freeman, Vice Chair

Ray Bladine, Executive Director
Buck Forst, Information Technology Specialist
Kristina Gomez, Deputy Executive Director
Stu Robinson, Public Information Officer

Mary O'Grady, Legal Counsel

Reported By:
Marty Herder, CCR
Certified Court Reporter #50162

1 Thatcher, Arizona
2 October 27, 2011
3 6:08 p.m.

4
5 P R O C E E D I N G S

6
7 (Whereupon, the public session commences.)

8 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: This hearing of the Arizona
9 Independent Redistricting Commission will please come to
10 order.

11 The time is 6:08 p.m.

12 It is Thursday, October 27th, 2011. And the
13 Commission is in Thatcher, Arizona, Eastern Arizona College.

14 And we also have a satellite location set up in
15 Clifton at the Greenlee County Courthouse.

16 Won't you please rise with me to recite the Pledge
17 of Allegiance.

18 (Whereupon, the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.)

19 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Well, thank you all for
20 coming out tonight. It's great to see such a great turnout.
21 And thanks to everyone in Clifton, where I see there as
22 well, participating in our satellite office.

23 We're here tonight to receive public comment on
24 the two proposed draft maps, the draft legislative map and
25 draft congressional map.

1 I think what -- the public input on those maps is
2 going to be very important to us going forward.

3 Before we get too far into this, federal law
4 requires that the Commission make translation services
5 available, so I'd like to invite Brian McBride to come to
6 the podium. He's going to read an announcement in English
7 and Spanish offering those services.

8 BRIAN MCBRIDE: Vice-Chair Freeman, commissioners,
9 ladies and gentlemen, in accordance with the Voting Rights
10 Act, a translator/interpreter will be available at all
11 public hearings in order to provide translating/interpreting
12 services that might be needed for those citizens that need
13 translating or interpreting services.

14 Please contact the translator/interpreter present
15 at this meeting so that he can assist you.

16 And I will be the translator/interpreter this
17 evening.

18 (Whereupon, the interpreter made a statement in
19 Spanish.)

20 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

21 Thank you all again. My name is Scott Freeman. I
22 am one of five commissioners on the Redistricting
23 Commission.

24 All of our hearings are recorded live. They are
25 live streamed on the Internet, unless we're at a place where

1 it cannot be live streamed they're recorded and then later
2 on the Internet.

3 All commissioners don't come to all of these
4 meetings. There's at least 26, perhaps more, public comment
5 hearings that the Commission scheduled over a
6 two-and-a-half, three-week period. So the commissioners
7 have sort of divided the duties across the state.

8 I know that those hearings that I haven't been
9 able to attend in person, I've watched them all live when
10 they've been available live on the live stream. And I know
11 that Chair Colleen Mathis, Vice-Chair Herrera,
12 Commissioner McNulty, and Commissioner Stertz are watching
13 the proceedings tonight and are with us tonight through the
14 Internet.

15 I'd like to introduce a few other people who are
16 here tonight.

17 To my left is counsel for the Commission,
18 Mary O'Grady, from the firm of Osborn Maledon.

19 To her left is Willie Desmond from the firm
20 Strategic Telemetry, the mapping consultant for the
21 Commission.

22 Also here tonight in the back is Ray Bladine, the
23 executive director of the Commission.

24 Also next to him is Kristina Gomez, our assistant
25 executive director.

1 We also have I think out in the hallway a public
2 information officer. You probably met him at the table out
3 there. Stu Robinson.

4 We have Buck Forst down here behind these boxes.
5 He's running the live stream. Our technology officer.

6 Everything that is being said tonight is being
7 taken down by our court reporter, Marty Herder, who's down
8 below me where I can't even see.

9 And we also have our public outreach assistants
10 with us tonight, and they are actually in Clifton. Karen
11 Herrman and Shane Shields, from what I can see.

12 And we'll turn to you later when we have public
13 comment to take public comment from Clifton.

14 Next on the agenda we have a brief presentation
15 from our mapping consultant, who's going to explain the
16 redistricting process in Arizona and how we got to where we
17 are now.

18 So I'll turn the program over for Mr. Desmond.

19 WILLIE DESMOND: Thank you. My name is Willie
20 Desmond. I work with Strategic Telemetry. We're the firm
21 hired to assist the Commission with technical assistance in
22 the mapping process.

23 I'm excited to be here and to hear more about what
24 you have to say and to explain a little bit more about what
25 went into these draft maps and how the process has worked.

1 Today we'll be discussing the draft maps that have
2 been approved by the Arizona Independent Redistricting
3 Commission for both the congressional and legislative maps.

4 The goal of these meetings is to hear public
5 comments from you about the draft maps.

6 So, again, thank you for taking the time to attend
7 tonight and thank you in advance for your comments on them.

8 The draft maps you'll see tonight are currently
9 under a 30-day review period that the Commission -- so that
10 the Commission can hear your input and learn as much as we
11 can about the feelings of Arizonans as we proceed forward.

12 Before going on to the maps though, I do want to
13 give you a little bit of background on the redistricting
14 process.

15 So, Arizona's redistricting process is governed by
16 the state constitution as amended by the voters of Arizona
17 following -- in the year 2000 with the passage of
18 Proposition 106.

19 It stipulates that the Arizona Independent
20 Redistricting Commission redraw Arizona's congressional and
21 legislative district lines to reflect the results of the
22 most recent census.

23 The most recent census being in 2010.

24 As a result of this census, Arizona gained a ninth
25 congressional seat.

1 Arizona's Proposition 106 lays out six criteria.
2 The first one is that it must comply -- all plans must
3 comply with the U.S. Constitution and the Voting Rights Act.
4 Also equal population.

5 These first two criteria are federally mandated.
6 All plans must meets these criteria nationwide for
7 congressional maps.

8 Additionally, to the extent practicable, the
9 districts must be compact and contiguous, respect
10 communities of interest, use visible geographic features,
11 city, town, county boundaries, and undivided census tracts.
12 Also we must favor competitive districts where there's no
13 significant detriment to other goals.

14 All right. Just a little bit more background on
15 the Voting Rights Act.

16 Arizona's congressional and legislative districts
17 must receive preclearance or approval from the Department of
18 Justice or a federal court under Section 5 of the
19 Voting Rights Act before they can take effect.

20 To get preclearance, Arizona must demonstrate that
21 the new districts do not discriminate against minority
22 voters in purpose or effect, which means there can be no
23 intentional or accidental discrimination.

24 Under Section 5, Arizona's redistricting plans
25 cannot be retrogressive. The plans cannot weaken or reduce

1 minority voters' rights.

2 Also, the presence of discrimination can be
3 determined by analyzing population data and election
4 results.

5 At this point we're going to show a brief video
6 from Bruce Adelson.

7 He's an attorney with Federal Compliance
8 Consulting. He's been assisting the Commission and advising
9 us on the Voting Rights Act and preclearance process.

10 (Whereupon, a video presentation of Bruce Adelson
11 was shown.)

12 WILLIE DESMOND: Okay. So, overall the
13 redistricting process can be broken down into five stages or
14 steps or phases.

15 The first of which was that the Commission needs
16 to be established.

17 The commissioners were appointed earlier this year
18 following a thorough screening process, and they serve in a
19 voluntary role for the state of Arizona.

20 The five commissioners that were selected this
21 year are Vice Chairman Scott Freeman, who's here this
22 evening, Vice Chairman Jose Herrera, Chairwoman Colleen
23 Mathis, and Commissioners Linda McNulty and Richard Stertz.

24 The next step would be the first round hearings.

25 Before drawing a single line, the Commission held

1 23 public hearings around the state in July and August to
2 get input from the members of the public about issues
3 relevant to the redistricting process, such as geography,
4 communities of interest, minority voters' rights, and
5 competitiveness.

6 Step three would be mapping.

7 We'll discuss this a little more later, but per
8 Proposition 106 we must start with a complete -- a clean
9 slate. Then we divide the state into equal district --
10 equal population districts in a compact and grid-like
11 process, to create a grid map.

12 The grid map this year was approved on
13 August 18th.

14 Since adopting the grid maps, the Commission has
15 met more than 25 times to consider adjustments to the grid
16 maps to accommodate the rest of the constitutional criteria.

17 During this time they received additional public
18 comments and have worked hard to draft these maps that
19 you'll see tonight.

20 The approval of these draft maps happened on
21 October 3rd for the congressional map and on October 10th
22 for the legislative draft map.

23 All right. To show how the Commission came to
24 these current draft maps, we'll show the progression of the
25 maps.

1 Currently we're visiting 25 towns -- I think
2 that's actually 26 now -- and cities to hear the
3 public's input on these draft maps and receive additional
4 comment. This is all taking place during October and
5 November.

6 The fifth step will be upon completion of the
7 public comment period the AIRC will adopt the final maps.

8 Finally the last step will be preclearance.
9 Because Arizona is subject to Section 5 of the Voting Rights
10 Act, the district maps must be approved by the federal
11 Department of Justice or the federal court in Washington,
12 D.C., before they can be used for Arizona elections.

13 All right. The map you can see up here was the --
14 is the current congressional draft map. This map will be
15 phased out. It was retired after the 2010 election.

16 Per Proposition 106, we needed to start with a
17 blank slate, so this is -- this was the starting point for
18 these draft maps.

19 Also per Proposition 106, the Commission created
20 different draft maps that I touched on earlier.

21 This, this grid map, I'm sorry, only takes into
22 account two criteria. It has equal population and it has
23 compact and contiguous districts.

24 All the other requirements need to be met by
25 adjusting this draft map.

1 This draft map was approved on August 18th. The
2 Commission was presented with two different options, and
3 they selected this one, option two, which is seen here.

4 Following that, after more than 25 meetings, the
5 Commission voted to approve the draft map that you see here.

6 And in addition to taking into consideration the
7 six criteria, the Commission took into consideration public
8 comment provided by -- at the public meetings, the round one
9 public hearings, comments that were mailed in, e-mailed,
10 hand-delivered, faxed, and telephoned. Over 5,000 public
11 comments helped develop this draft map.

12 As you see, some of the highlights in the
13 congressional map are there are two predominantly rural
14 district on the east and west side, there are three border
15 districts, three districts in the greater Tucson region,
16 five districts entirely in Maricopa County, going to great
17 length to avoid splitting Indian reservations, and there are
18 two districts where minority voters have the opportunity to
19 elect candidates of their choice.

20 Okay. Again, per Proposition 106 the
21 congressional(sic) draft map followed a very similar path.

22 This is the old draft map, the one that was last
23 used in 2010.

24 Again, per Proposition 106 we started with a blank
25 slate.

1 We then again developed a grid map that only
2 satisfied two of the six criteria: Equal population and
3 compact and contiguous districts.

4 Again, after the 25 meetings, the Commission
5 developed this draft map.

6 Arizona has 30 legislative districts, and each has
7 one senator it elects and two house members.

8 There are some important points to mention about
9 this legislative draft map.

10 The population growth has been taken into account.
11 Some of the old districts had population as low as 155,000
12 or as high as 378,000.

13 The current draft map has a range of about 207,000
14 to around 215,000.

15 To comply with the Voting Rights Act, the draft
16 map includes ten districts in which minority voters have the
17 opportunity to elect their candidate of their choice.

18 The draft includes three districts wholly within
19 Pima County, Districts 3, 9, and 10, and three additional
20 southern Arizona districts, one, two, and four. Seventeen
21 districts primarily within Maricopa County, and nine
22 districts primarily rural.

23 All right. The Commission wants to make sure you
24 stay connected throughout this process, and it's eager to
25 hear your input.

1 To make sure your voice is heard, there are
2 several ways of commenting or giving us your feelings.

3 You can fill out a request to speak form and speak
4 at one of these meetings. You can submit your input at the
5 hearing or on the website. You can visit at
6 [www.azredistricting.com\(sic\)](http://www.azredistricting.com(sic)), or you can call us at
7 (602)542-5221, or toll free at (855)733-7478.

8 All right. Most people here are interested in the
9 draft maps, which can be found on the website and here at
10 the meeting.

11 We do have a screen shot of the website here.
12 You'll notice a few things.

13 You can click on the meetings tab to get
14 information about what meetings are coming up.

15 There's a public input button so you can submit
16 your input.

17 And you can view the maps down at the bottom.

18 So if you do click on this maps button, it'll take
19 you to a page that looks very much like this.

20 This allows you to see some of the maps and the
21 data tables and the reports that go along with them.

22 I do want to point your attention to one specific
23 file type, and that's the Google maps here.

24 If you click on that Google maps link, it will
25 open up the maps in a page that looks very much like this.

1 It's a good way to view the maps because you can
2 zoom in to your individual house, you can look at any
3 streets that you're curious about, you can follow the
4 boundaries very easily.

5 Using these buttons on the left-hand side you can
6 turn off the counties, you can turn off the actual district
7 shading, and really kind of play around and explore how the
8 maps work.

9 I want to show you -- it's easy to zoom in. You
10 can go down to the city level or the street level or even
11 the house level.

12 So this is a zoom in of an area in
13 Maricopa County, but just an example.

14 As I wrap this up, I just want to highlight a few
15 things, again, on the commission's website. If you visit
16 the website at azredistricting.org, you can draw your own
17 maps.

18 You can watch the current meetings and the past
19 meetings and you can get updates on future meetings.

20 I also encourage you to keep up with us on social
21 media, if you're into that sort of thing.

22 You can follow us on Twitter at hash tag
23 AIRC or you can friend us on Facebook at
24 [Facebook.com/azredistricting](https://www.facebook.com/azredistricting).

25 All right. Well, I just want to thank you all

1 again for being here.

2 We're very excited to hear what you have to say
3 and learning more about, about your feelings.

4 Please feel free to talk to me at the end of the
5 meeting or anyone else on staff if you have any questions,
6 that more than happy to help you with anything or answer any
7 questions you might have.

8 Thank you.

9 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you, Mr. Desmond.

10 I as well will stay after the hearing for everyone
11 has any questions or would like to talk about the
12 redistricting process.

13 Before we get to public comment, I want to extend
14 a special thanks to Keith Alexander, Eastern Arizona
15 College. He was instrumental in setting up the meeting we
16 have here today and I understand also instrumental in
17 setting up at the county courthouse in Clifton.

18 Next is public comment.

19 If you would like to address the Commission,
20 there's these yellow request to speak forms that should be
21 on the table out in the hall.

22 If you want to come and speak tonight, please fill
23 one out, give it to our staff, and they'll get it up to me.

24 If you don't want to give public comment at the
25 microphone tonight, you should have also picked up a packet

1 that has printouts of the maps in the back. There's this
2 blue form you can complete and leave your comments in
3 writing. You can either complete them tonight and hand them
4 to our staff and take them home or complete them at home at
5 your leisure and mail them to the Commission.

6 And of course if you go to the website that
7 Mr. Desmond mentioned, azredistricting.org, you can find a
8 link there. There's a public comment form available to you
9 on the website. And you just transmit it over the Internet,
10 and that gets to the Commission as well.

11 There are also phone numbers that you can call the
12 Commission and speak to staff if you have any questions or
13 would like to leave comments.

14 So with that, we'll turn to the public comment
15 portion of the program.

16 Right now I have 13 request to speak forms here,
17 and I know there's at least one person in Clifton who would
18 like to speak.

19 So I'd ask tonight that everyone try to limit your
20 comments to five minutes. And, Mr. Forst will keep a timer.
21 And when you hear the chime, that doesn't mean you have to
22 stop. It's just a reminder to try to wrap up your thoughts
23 so we're fair to everyone here and everyone gets a chance to
24 speak.

25 And when I call you, please come to the microphone

1 and state your name and spell it so that we have an accurate
2 spelling of your name for the record.

3 And, if I haven't announced this when I called
4 your name, please tell us who you representing, if anyone,
5 yourself or a group, and tell us the town, city, or county
6 that you're from. Again, if I haven't already said that.

7 Now I have 14.

8 So first I'd like to invite James Palmer, chairman
9 of the Graham County Board of Supervisors, from Graham
10 County.

11 CHAIRMAN JAMES PALMER: Thank you,
12 Vice Chairman Freeman, staff members.

13 We appreciate you making the effort to come be
14 with us this evening, and I want to extend a welcome to you
15 to Graham County and express our appreciation for your
16 efforts to come hear what the people in Graham County has
17 have to say.

18 I'm a lifelong resident of this county. I have
19 represented Thatcher, central Pima, Klondyke, and
20 Fort Thomas for the past 11 years on the Board of
21 Supervisors.

22 I am currently the board chairman, and I am a past
23 president of the County Board of Supervisors Association.

24 And I realize now that I just forgot to spell my
25 name. It's P-A-L-M-E-R.

1 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: And I forgot to remind you.

2 CHAIRMAN JAMES PALMER: And I am here in my
3 capacity as a leader of the community to dispel the notion
4 that Graham County and four of our neighboring counties can
5 be sacrificed to satisfy the political aims of communities
6 that are far removed from us physically, socially, and
7 economically.

8 The legislative draft map has me very concerned
9 that the communities of eastern Arizona have only relevance
10 for their population, and our relevance and effective voice
11 in the state legislative process is about to be silenced.

12 The legislative draft map splits Graham County
13 into two different districts, actually I think it's three,
14 but the population are in two.

15 It does not keep Graham and Greenley Counties
16 together.

17 Graham and Greenley are nearly identical in
18 their communities of interest. They both have significant
19 agriculture, mining, and water issues. And they actually
20 cooperate with each other to provide some county services.

21 No two counties in the state are more
22 interdependent than these two, and they stand to lose the
23 best representation that they've had in a long time here in
24 the Arizona legislature.

25 Graham County's community of interest lies within

1 the small towns of our neighboring eastern counties where
2 our ancestors from all walks of life and ethnicities carved
3 out farms, ranches, mines, and communities out of rural
4 Arizona.

5 They do not lie with the communities of
6 Sierra Vista and eastern Pinal County where border and
7 military and urban issues are the order of the day.

8 The communities of Safford, Morenci, San Carlos,
9 Globe, and Payson have far more in common with
10 Heber-Overgaard, Snowflake, Taylor, Winslow, Holbrook,
11 Show Low and Pinetop -- too fast.

12 And Pinetop, than Flagstaff, Window Rock and Vail.

13 Any map that puts White River and Pinetop-Lakeside
14 in a different district than Show Low, but keeps Show Low
15 with Flagstaff, is seriously flawed.

16 White River, Pinetop-Lakeside, and Show Low share
17 everything, shopping, hospitals, roads, forests, and the
18 list goes on.

19 Therefore I support the comments that
20 Chairman Lupe of the White Mountain Apache delivered to this
21 body at the hearing in Hon Dah. We need common
22 representation so that our issues are addressed by people
23 who are part of our community, and we need local communities
24 to stay together.

25 Our communities are founded and maintained on

1 ranching, farming, mining, tourism, and natural resource
2 development.

3 Not Navajo, Gila, Apache, Graham, and Greenlee
4 Counties are neighbors. We share roads, watershed, forests,
5 and the issues that go with them. Yet these counties have
6 been pulled apart by the draft maps that have been adopted
7 by this body.

8 The legislative draft map puts Greenlee County
9 with Navajo and Hopi tribes.

10 These communities have little to no interaction
11 and our physically isolated from each other by hundreds of
12 miles.

13 The legislative draft map splits both Gila and
14 Navajo Counties into three legislative districts. While
15 this configuration may supply population numbers to other
16 areas, it does not lead -- lend any credibility or
17 confidence to the competitive voting strength of our
18 citizens and it devastates our voice in Phoenix.

19 The distance that separates Flagstaff and our
20 Native American neighbors to the south and the rest of this
21 region cannot be rationally justified as a stronger
22 community of interest or competitiveness argument when most,
23 if not all, of the population that would satisfy the
24 requirement for a legislative district comprising Flagstaff,
25 its the surrounding areas, and the communities of the Navajo

1 Nation are literally next door to each other.

2 Add to those facts the Navajo Nation spends
3 significant amounts of money in Flagstaff with consumer
4 goods, services, and education. Just like White River does
5 in Pinetop and Show Low and Bylas and San Carlos do in
6 Safford and Globe.

7 You've find every reason for keep the communities
8 of eastern Arizona together in a legislative district that
9 reflects true representation of communities of interest,
10 contiguous principles, and representation.

11 And then finally, on the congressional districts,
12 we would ask -- we submit to you from the eastern counties a
13 truly rural congressional district.

14 And we would ask that you put Gila County back
15 into that district.

16 There are roughly 1.5 million Arizonans that live
17 in non-metropolitan areas. That's more than 20 percent of
18 this population. We ask that you give the rural voters the
19 respect and choice to elect one of their own regardless of
20 party.

21 Similarly, keep Congressional District 4 rural.

22 Your early efforts to have those two truly rural
23 congressional districts led many of us to believe that the
24 real vote would actually mean something, but somehow that's
25 all changed, and we'd like to see those put back where we

1 really feel we have real representation.

2 It's been a privilege to be with you, and I would
3 answer any questions if you have any.

4 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you very much.

5 And, by the way, if anyone has pre-prepared
6 written remarks or maps that they would like to submit,
7 please give them to your executive director and staff.

8 CHAIRMAN JAMES PALMER: I have it. Want me to
9 give it to them in the back?

10 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Yes.

11 CHAIRMAN JAMES PALMER: Thank you.

12 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Next, Richard Lunt,
13 Greenlee County supervisor, chairman, representing Greenlee
14 County.

15 SUPERVISOR RICHARD LUNT: Richard Lunt, L-U-N-T.

16 Well, thank you very, very much. You've seen me
17 at many of these, and you know it's always hard to follow
18 someone -- one of my counterparts who we think alike, and he
19 being from Graham County and I am from Greenlee County, you
20 know, he's already expressed that we do a lot of things
21 together, because we are very much alike.

22 In fact, Greenlee County was formed from
23 Graham County, and back in 1909.

24 And so, first of all, I just want you to know that
25 we feel in Greenlee County that our voice is being silenced.

1 We -- much like Supervisor Palmer said, the old
2 LD 5, consisting of Greenlee, Gila, Graham, Navajo, and
3 Apache Counties, worked very well. And we had a voice. And
4 we had a -- especially in the legislative district, we, we
5 were heard, and we made a difference.

6 This legislative map puts Greenlee County in with
7 the Navajo, Apache, and Hopi tribes.

8 I want you to know this is unacceptable to the
9 residents of Greenlee County.

10 We just do not have the same interests as the
11 tribes do.

12 And I'll repeat that. We do not have any of the
13 same interests as the tribes do.

14 Another thing, your map splits Graham and Greenlee
15 Counties.

16 Our interests are the same, agriculture, mining,
17 water. And we actually cooperate with each other to provide
18 services to our constituents.

19 Boy, it's tough to follow someone that has a lot
20 of the ideas.

21 I know you want to keep this short.

22 Finally, I was one of those that proposed the
23 eastern counties organization map that we presented to you
24 the first part of this month. And we believe that that
25 map -- we put a lot of time and effort. We hired

1 consultants. We believe that it met your six requirements.
2 It gave -- it made us competitive. In this district, right
3 now we've had Republicans, we've had Democrats that
4 represented us. And we feel that the way that you're doing
5 this, that won't be the issue.

6 So please, whatever you do, Greenlee County wants
7 out of the District 7 that you have proposed. We just don't
8 have the same interests. And put us back together with the
9 counties that -- so we will have a voice and we won't be
10 silenced.

11 Now going to congressional districts. About
12 20 percent of the population in Arizona are rural. And we
13 look at things different.

14 They look at land as -- metro areas look at land
15 for a place to recreate. We look at it as a place -- as
16 a resource, a place to raise our families, to make a living.

17 They look at water as a commodity. We look at it
18 as a resource.

19 And I believe that the rural areas deserve to have
20 someone that is elected from our area. And I think we'll
21 give you an example.

22 Before this last districting we were in Tucson,
23 and Congressman Kolbe was our representative. And we'd go
24 over there, and we'd say, hey, we just don't agree with
25 this. And he says, I agree with you 100 percent, but you do

1 not elect me.

2 Now, is that a voice?

3 That's the difference. And that needs to be it.

4 Another thing, we want the EECO map, it had
5 District 4, CD 4, was another rural area. And you
6 gerrymandered that thing where it's picking up a lot of the
7 metro. And so, there again, our voice is being watered
8 down.

9 So please, listen to us.

10 It makes a difference -- we have to live with
11 this.

12 And what happens in Maricopa County, I wish would
13 stay in Maricopa.

14 And what happens in rural county I wish would stay
15 here, but that's not the way it works.

16 Last of all, I thank you for your efforts.

17 I bet if you knew then what you know now, I don't
18 know if you would have volunteered. But we appreciate your
19 effort, and we realize that the effort it takes to come and
20 listen to us.

21 But your decisions we will have to live with for
22 ten years.

23 And you've seen me at a lot of these. I wouldn't
24 be here and wouldn't have testified at so many if it didn't
25 make a difference to us in the rural areas.

1 Once again, thank you very much for your time.

2 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

3 Next is John Drew Graham County Board of
4 Supervisors, District 1.

5 DREW JOHN: After as many times as I've spoke,
6 it's actually Drew John. That's okay.

7 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Sorry.

8 DREW JOHN: That's a character builder. It's
9 John, the last name, J-O-H-N.

10 Vice Chair, members, those that are watching here
11 tonight, welcome to Graham County.

12 My counterpart speaks very eloquently about
13 everything. I'm going to touch on a few things that are
14 very important to me and the people of Graham County.

15 I'm one of the three supervisors here in
16 Graham County, and we represent about 40,000 citizens in
17 Graham County.

18 And we are a rural community.

19 And we work hard to keep it a friendly rural
20 community.

21 We have been able to accomplish this partly
22 because of the people you see here tonight and committees
23 like this.

24 Members like yourselves have seen the importance
25 of rural representation that have legislators that we elect

1 as rural citizens and understand our rural values.

2 You have the authority and charge to decide how it
3 we will be represented in our legislative district. This is
4 what I'm speaking on tonight.

5 You can decide whether to listen and do something
6 about what is being asked tonight.

7 What you're being asked is to keep Graham County
8 whole and continue to have rural representation.

9 As you been told many times, Graham and Greenlee,
10 as recently as Richard, were once the same county. Then it
11 was split.

12 We're sister counties. And when I say sister
13 counties, we are sister counties. We've always worked
14 together with many, many IGAs, MOUs, and sometimes even
15 share staff.

16 Our mining operations are owned by the same
17 company.

18 Our watershed supplies the needed water for
19 citizens and agricultural.

20 I've been on the watershed committee from since
21 2000. And we're dealing with Graham -- with Greenlee and
22 Graham all the time on our watershed, and we work together
23 well because they're our neighbors.

24 Keep our rural representation intact. Keep our
25 communities of interest together.

1 Someday one of you or one of your kids might want
2 to live in a rural community.

3 This is one of the ways to destroy a rural
4 community is to have representation from your metro areas.

5 If you want to keep rural communities so the metro
6 people have somewhere to visit to get away from the metro,
7 you need to keep the rural communities intact.

8 (Applause.)

9 DREW JOHN: And thank you for being here.

10 You know, this, this is not just a way of life,
11 it's our way of life, and we enjoy it, and we invite you to
12 move here and keep rural Arizona in place.

13 Thank you.

14 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

15 (Applause.)

16 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Next is Mayor Chris Gibbs,
17 mayor of Safford.

18 MAYOR CHRIS GIBBS: Vice Chairman Freeman, staff
19 members, welcome. Gibbs, G-I-B-B-S.

20 My name is Chris Gibbs, and I am the mayor of
21 Safford, which is the county seat of Graham County and the
22 economic center for southeastern Arizona.

23 Until now the mayors and councils of Graham County
24 have asked our county supervisors to speak to you concerning
25 our entire region. However I feel compelled and obligated

1 to speak about the apparent idea that our rural area of the
2 state is only important as a numbers pawn for communities
3 removed from us geographically, economically, socially, and
4 politically.

5 After listening to the commissioners -- or the
6 supervisors speak, I realized how closely my presentation
7 echoes theirs, but I'd like to state it anyway.

8 As far as the legislative districts go, the
9 proposed legislative draft map fails drastically in allowing
10 the rural communities of this region any relevant input to
11 the legislative process at the state capital.

12 Arizona is predominantly a rural state. At least
13 in area.

14 And yet this map appears only derived to satisfy
15 the number scenario to appease more populated centers and
16 silence its rural interests.

17 As drawn there could be -- could there ever been a
18 conceivable legislative candidate from the Gila Valley to
19 represent this district? Our population's less than 35,000,
20 and we couldn't compete with east Tucson, Vail,
21 Sierra Vista, each having many more numbers than that.

22 To legislatively separate Graham and Greenlee
23 County is nothing short of preposterous and definitely
24 appears to only satisfy political agendas for larger
25 populations centers far removed. These two interdependent

1 counties are the definition of the concept of communities of
2 interest.

3 You've been hearing it from each of the
4 supervisors.

5 We share everything.

6 Mining, agricultural, shopping centers, tourism,
7 major medical center, and even last names and some heritage.

8 This, this -- the groups that settled this area
9 are still here.

10 I personally am not originally from the region.
11 I've only been here seven years. But I can truly appreciate
12 those that have four and five generations in the soil here.

13 Now would be a great time, and it's already
14 mentioned, but water issues.

15 Graham and Greenlee County share a large drought
16 stricken watershed, and this arid state really needs to look
17 to that.

18 It's difficult enough to -- with the legal issues
19 that are always present for consideration in watersheds, but
20 to separate the legislative voice that we now enjoy would
21 really weaken any ability to govern water policies for this
22 region.

23 And the notion of communities of interest
24 certainly extends much farther than these two counties, same
25 basic interests, resources, and concerns are also shared

1 with Gila, Apache, and Navajo Counties, as you've already
2 heard.

3 However, the proposed legislative draft map splits
4 Graham County into two separate legislative districts,
5 Gila County into three, and Navajo County into three.

6 It forces Greenlee County to be in the same
7 district with groups hundreds of miles from their location,
8 and certainly have no commerce or political interaction.

9 The splits may help with the numbers game in other
10 areas, but here in our region it effectively silences any
11 political voice our citizens might have in state government.

12 Concerning congressional districts, I'm still not
13 sure why any county in the state needs to be divided on this
14 map, no matter what their population.

15 Border issues are specific. All border
16 communities should be part of the same solution.

17 How did Bisbee and Douglas get added somewhere
18 else?

19 And how did the original discussions of
20 two legitimate rural CDs just vanish?

21 Rural and urban citizens too have differing needs.
22 Why can't this vastly rural state have legitimately rural
23 representation in our state legislature and congress.

24 I plead with you to accept the maps already
25 supported by Graham County supervisors, Greenlee County

1 supervisors, and many of our regional friends.

2 In closing, I have one simple request. Give rural
3 voters a little respect. Don't lump us into some urban
4 district just to balance numbers. Without regard to
5 political party, let us choose our representation from local
6 area candidates we know might actually understand our
7 issues.

8 Please allow us our political voice.

9 Thank you.

10 (Applause.)

11 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: For our next I'd like to
12 throw it to Clifton. I think we have -- I have one speaker,
13 Doug Stacy.

14 And, again, as a reminder, if you could state your
15 name and spell it, tell us who you're representing if
16 someone other than yourself, and what town, city, or county
17 you're from.

18 DOUG STACY: My name is Doug Stacy, S-T-A-C-Y, no
19 E in it.

20 First of all, I'd like to thank you guys for going
21 through this process. I know it's a difficult process, but
22 this -- looking at these maps, our Board of Supervisors from
23 Graham and Greenlee County and the mayor from Safford has
24 already expressed some of the same issues that I have.

25 You know, people in Maricopa County and our

1 congressional district, you're proposed map on the
2 congressional district, they don't understand anything at
3 all.

4 We had a 538,000 plus acre fire that directly
5 affected our ranching operation and a lot of my neighbors on
6 the Blue Spring Trail ranger districts, the town of Greer.

7 And the people down in Maricopa that you guys have
8 listed on our congressional district, they don't care about
9 that.

10 The only thing they actually care about is trying
11 to get our water, which the supervisors have just expounded
12 on.

13 And I really wish you guys would take a hard look.

14 I'm for rural representation, and I don't care
15 about including Maricopa and Casa Grande and all the other
16 little communities down there, probably Coolidge involved.

17 They don't have the same issues that we have in
18 rural Arizona.

19 And I'd like to keep it rural too. I'm a native
20 Arizonan. My family has been here since the late 1800s.
21 And I guess I'm speaking for myself, but I had some people
22 when I left the ranch today tell me, speak for us too, Doug.
23 Because they have the same issues.

24 Everybody is after our water. And all you're
25 doing is throwing fuel on the fire when you're trying to

1 district us with districts that want our water and we're
2 trying to fight in opposition to taking our water. And the
3 water is everything to us.

4 And Richard expounded on or mentioned it earlier,
5 it's a commodity for the people down in the valley, and
6 all -- a lot of the so-called Indian tribes, the only thing
7 they're interested in is the money that's going to be
8 generated selling it to the metropolitan areas.

9 And we don't -- you know, all it's going to do is
10 kill us up here. It's already doing so.

11 And I'd just like to really -- right now I'd like
12 to also thank the board of supervisors, members from Graham
13 County and Richard from Greenlee County and the mayor of
14 Safford, and appreciate you guys and your time.

15 But I really wish you would really take into
16 consideration that five counties, the rural Arizona map that
17 was -- because I've seen it. I don't have my copy here. I
18 left it up to the ranch today. But it's a workable and a
19 rural map that really addresses the issues that are
20 pertaining to us.

21 And a lot of the people in the metropolitan areas,
22 they don't understand our issues at all.

23 In fact, we hardly have any voice now. I would
24 like to at least have some kind of a say.

25 So thank you for your time.

1 Really consider it, please. Thank you.

2 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

3 (Applause.)

4 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Next Bill Brandau, chair of
5 the Gila Watershed Partnership, Graham County.

6 BILL BRANDAU: My name is Bill Brandau,
7 B-R-A-N-D-A-U.

8 I'm representing the Gila Watershed Partnership,
9 but I'm a 35-year resident of Graham County.

10 This is a map of the upper Gila Watershed. It's
11 split by the state boundary. Half is in Mexico. Half is in
12 Arizona.

13 The east western portion is the San Carlos Dam.

14 My career has primarily been focused on natural
15 resource issues the entire 35 years.

16 As a chair of the Gila Watershed Partnership, we
17 wanted to express our concerns about the -- particularly the
18 legislative districts and the congressional district.

19 Our group is a broad-based community organization
20 that's been founded in 1992, with the novel idea of local
21 people solving most of the local issues.

22 One of the state agencies came to our community
23 and asked us to look at our issues and help solve them. So
24 we, kind of silly, decided to do that. And we've been
25 functioning since then.

1 We identify issues, we develop solutions, and we
2 seek funding, and we implement the actions with the
3 community.

4 Since our 19 years of existence, we have
5 successfully implemented millions of dollars of projects
6 in both Graham and Greenlee Counties to support the
7 watershed.

8 This year, we received the Partners In
9 Conservation award from the secretary of interior. One of
10 four in the country.

11 So we've been somewhat effective.

12 To this end, I want to speak about the
13 redistricting.

14 The Gila Watershed Partnership proposes that you
15 leave the Gila Watershed in one legislative district as it
16 has been for the last ten years.

17 Also in the same congressional district.

18 We believe that by doing so it furthers the goals
19 of the Arizona Constitution, Article 4, districts shall be
20 geographically compact, contiguous to the extent
21 practicable.

22 The district boundaries shall have -- respect
23 communities of interest to the extent practicable.

24 And to the extent practicable the district shall
25 have visible geographic features.

1 By definition a watershed is geographically
2 compact, it's contiguous, and has definite geographic
3 figures -- features as defined on the map.

4 And I'll give you a map.

5 Those address parts one and three.

6 What I'm really here to talk about is the
7 community of interest.

8 Watershed, its resources, and its people define a
9 community of interest.

10 And I wish to emphasize the community of interest
11 that exists in this watershed.

12 Statute generally prohibits the transfer of water
13 from one watershed to another. As a result, our water will
14 be generally managed and used in our watershed.

15 And when we're represented by people outside of
16 our watershed, we lose control of that.

17 Or at least lose -- I'm not as eloquent as the
18 politicians. We lose.

19 Regardless of artificial legislative boundaries.

20 The geography of watershed results in
21 transportation corridors being located in a manner that
22 creates communities, markets, and employment centers that
23 are completely within the watershed.

24 The -- by location, we are defined as rural.

25 I'm sorry. And I use this example.

1 The 40,000 people, 38,000 in Graham County and
2 eight or nine in Greenlee County, and you put in the other
3 people, those people don't even count up to half of what's
4 on the entire street of Indian School from east to west in
5 Phoenix.

6 And when we get gerrymandered into north Tucson or
7 gerrymandered into Casa Grande, we lose our representation.

8 The Upper Gila Watershed encompasses the majority
9 of Greenlee, Graham County, and Greenlee and Graham Counties
10 and portions of the Gila and Cochise and actually way up
11 here, Apache County.

12 The watershed's resources and its uses define our
13 community of interest.

14 The watershed produces water, wildlife, minerals,
15 forage, timber, open space, and the uses associated with
16 those resources, water, agriculture, our communities, the
17 wildlife, natural resources, hunting -- as a matter of fact,
18 just show you how important this is, I'm giving up my
19 morning hunt tomorrow to be here.

20 I'm giving that up to be here.

21 (Applause.)

22 BILL BRANDAU: And I'm sure you are too.

23 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: I feel your pain.

24 BILL BRANDAU: Minerals, we have one of the
25 largest copper mines.

1 These issues create a -- all these issues create a
2 very sharp learning curve for whether it be a legislature or
3 congressman.

4 In my previous life I've dealt with every
5 congressman for the last 20 years.

6 And when we had a congressman that was
7 representing us as a whole, we could talk to him and educate
8 him.

9 But when our congressman was representing Tucson,
10 it was very difficult to educate them on our issues.

11 Same thing with the legislators.

12 Understanding these issues in the watershed as
13 large and complex and important to the Upper Gila, and it's
14 difficult for a seasoned person to even understand, much
15 less a novice. And that's what we'll get when we get
16 somebody.

17 It's important that our lawmakers have an
18 incentive of a large, single block of voters to learn these
19 issues and represent.

20 It appears that the redistricting proposal will
21 divide the watershed, the communities of interest, the
22 citizens, and a -- into multiple legislative and
23 congressional districts.

24 And I think we're only going to be about 15 to
25 18 percent in any one of them.

1 We're going to lose our representation.

2 Not only will the citizens lose representation
3 here in this watershed, but our resources will lose too.

4 It was spoke of. Water is the major issue.

5 And when it's split up, it's very difficult for a
6 legislature or a congressman to focus on those as a whole.

7 So I thank you for time here, and I hope that you
8 put our districts back together where we can continue to be
9 productive and solve issues in our watershed.

10 Thank you.

11 (Applause.)

12 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Donna Orbegoso, representing
13 self.

14 DONNA ORBEGOSO: Good evening. My name is Donna
15 Orbegoso, O-R-B-E-G-O-S-O.

16 Dear Redistricting Commissioners, I recognize that
17 many long hours have been invested in the redistricting
18 meetings and hearings.

19 I am, however, a bit dismayed that schedules and
20 venues have been published and changed with very little
21 notice, and that makes it very hard especially for those of
22 us who work and live outside the large metropolitan areas to
23 arrange to attend meetings. So I thank you very much. I
24 appreciate you being here tonight.

25 As a concerned citizen of the current

1 Legislative District 5, I wish to register my support for
2 what I -- to the best of my recollection, you had an
3 option one 6A map that was previously proposed, and very
4 much -- we find that very easy to support.

5 And I would like you to reconsider that, that
6 option.

7 This map does preserve the communities of interest
8 of our current district, such as small rural communities,
9 farming, ranching, mining, mountainous areas, forest land,
10 and historical heritage.

11 Communities of interest is a major issue to be
12 considered in redrawing the district lines.

13 This map also keeps our counties geographically
14 intact and contiguous, which is another important issue to
15 be considered.

16 The lines I see that define the new districts
17 certainly meander around to give advantage to political
18 persuasions.

19 And I'd like to remind you to please remember when
20 you increase the percentage of an ethnic group in a
21 district, that percentage cannot be reduced later.

22 So when we're talking especially about the
23 district that contains all the Navajo or all the Indian
24 reservations, it would be very difficult to have a district
25 with a lower percentage of Indian ethnic population.

1 The maps currently being proposed have several
2 rural counties split in half, or three, at least three ways.
3 And parcel off to metropolitan districts.

4 Often the legislators and population of these
5 urban areas really are not aware of the uniqueness of rural
6 Arizona and do not realize the effect that legislation often
7 imposes upon rural areas.

8 I respectfully yet strongly request that you, the
9 Independent Redistricting Commission, reconsider the
10 long-term consequences of the current maps and the
11 imbalances that are being created.

12 Rural Arizona needs representation, and I do not
13 see that happening with these districts.

14 Thank you.

15 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

16 (Applause.)

17 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Rudy Dalpra, representing
18 self, from Safford.

19 RUDY DALPRA: You had the name right, Rudy Dalpra,
20 D-A-L-P-R-A.

21 Private citizen, retired, spent most of my life in
22 community journalism, so I try to pay attention to what's
23 going on around me.

24 On this particular issue, I'm kind of cold turkey.

25 So the only observation I want to make is I think

1 that the voters of Arizona, amazing at times, because when a
2 proposition is put on a ballot, the results are often
3 contrary to what I would have thought maybe the legislature
4 would do.

5 I think setting up this commission was a case in
6 point.

7 I think separating the deliberation over
8 redistricting and taking it out of the hands of politicians
9 who have vested interest was a very wise move.

10 And I'd like to compliment the members of the
11 Commission.

12 I was amazed when I got the handouts how much --
13 how many hearings you had and how much time you spent on
14 this project.

15 And I can understand the provincial interest of
16 the people that have already spoken.

17 And they're better prepared to deal with the issue
18 than I am, but generally speaking from going hastily over
19 the statistical data you had there, it would seem that what
20 you've come up with, as it is, meets the federal criteria.
21 Whether or not that can be adjusted to accommodate the
22 interests of the people who have spoken without jeopardizing
23 the one man, one vote principle, I don't know.

24 But in conclusion, again, I'd like to say that I
25 appreciate the work that you people have done.

1 (Applause.)

2 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

3 Don Carter from the county.

4 DON CARTER: My name is Don Carter, C-A-R-T-E-R.

5 Vice-Chair Freeman and staff, I've got a big, long
6 talk, but now we're restricted to five minutes, and so I can
7 ad lib now.

8 I think it would be easy to concur with everything
9 that's been said tonight, and I think perhaps by now you've
10 been hearing this time and time again over the past couple
11 of weeks.

12 But when the Commission was appointed by the
13 courts, they were given some very specific criteria to
14 follow.

15 And it appears to me as an observer or since that
16 very first meeting that we had down at ASU, and I think,
17 Vice-Chair Freeman, you and I talked, that there was some
18 concerns that I expressed about rural counties being
19 represented, and how we were going to be represented just on
20 the input to the Commission.

21 And I was told that we've have the opportunity
22 through the set up that we have currently with Clifton and
23 Morenci, Greenlee County.

24 This is the first one I know about in our area.
25 So we didn't get represented properly.

1 Some of the hearings that have gone on before our
2 hearing have been loaded with people who have particular
3 agendas.

4 And I assume that each meeting you have has
5 essentially the same thing.

6 We're fighting as rural Arizona, as rural
7 counties, Graham County, for our livelihood.

8 Some have said water is important. When I lived
9 in Maricopa County, water was what we did to the ground to
10 make our grass grow.

11 It's the thing that we went down to the local park
12 and fished so our kids could fish.

13 But water to rural counties is our livelihood.
14 Without that water, we don't survive.

15 The compacts that have been placed on rural
16 counties, particularly Graham County and Greenlee County in
17 the past few years, farmers now are limited to a specific
18 acre feet of water.

19 Some farmers can hardly grow crops with that, and
20 understand that there's a desire to still take more water
21 from the watersheds that Bill Randall expressed.

22 Representation is an important issue also.

23 I can remember historically, because I'm a little
24 older than some of you, that in this county, Graham County,
25 Greenlee County, historically in the past some of the best

1 and the largest and the best legislators from the state came
2 from.

3 We currently have in LD 5 three legislators that
4 the people have elected. And those three legislatures have
5 well represented our interests, Senator Sylvia Allen,
6 currently senate pro tem, Representative Brenda Barton sits
7 on very important committees pertinent to our area,
8 Representative Chester Crandell who likewise sits on very
9 important committees for our area.

10 To do what you're doing with the map, LD map, all
11 of them go away but one.

12 Senator Sylvia Allen goes away. She's no longer
13 with us.

14 Representative Crandell disappears. He goes into
15 another district, goes away.

16 Representative Brenda Barton is now placed, if
17 this map were to occur, which I hope it does not, she would
18 be placed in a district with four other representatives
19 currently sitting in office.

20 And since the district can only have
21 two representatives, that means that two will be eliminated.

22 Probably what would happen is that because our
23 representative Brenda Barton is the youngest of all of them,
24 she would probably be eliminated.

25 So now we have from Graham County, Greenlee County

1 absolutely zero representation.

2 As has been expressed very well already, when you
3 put rural counties in with Pinal, Pima, or Maricopa County,
4 or just touch the counties to get the population there, all
5 of a sudden the 40,000 that we're talking about here are
6 left completely without representation.

7 I think that probably the most telling story that
8 you've heard tonight is the Representative Kolbe said to one
9 of the constituents here, that's atrocious.

10 But that is what will happen if this map is
11 allowed to go forward.

12 You know that, and we all know that. That's why
13 we're here.

14 We're fighting for our lives here, for our good.
15 And we please request of you that you take that into
16 consideration.

17 Forget the political things.

18 Use all six or seven of the criteria the DOJ has
19 placed on you, not one. Don't take one of them, which it
20 seems the least apparently in the last two or three weeks
21 has occurred.

22 This one of competitive districts is negating the
23 effect of all of the other five or six that you're supposed
24 to be using. The Arizona Supreme Court says you're supposed
25 to using.

1 And it appears that you have not.

2 That's not acceptable.

3 And I think that the legislature and
4 Governor Brewer is understanding that now, and that's
5 probably why some of the fire is being placed in your laps
6 by the political side of our country.

7 Thank you very much.

8 (Applause.)

9 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Susan Breen, representing
10 self, from Clifton.

11 SUSAN BREEN: Good evening, commissioners. And
12 thank you so much for coming to this part of the state.

13 We were really concerned at the first round that
14 you weren't coming out here to eastern Arizona, and now
15 you're here, and I'm also very glad that Greenlee County was
16 able to participate.

17 I want to thank you for your incredibly hard work
18 that's all volunteer and that's been very increasingly
19 difficult.

20 And people are quick to criticize, but I think one
21 thing they don't understand is that you have to keep your
22 congressional districts and your legislative districts
23 relatively equal in population. That's very difficult to do
24 when we have declining rural population.

25 And I for one am very glad and appreciate very,

1 very much the way you've worked so hard to keep CD 1 out of
2 Maricopa County, and to create two rural districts.

3 I favor the congressional map, and I oppose the
4 blatant partisan politics involved in trying to impeach one
5 or more of the commissioners.

6 The CDs right now as they're proposed have
7 two predominantly Democratic districts, four Republican, and
8 three competitive, meaning they could go either way.

9 I fail to understand how that favors Democrats.

10 Governor Brewer's complaints that the new ninth CD
11 is too competitive?

12 I thought competition was the foundation of our
13 way of life and our free enterprise system.

14 And so why are Republicans opposed to competition
15 when it relates to our democratic form of government?

16 Could it be they're afraid that if a district is
17 competitive it might affect their -- the balance of power
18 that they've had in the state since 1966, the legislative
19 districts.

20 As far as the legislative districts, thank you for
21 keeping Greenlee as a whole and not splitting us up.

22 Several of the draft maps did have us split in two.

23 Again, though, I feel that in the interest of
24 creating competitive districts and community of interest
25 that Greenlee would be better served being part of the whole

1 of Graham and the whole of Cochise Counties, than where we
2 are now.

3 But I really appreciate your hard work, and thank
4 you so much for coming here, and hearing what we have to say
5 tonight.

6 Thank you.

7 (Applause.)

8 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Jenna Mason, representing
9 self, from Graham County.

10 JENNA MASON: I would like to thank you for coming
11 once again.

12 It is a hard thing to take everything into
13 consideration.

14 I wanted to address the legislative map first.

15 I am from Graham County, so that's what I'm going
16 to specify on and to expound upon.

17 But I am going to talk about the others as well,
18 because my belief is that we need to unify ourselves, and I
19 believe that with some of the mapping that's going on,
20 especially taking the whole of the Navajo and the Apache, I
21 think it's segregating us, and I do differ in some of what
22 people have said about. Our interest with the Navajos is
23 our land and the Apache is with our land.

24 As the previous map has stated, that we still have
25 that mining in Globe, and we have that in common with the

1 Indian nations.

2 We have mining in Morenci as well.

3 And our unemployment is above the national
4 average. It is 12 percent.

5 And we need to keep that in mind that we need to
6 have our jobs available to us, our legislation to -- I
7 didn't know I was going to get like this, but we don't need
8 to have our mine taken from us, from Graham County. And our
9 watershed with Greenlee County, we share that. We have a
10 wonderful relationship with them.

11 We are essentially cut in half and then put with
12 Cochise County and with Tucson as well, and it's metro.
13 They don't share the same interest as us.

14 They have two caverns, two caves. They have the
15 whole, like, Air Force museum. It's a very, very different
16 way of life.

17 They're metropolitan. We are rural.

18 My whole theme is unity.

19 We need to keep our rural communities rural, and
20 our metro metro. With that we can have blue collar workers
21 and white collar workers working in harmony. We grow the
22 cotton. We send it to our cities, who then make it into
23 something we can wear.

24 And, and I think that we need to keep that in
25 mind.

1 We need to be able to be represented fairly.

2 That being said, I wanted to address the
3 congressional map.

4 I have been to Utah and back and all the way
5 around. And like I said, the Navajo and Apache, the
6 southern part of their nation and the northern part are very
7 different.

8 The southern half is more of a mid desert range,
9 and the northern half is more arid and dry.

10 So as far as community interest goes, in their own
11 regions they're not -- they don't have the same needs
12 agricultural-wise as -- you know, they're topical.

13 So, in closing, please reconsidering this, these
14 two maps with the previous one that was accepted before, and
15 let our voices be heard and not quashed out by
16 five different metropolitan areas ranging from Flagstaff to
17 Sierra Vista to Tucson. Thank you.

18 (Applause.)

19 JENNA MASON: It's Jenna, J-E-N-N-A, Mason,
20 M-A-S-O-N.

21 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Fred Kessler, representing
22 self.

23 If you could let us know where you're from.

24 FRED KESSLER: I feel a little out of place,
25 because I have so much less information to give.

1 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: If you could spell your name
2 and tell --

3 FRED KESSLER: Fred Kessler, K-E-S-S-L-E-R. From
4 Pima.

5 The first 69 years of my life I lived in Cleveland
6 and the Phoenix area, so I've been a metro boy all my life.
7 And when my wife indicated she wanted to move to the
8 Thatcher area, I gulped and thought, well, we weren't
9 married yet when we said that, but she said that, and I
10 thought I think it's worth it to me to get her.

11 And as soon as we found a place in Pima, and I
12 looked out at Mount Graham from our backyard, I felt at
13 home.

14 So even though I've been a big city boy, I'm now a
15 rural boy, retired, a teacher.

16 And I agree with about everything that has been
17 said tonight. And I've learned a lot. And, again, I'd like
18 to add my thanks to you giving us this tonight to complain
19 about what redistricting people that I've come up with so
20 far.

21 We feel it deeply.

22 I don't want to have to go back to a big city now,
23 and this redistricting process seems to be encouraging that
24 kind of thinking.

25 I appreciate especially Senator Allen and

1 Representatives Martin and Crandell for all they've done to
2 represent us. And I don't want to lose that representation.

3 (Applause.)

4 FRED KESSLER: From what I've seen of the maps, it
5 appears that the rural Arizona ADHOC eastern rural
6 congressional district map, that's basically two halves to
7 it, seems to be workable.

8 None of the others that I've seen seem at all
9 workable, because there's too much of Tucson in Graham
10 County.

11 Thank you.

12 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you, sir.

13 (Applause.)

14 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: David Morse, representing
15 self.

16 DAVID MORSE: David Morse, M-O-R-S-E.

17 For the past ten years Graham County has been
18 voting together with Greenlee County, Apache County, and
19 Navajo County.

20 We've developed long and meaningful relationships
21 with people and the businesses of those areas.

22 The proposed map would tear Graham County in
23 two places, placing the majority of the population into a
24 district with whom we have little to no interaction, who
25 developed no relationships, and basically have no vote in

1 the affairs of the new Legislative District 1.

2 Graham County has only one sixth of one percent of
3 the state's population to begin with, and you would take
4 that and cut it in half.

5 Under this new map Graham County would become
6 insignificant and lose our voice at the state capital.

7 To illustrate, let me point out that the recent
8 Wallow fire that affected Apache County, the Wallow fire
9 affected Navajo County, the fire affected Greenlee County,
10 and the fire affected Graham County.

11 Ash from the Wallow fire still flows in the Gila
12 County -- Gila River here in this county.

13 The Wallow fire did not affect anyone living south
14 of Interstate 10.

15 The people of Cochise County and Gila County are
16 neighbors. We have nothing against them. But they're not
17 part of our community.

18 Thank you.

19 (Applause.)

20 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

21 Sharon Watson, representing self, from Graham
22 County.

23 SHARON WATSON: My name is Sharon Watson,
24 S-H-A-R-O-N, W-A-T-S-O-N.

25 I came out here because I don't feel that the

1 communities of interest have been met in the maps that you
2 are proposing.

3 And I also agree with most everything that
4 everyone has said this evening, and I won't reiterate that
5 because it will take forever. But some very good points
6 were brought out, and I appreciate everyone voicing their
7 opinion.

8 I would like to be counted as opposing the LD and
9 the CD map that you've cut as a draft right now.

10 I've in favor of the LD 5 map that has already
11 been submitted. I believe that's the name of it.

12 And I feel strongly that my voice and all of the
13 voices in rural Arizona will be silenced with the draft maps
14 that are being proposed right now.

15 And I want to thank you for your long hours of
16 work, and that's all I have. Thank you.

17 (Applause.)

18 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Dan Haralson, representing
19 self, from Safford.

20 DAN HARALSON: I'm Dan Haralson, H-A-R-A-L-S-O-N.

21 I'm actually fourth generation here in the valley.
22 Maybe some of the early ones should have been run out, but
23 they stayed fortunately for me.

24 I love this area.

25 After my education I returned here specifically

1 because I do love it so much.

2 I want to thank you for the difficult but
3 hopefully fruitful works. But having said that, the
4 legislative district should include Greenlee County. It was
5 part of Graham County until 1909, and has long been our
6 beloved sister county.

7 And also the reservation, the San Carlos
8 reservation has long been a part of our shopping and
9 commercial outreach.

10 These areas are closely tied to us in so many
11 ways.

12 I want to impress upon you to please keep our
13 rural representation alive and give us a chance to elect
14 people that understand our issues.

15 Keep politics out of it. I know you have tried to
16 do this, and it is appreciated.

17 I think everyone here, certainly ones that have
18 spoke earlier, find faults with either the congressional or
19 legislative lines that have been drawn.

20 But after all the suggestions are heard, the
21 decisions are yours.

22 And I do understand the tough job that has been
23 for you to make these decisions.

24 Many thanks, and please stay independent.

25 Thank you very much.

1 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

2 (Applause.)

3 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Jesse Bryant, from Globe.

4 JESSE BRYANT: Good evening. My name is Jesse
5 Bryant. Last name B-R-Y-A-N-T.

6 I last had the pleasure of being before you when
7 you came to visit us in Globe. Since then city councilman
8 Lerry Alderman has been doing his best to attend all these
9 meetings and speak to you and keep rural Arizona in front of
10 your eyes and noses.

11 And when last I spoke to you, I had the honor of
12 telling you that nine rural communities across eastern
13 Arizona had approved resolutions supporting the maps that
14 keep rural Arizona together.

15 Tonight I have the greater privilege of telling
16 you that 14 rural Arizona communities across eastern
17 Arizona --

18 (Applause.)

19 JESSE BRYANT: -- have passed resolutions
20 supporting legislative and congressional maps that keep us
21 together, keep our representations rural.

22 And I am going to tell you over the next week
23 you're going to have even more cities and towns across
24 eastern Arizona approving those resolutions.

25 (Applause.)

1 JESSE BRYANT: Mr. Freeman, who asked me, as I
2 displayed this very rough map to you, if I had constructed a
3 map on the IRC website.

4 Well, I took your advice, and I spent about
5 20 hours last weekend, and I reconstructed it on the IRC
6 website. And the cities and towns are submitting -- the
7 ones that passed have submitted this, so this co-relates
8 that for your record.

9 You have the LD map already on your record. I
10 believe you call it option one 8A, I believe is what it's
11 called.

12 That is the map that's continued to be supported.

13 We strongly encourage you to hear the voice of
14 rural Arizona.

15 As you heard here tonight, our cultures, our
16 economies, our livelihoods, our very existence depends upon
17 us keeping a rural representation, that is from among us,
18 that understands what it is to be one of us, and can fight
19 our battles when we have to confront state and federal
20 agencies, especially over the natural resource developments.

21 The tribes are our neighbors. The Hopi and Navajo
22 are in a congressional district. The Hopi will be in our
23 next congressional district, and the Apaches are part of our
24 legislative district. And they are neighbors, we do many
25 things with them.

1 Especially in Globe, the San Carlos Apache.
2 They shop in our stores, and we go out to their lakes, and
3 we share the chamber of commerce events. And I am sure
4 likewise up north the White Mountain Apaches in Show Low.

5 Please hear our voice. Please do not ignore that
6 voice.

7 I know there are five of you. As Mr. Stertz said,
8 you're going to lock yourselves in a room and not come out
9 until there's blood on the windows. After the blood has
10 cleared away, I hope rural Arizona will survive your
11 deliberations.

12 Thank you very much, and I look forward to telling
13 you when there are more communities on board with this.

14 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

15 (Applause.)

16 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: I feel your pain as well.

17 Next is Dr. Suzanne Menges.

18 If you could tell us who you're representing and
19 where you're from.

20 SUZANNE MENGES: I'm Suzanne Menges, M-E-N-G-E-S.

21 I'm just a private citizen representing myself.

22 And I don't know if I'm from Graham or Greenlee
23 County.

24 Let me tell you why.

25 We run a cow-calf operation, a cattle ranching

1 operation on the Gila River and in Greenlee County and in
2 Bonita Creek in Graham County.

3 I'm highly involved in both counties. I've been a
4 school administrator in both. I'm a member of the Duncan
5 Valley Electric Co-op board in Greenlee, Gila Watershed
6 Partnership in Graham.

7 I don't know which county I'm in half the time.
8 And that's okay.

9 Because the county lines in this area are very,
10 very faint.

11 I'm a graduate of NAU and U of A, and I'll tell
12 you there's nothing more important to rural, the rural
13 population than us continuing to be rural and to be
14 represented by those that understand rural issues.

15 Don't get me wrong. We love our urban friends,
16 and we have appreciate what they bring to our state as well.
17 We love sharing and teaching about rural issues.

18 We enjoy teaching them that you can't fire a
19 cattle guard.

20 (Applause.)

21 SUZANNE MENGES: We teach them about what a back
22 country byway is. What it takes to farm and ranch in rural
23 Arizona today.

24 Farmers and ranchers provide the fuel and the
25 fiber of this state and this country, and our issues are so

1 incredibly different from that of our urban counterparts.

2 Just manage, if someone from Graham or Greenlee
3 County went into Phoenix and started making decisions for
4 them about where to build a school, how to divide their
5 neighborhoods and their subdivisions. It's ludicrous. We
6 wouldn't know the issues.

7 But yet there doesn't seem to be an outcry, except
8 what you've heard here today, about our urban counterparts
9 making big decisions for our water, for our public lands.
10 And it's a big concern for us.

11 I would urge you to reconsider the Eastern Arizona
12 Counties EECO map that maintains our rural integrity and our
13 rural issues. And that we keep Arizona -- rural Arizona
14 rural.

15 I appreciate this opportunity. What we're
16 experiencing tonight is what makes America great. We can
17 come and express our opinions. And I'm very proud to be
18 part of rural Arizona.

19 Thank you.

20 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

21 (Applause.)

22 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Mitchell Beals, representing
23 self.

24 MITCHELL BEALS: Beals, B-E-A-L-S.

25 I'm fifth generation Beals here in the

1 Gila Valley.

2 I have eight grandchildren. They will be the
3 seventh generation here in the Gila Valley.

4 My great-great-grandfather assisted in founding
5 Pima, Arizona. He also assisted in digging the canals to
6 see that we had the water to the farm ground.

7 I'm living on the farm that my great-grandfather
8 cleared from the desert floor.

9 I have a neighbor. He moved from Queen Creek, he
10 and his beautiful family.

11 His wife said, I knew we needed to get out of
12 Queen Creek when one of our friends commented when I said
13 that's a cotton gin over here. Cotton gin? I don't see any
14 that sheep around here.

15 And, again, there is a difference between rural
16 and metropolitan, very much so.

17 When I looked at the maps, the thought that came
18 to mind was all roads lead to Rome.

19 But this is not the Roman Empire. This is the
20 American republic.

21 The Pledge of Allegiance that was said this
22 evening is a -- dedicated to a united people.

23 But the reason they're united is because we have
24 the freedom to be different from one another without being
25 overwhelmed.

1 In fact, the United States of America would not
2 even be the United States of America had there not been some
3 compromises between the more populous states and the rural
4 states. They would have refused to unite.

5 And the reason the rural states were concerned is
6 because they didn't want to be swallowed up by the more
7 populous and more powerful states and lose their voice, like
8 I'm losing mine.

9 What I would beg of you to do is to make your
10 decisions based on correct principles.

11 (Applause.)

12 MITCHELL BEALS: Use those founding principles as
13 a guiding light.

14 Those are the principles that got us here.

15 Thank you.

16 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

17 (Applause.)

18 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Next is Pat Fleming,
19 representing self, from Cochise County.

20 PAT FLEMING: Thank you, Mr. Vice Chairman,
21 commissioners who are watching from afar, members of the
22 staff here, thank you so much for allowing me the chance to
23 speak.

24 My name is Pat Fleming, F-L-E-M-I-N-G.

25 I live in Cochise County, which is another rural

1 county in southern Arizona, southern, southeastern Arizona
2 as a matter of fact.

3 Cochise County was also affected greatly by fires
4 this summer, so we understand what -- how people are feeling
5 with the fires they suffered during the summer on the
6 eastern side.

7 I'm here as an advocate for good government, for
8 true legislative representation, and my particular community
9 in Cochise County.

10 I must tell you this evening's been a real
11 education hearing from the members of this community. Their
12 comments are very well thought out and very informative.

13 But I'm also here to express my support for the
14 process that was presented at the beginning of the meeting,
15 where it was described how the voters of Arizona in
16 November of 2000 voted to create Proposition 106, which
17 created the Commission on which you're now serving.

18 Four of your commissioners were appointed by
19 legislative leadership.

20 That is, two from the majority party and two from
21 the minority party.

22 Collectively you commissioners selected the
23 Independent chair.

24 That was evidence of your ability to come together
25 in bipartisanship. The efforts that set a great example for

1 the rest of our citizens in which we certainly are in
2 desperate need of throughout our state.

3 Your efforts to draw new congressional and state
4 legislative districts have been constantly under attack.
5 However, for the citizens who do so, there are at least that
6 many more maybe who appreciate the effort that you have
7 completed as citizen volunteers.

8 And this is not to say that I agree with all the
9 distribution of the legislative districts, frankly.

10 There are way too few truly competitive districts
11 in the current map.

12 For example, a major concern to myself and to many
13 is that of a particular minority-majority district, that is
14 Legislative District 2, that's been packed and creates a
15 26-point advantage for the Democrats.

16 This clearly violates the Voting Rights Act.

17 I prefer to see some of the Democratic leaning
18 precincts in the border communities of our Cochise County
19 that are now in LD 2 moved back in to make Cochise County an
20 entire county within a legislative district.

21 The current LD 1 is certainly not competitive.
22 However, making all of Cochise County into a single
23 legislative district will certainly allow for representation
24 of the communities of interest there in that county.

25 I thank you for being citizen volunteers, thank

1 you for your attention, and thank you for considering all
2 the comments this evening.

3 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

4 (Applause.)

5 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Larry Nielsen, representing
6 self, from Graham County.

7 LARRY NIELSEN: I appreciate the opportunity to
8 come here and speak to you today, to give you my true
9 opinion of things.

10 I am not from this area originally. I'm from
11 Southern California out by Death Valley.

12 And I, I -- from where I'm from, water is the main
13 issue.

14 And I see from this meeting here today this was
15 one of the primary concerns of this group. To be able to --
16 the concern of water for this area and how it's used.

17 To me, it was a major point of my life to have
18 water. It meant everything to us.

19 I lived in a very rural community with three
20 chemical factories in the town.

21 They depended on water there. We had to have it,
22 to make our citizens work.

23 This here, this meeting today was the meeting of
24 the people stating what they truly believe.

25 It's a meeting of the people being concerned and

1 going about things the right way to demonstrate their belief
2 in the American way and the justice of life and what this
3 great country provides to us.

4 I am very proud to be an American. That's a major
5 part of my life, and I am proud of it.

6 And I'll demonstrate it everywhere, anyway.

7 Thank you for letting me say my piece this
8 evening.

9 N-I-E-L-S-E-N. Larry.

10 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Next we'll go to Clifton.
11 David McCullar.

12 MAYOR DAVID MCCULLAR: Good evening. My name is
13 David McCullar, M-C-C-U-L-L-A-R.

14 I happen to be the mayor of Clifton. I am not
15 here to speak for the town or the town council. I'm here to
16 speak for myself.

17 I'm here to commend this Commission for the job
18 that they've done.

19 I've been hearing all the commentaries that's been
20 going on, and I have a very hard problem in defining how
21 either one of these districts could have been put together
22 without going into a city or a town, a metropolitan area.
23 Because if this -- if we were truly rural, we would comprise
24 99 percent of this state. We would -- this -- either number
25 one or the congressional or the legislature would go all the

1 way around the state of Arizona and not touch any, any
2 population center, because, I mean, I just can't see where
3 the Commission could have gotten the numbers if they didn't
4 go into cities and towns, and -- I mean, so, I -- that's
5 about all I can say.

6 I want to thank you for the job you've done, and
7 especially under quite bad circumstances.

8 But, that's, that's about all.

9 Thank you.

10 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you.

11 (Applause.)

12 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Is there anyone else in
13 Clifton who would like to speak?

14 (No oral response.)

15 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: I'll take that as a no.

16 Is there anyone here that would like to address
17 the Commission? That was my last request to speak form.

18 (No oral response.)

19 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Sure there isn't anyone?

20 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yes, Commissioner Freeman, we
21 have another individual. We'll actually have him state his
22 name, if that's okay.

23 MAYOR M.C. HOLIDAY: My name is M.C. Holiday. I'm
24 the mayor of Duncan, although I do not represent the town.

25 But everything that you heard tonight from the --

1 from our people that were speaking here, believe it. It's
2 all true. And we really, we really need to keep it like it
3 was.

4 Thank you very much.

5 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thank you very much.

6 (Applause.)

7 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Anyone else in Clifton?

8 (No oral response.)

9 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Okay. Anyone else here in
10 Thatcher?

11 JEANNE BOURIAQUE: I'd like to speak. I gave my
12 paper to somebody else.

13 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Come on up.

14 And did you say you completed a request to speak
15 form?

16 JEANNE BOURIAQUE: I gave it to somebody else
17 because they wanted to speak.

18 But I would like to. My name is Jeanne Bouriaque,
19 and it's spelled B-O-U-R-I-A-Q-U-E. And it's not pronounced
20 anything like that.

21 But I would like to thank you for coming.

22 I would like you to take very, very seriously
23 everything that you've heard tonight. And I feel very, very
24 prompted by God to speak to you and say to you that he is in
25 full control and that you are volunteers, as you are, are

1 responsible before God for the decisions that you make.

2 And not to be, not to be biased or guided by
3 anything other than what is right and just and good for this
4 community.

5 I thank you for that.

6 THE REPORTER: Spell your first name.

7 JEANNE BOURIAQUE: Jeanne, J-E-A-N-N-E.

8 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Is there anyone else?

9 (No oral response.)

10 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Okay. Well, usually this is
11 the part of the program where we turn the microphone to the
12 other commissioners who were in attendance, but since it's
13 just me tonight, I get it.

14 You know, one of the great privileges of serving
15 on this Commission is coming out to places like Thatcher and
16 Safford, that that was one of the perks for me.

17 It's a great drive coming up here. I really
18 enjoyed getting on those roads that I hadn't been on in
19 quite a few years.

20 I'm not going to sit up here and pretend to tell
21 you that I fully understand the rural issues.

22 I was born in Phoenix. I've lived most of my life
23 in Phoenix. I lived a few years in Tucson, going to school
24 down there.

25 But, I've got family roots that are in the rural

1 Arizona. My grandparents moved just after statehood to
2 Bisbee, where my father was born. I've spent a lot of time
3 in Cochise County.

4 And growing up, and even today, I spend a lot of
5 time in eastern Arizona. I'm one of those urban people who
6 likes to come up and hunt and fish and do it all.

7 And so a lot of what I hear certainly resonates
8 with me.

9 And shortly after being appointed to the
10 Commission and after we had a few Commission meetings, one
11 of the agenda items was a request for speaker from the
12 Arizona Farm Bureau.

13 And I volunteered to do that. They were having
14 their annual meeting in Phoenix, and I went to speak to
15 them. I gave them the redistricting 101 speech. And they
16 had a few questions, but really the main concern they had
17 was constructing rural districts and keeping them rural.

18 And the Commission has heard that again and again
19 and again ever since then.

20 And certainly I believe that rural is a community
21 of interest.

22 I believe there are other commissioners that
23 believe that as well. And the Constitution says to the
24 extent practicable communities of interest must be
25 respected.

1 And that's something I'm trying to do.

2 (Applause.)

3 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: I want to thank everyone for
4 coming out and everyone for sticking around to listen to me
5 at the end.

6 It's really a great turnout. Appreciate the
7 input.

8 What the Commission is still going on with second
9 round of public comment hearings. Tomorrow the Commission
10 is in Nogales, and then Saturday is in Yuma, and next week I
11 can't think of far ahead, but we've got hearings set, I
12 think, Tuesday through Saturday of next week.

13 And then after the public comment period
14 concludes, the Commission reconvenes, conducts business
15 meetings, and makes adjustments to the draft maps to produce
16 a final map that we've voted on.

17 I think it is incumbent upon the Commission, every
18 commissioner, to take into account all the public comment
19 that has been heard, take that, evaluate it, apply the
20 six constitutional criteria, and make the appropriate
21 adjustments.

22 And developing the -- in voting on the draft maps,
23 a number of commissioners noted that it was a -- they were
24 drafts, and there would be changes. And I think changes are
25 appropriate.

1 So that's what's coming next.

2 (Applause.)

3 VICE-CHAIR FREEMAN: Thanks for coming out. And
4 at 6:53 p.m., I declare this meeting adjourned -- 7:53.

5 (Whereupon, the meeting adjourned.)

6

7

8

* * * * *

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 STATE OF ARIZONA)
)
2 COUNTY OF MARICOPA) ss.

3

4 BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceeding was
5 taken before me, Marty Herder, a Certified Court Reporter,
6 CCR No. 50162, State of Arizona; that the foregoing 74 pages
7 constitute a true and accurate transcript of all proceedings
8 had upon the taking of said meeting, all done to the best of
9 my skill and ability.

10 DATED at Chandler, Arizona, this 4th day of
11 November, 2011.

12

13

14

C. Martin Herder, CCR
Certified Court Reporter
Certificate No. 50162

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25