

THE STATE OF ARIZONA
INDEPENDENT REDISTRICTING COMMISSION

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF VIRTUAL TOWN HALL

Online via WebEx

November 19, 2021

12:00 p.m.

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
PO Box 513, Litchfield Park, AZ 85340
(P) 623-975-7472 (F) 623-975-7462
www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

Reported By (via WebEx):
Angela Furniss Miller, RPR
Certified Reporter (AZ 50127)

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

1 VIRTUAL TOWN HALL, BEFORE THE INDEPENDENT
2 REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, convened at 12:00 p.m. on
3 November 19, 2021, online via WebEx.

4
5 COMMISSIONER PRESENT:

6 Ms. Erika Neuberg, Chairperson
7 Mr. Derrick Watchman, Vice Chairman
8 Mr. David Mehl

9 STAFF PRESENT:

10 Mr. Brian Schmitt, Executive Director
11 Ms. Loriandra Van Haren, Deputy Director
12 Ms. Valerie Neumann, Executive Assistant
13 Mr. Alex Pena, Public Outreach Coordinator
14 Mr. Eric Spencer, Snell & Wilmer
15 Mr. Mark Flahan, Timmons Group

16 PUBLIC COMMENT SPEAKERS:

17 SPEAKER NAME:

18 William Bowlus-Root
19 Patti Van Tuyl
20 Paul Deasy
21 Allan Gerston
22 Linda Guarino
23 Laura Huenneke
24 Charlene Nez
25 Dieter Knecht
Mary Ellen Metzger
Phyllis Schiller
Aubrey Sonderegger
Fred Hamilton
Deborah Jean Dyjack
Austin Aslan
Sharon Edgar
Dawn Schackner
Cora Phillips
Rennae Ward
Kristie Blackman

* American Sign language interpreters and a Spanish interpreter are also present.

P R O C E E D I N G

1
2
3 MS. VAN HAREN: Okay. Welcome, everybody. We are
4 starting the virtual town hall.

5 We are going to first introduce our interpreter and
6 then kind of explain, we have a little bit of a different
7 setup right now. In the chat function I have put the
8 first -- all of the names of everybody who is signed up to
9 speak and then also we have the phone number for anybody who
10 needs to call in.

11 So I'll turn it over to our interpreter to explain
12 everything.

13 THE INTERPRETER: (Spanish language.)

14 Hello, this is Gabriel Contreras. I am the Spanish
15 interpreter.

16 MS. VAN HAREN: Perfect. In the chat function,
17 Gabriel, can you explain that there's a phone number that
18 they can call with a PIN and they can call in if they want
19 to hear everything in Spanish.

20 THE INTERPRETER: (Spanish language.)

21 MS. VAN HAREN: Perfect. Thank you.

22 THE INTERPRETER: Thank you.

23 MS. VAN HAREN: At this point we'll send it over to
24 Commissioner Mehl to start the meeting.

25 COMMISSIONER MEHL: I'd like to welcome everyone

1 who is here to speak with us today. I now call to order the
2 virtual town hall. We do have a transcriptionist who will
3 be recording every word, so please speak slowly and clearly
4 so that we will have a clear record of your input.

5 At this time we will introduce ourselves. I am
6 Commissioner David Mehl and I'm from Pima County.

7 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Hello, everyone. I am
8 Chairwoman Erika Neuberg and I live in Chandler, Maricopa
9 County.

10 COMMISSIONER MEHL: And we have had many public
11 meetings this week and we look forward to hearing additional
12 input today.

13 So now we move on to Agenda Item II, public
14 comments.

15 Staff will describe the format of the meeting and
16 read the rules. Thank you.

17 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you, Commissioner Mehl.

18 So we are going to take -- everybody who registered
19 is going to be able to speak today and we will give everyone
20 two minutes to speak.

21 If you are not signed in under the name that you
22 registered as, I would recommend that you log out and
23 re-sign in under the name that you registered because we
24 will -- may not be able to see you. If you can't do that,
25 go ahead and enter your chat message in the chat box and we

1 should be able to circle back and -- and see you in there
2 and we'll be able to call you.

3 If you're having any audio issues, I would
4 recommend doing the same thing in the chat box. We can
5 absolutely see you and -- and make sure that we call you.

6 And once you are finished, we will go ahead and
7 mute you.

8 In compliance with Arizona's open meeting laws,
9 speakers should confine their statements to the issue on the
10 posted agenda which is before the Commission. Speakers are
11 also requested to limit their comments to approximately two
12 minutes. The two minutes will be strictly enforced for all
13 speakers.

14 Additionally speakers are required to follow proper
15 decorum. Speakers must use appropriate language. Foul
16 and/or abusive language will not be tolerated. Any speaker
17 failing to follow -- I'm sorry.

18 Any speaker failing to follow proper decorum or any
19 other guidelines may be asked to leave. Any breach of the
20 peace or disruption of the Commission public hearing may be
21 caused for report to law enforcement.

22 If somebody has expressed the same sentiment you
23 wish to express, you may say so and your comments will be
24 recorded. If you have already spoken at previous meetings,
25 your comments were recorded in the public record.

1 Opposing viewpoints may be expressed by the
2 citizens present. As a courtesy, citizens are reminded to
3 address their comments to the Chair and to the Commission
4 and not to the audience present.

5 Please show respect for all speakers and avoid
6 personal comments. Remember, the Commission must hear all
7 sides of an issue to make an informed decision.

8 We will now begin public comment and I'm going to
9 read the first names of the first speaker; and, again, we
10 put them in the chat box there.

11 So the first speaker, William Bowlus-Root.

12 SPEAKER ROOT: Hi, Commissioners. Can you hear me
13 today?

14 MS. VAN HAREN: We can hear you. Please proceed.

15 SPEAKER ROOT: Okay. My name is William
16 Bowlus-Root, that's B-O-W-L-U-S dash R-O-O-T.

17 And I'm a retired software engineer in Yuma,
18 Arizona 85365, which is currently in CD-4 and LD-13 and
19 would be in the proposed CD-7 and LD-23.

20 I've heard people talking of changing the
21 congressional and legislative draft maps to create districts
22 that encompass the entire Colorado River from the top of the
23 state to the bottom, I don't think that's a really good
24 idea.

25 While it might seem appealing to make a Colorado

1 district like that so our representative can focus on the
2 needs of the entire region, especially the important issue
3 surrounding access to water so they can develop
4 comprehensive policy and programs, I think there's a better
5 way to do that. The needs of northern and southern areas
6 are of such -- those districts are actually very different.
7 The north has a strong tourism industry while the south is
8 primarily agriculture.

9 We also have many issues with the border down here
10 in the south that are not really shared with the north.
11 There's really little connecting the two areas either in
12 commerce or in common interest except the river.

13 My idea is that rather than have one representative
14 working for our mutual benefit in the legislature, it would
15 seem better to have two. If our representatives work
16 together on the issues that face us, we would have double
17 the influence and double the likelihood that we could get
18 the kind of programs that we need.

19 So don't create a single north-to-southwestern
20 Colorado River district, keep it two districts so that we'll
21 have more influence.

22 Thank you for the opportunity to speak.

23 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

24 The next speaker is Patti Van Tuyl.

25 SPEAKER VAN TUYL: Hello, good afternoon. My name

1 is Patti Van Tuyl and I live in the Coconino neighborhood of
2 Flagstaff. We were previously in CD-1, which was one of the
3 most highly competitive districts in the state. We are now
4 in the proposed Congressional District 2, which I believe
5 has been defined without sufficient regard to the criteria
6 for drawing the district lines.

7 Commission's own data show that CD-2 is no longer
8 competitive, which means elected officials could easily
9 ignore the voices of those who do not vote for the winning
10 candidates. I believe competition fosters good government
11 and discourages extremism.

12 CD-2 is no longer compact as it sprawls across the
13 whole of Yavapai County without regard to the geographic
14 barrier presented by Mingus Mountain. Why should Yavapai be
15 kept whole while other counties are not? Areas west of
16 Mingus Mountain do not share the interests such as
17 geography, economy, workforce, healthcare systems, of the
18 community east of the Mingus -- east of the mountain.

19 Most serious of all, CD-2 dilutes the ability of
20 tribal communities in the north and east to elect a
21 candidate of their choice. In this, it runs afoul of the
22 requirements to comply with the Voting Rights Act. All of
23 the other redistricting criteria are to be met to the degree
24 practicable; this criterion is not. Simply put, districts
25 shall comply with the United States Constitution and the

1 United States Voting Rights Act, period.

2 The proposed revisions submitted by the
3 Navajo Nation offers a corrective to each of these issues.
4 I would ask you to please consider this map for your
5 deliberations.

6 I thank each of you for taking on this important
7 and challenging task and for listening.

8 Thank you.

9 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

10 The next speaker is Mayor Paul Deasy. Mayor Deasy,
11 can you hear us?

12 SPEAKER DEASY: Sorry about that. Having issues
13 with the mute button here.

14 Can you hear me?

15 MS. VAN HAREN: Yep, we can hear you. Go ahead.

16 SPEAKER DEASY: Thank you. I just -- I appreciate
17 the opportunity to speak again; and not to belabor, but I
18 wanted to reiterate that the Flagstaff City Council
19 unanimously is in support of the Coconino County's maps 505
20 for the legislative district as well as the congressional
21 district. It is really important that we have competitive
22 districts, not just for Flagstaff but in the surrounding
23 community within the Coconino County.

24 In addition, that Flagstaff is very heavily cut off
25 from some of its closest neighbors who shop here, who work

1 in Flagstaff, who face the same natural disasters, who share
2 the same watershed, and we believe that as a community of
3 interest that we are better represented in that manner with
4 the maps presented by Coconino County.

5 So I would just -- yeah, urge you all to please
6 take that into strong consideration as additional edits
7 are -- are made to the redistricting maps.

8 Thank you.

9 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

10 The next three speakers will be Allan Gerston,
11 Linda Guarino and Rennae Ward.

12 Allan, can you hear us?

13 Linda, can you hear us?

14 SPEAKER GERSTON: Oh, I'm sorry.

15 MS. VAN HAREN: Oh, okay, Allan. Go ahead.

16 SPEAKER GERSTON: Okay. Yeah, thanks very much and
17 by the way, you've heard this I'm sure plenty of times but I
18 am pressed -- impressed with the -- the arduous and crazy
19 work that the Commission is doing with all the time and
20 energy that you have to expend for it, so thank you all for
21 that.

22 I just wanted to comment that -- as many of us
23 know, that Arizona's tourism economy is incredibly important
24 up here in the northern part of Arizona and I believe we are
25 second in -- in terms of what is generated in terms of the

1 economy.

2 What troubles me about the map is that Prescott is
3 not part of this economic corridor and it's geographically
4 really quite separated from what we've always known it to be
5 in this area in terms of Flagstaff, Sedona and the
6 Grand Canyon as well as the Verde Valley, really sharing an
7 economic interest.

8 I feel strongly that Prescott should not be
9 included with the same congressional districts as the
10 Grand Canyon corridor in that Prescott is separated from
11 this economic district economically and physically as most
12 of us know to be Mingus Mountain. Prescott should remain as
13 part of the congressional district that also includes the
14 areas of the Colorado River area.

15 And that's just the short and sweet thought that I
16 have.

17 Thank you.

18 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

19 The next speaker is Linda Guarino. Linda, can you
20 hear us?

21 SPEAKER GUARINO: (No audible response.)

22 MS. VAN HAREN: Please proceed.

23 SPEAKER GUARINO: Good morning. My name is Linda
24 Guarino and I live in Doney Park, which is part of the
25 greater Flagstaff area.

1 Arizona already has several what are called safe
2 seats in the current legislative map. One of these is held
3 by Paul Gosar who was just censured and stripped of all
4 committee assignments because he posted a video depicting
5 violence against women and our President. Mr. Gosar's
6 censure is an embarrassment for Arizona and a loss to his
7 constituents because he can no longer effectively represent
8 their interests in Congress. Despite this, he will probably
9 be re-elected in the new CD-2 because it leans so strongly
10 Republican. Safe districts encourage extremists like
11 Mr. Gosar to run for office because candidates only need
12 appeal to their base.

13 I don't want any safe districts in Arizona,
14 Democrat or Republican. I want districts that are highly
15 competitive because this will encourage moderates to run for
16 office; and once elected, they will listen to all of their
17 constituents and represent the interests of all Arizonans
18 and not just their own political party.

19 Moderate candidates will also increase turnout
20 because Arizonans can be assured that their votes truly
21 count.

22 Safe districts, on the other hand, oppress turnout
23 because why bother if their candidate has no chance to be
24 elected.

25 A proposed congressional map submitted by the

1 Navajo Nation is competitive. Likewise the maps for
2 Legislative District 6 and 7 that were submitted by the
3 Coconino County Board of Supervisors leaves each legislative
4 district highly competitive.

5 All three of these maps also honor the other five
6 criteria for independent redistricting. I ask you to please
7 adopt these maps. Thank you for listening to me and thank
8 you for your service, Arizona redistricting.

9 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

10 The next speaker is Charlene Nez followed by Laura
11 Huenneke.

12 Charlene, can you hear us? Charlene?

13 Let's move to Laura and then we'll see if we can
14 get Charlene on the line.

15 Laura, can you hear us?

16 SPEAKER HUENNEKE: Thank you for the opportunity to
17 provide input in your draft maps. I'm Laura Huenneke from
18 just outside Flagstaff. Today I would like to speak to the
19 overall statewide maps you're charged with drawing and go
20 back to this issue of political competitiveness.

21 The Commission was charged in Prop 106 with
22 creating fair and competitive districts. You're to aim for
23 competitiveness where to do so does not cause substantial
24 detriment to the other criteria.

25 The maps we've been using for the past decade show

1 it is possible to have many fairly competitive districts
2 that have passed every legal challenge raised; that is,
3 they've done a good job of meeting all the constitutional
4 criteria. Your current draft maps are not better. In fact,
5 in many respects, they're worse with respect to various
6 criteria and they're terribly noncompetitive overall.

7 Most awful I find is the draft legislative map. Of
8 the 30 districts, 24 are noncompetitive. Using the selected
9 metric of possible swing votes in the set of nine statewide
10 elections, only five of the thirty show anything other than
11 a zero to nine pattern. If your map's adopted, only
12 1.2 million out of the 7.1 million people in Arizona,
13 17 percent, would find themselves in a district with any
14 chance of actual competition. When more than 80 percent of
15 the voters might as well stay home on election day, your
16 maps are not achieving the primary purpose of the IRC.

17 Please direct the mapping team to reexamine ways to
18 increase the proportion of the State's population served by
19 competitive districts and thank you for these opportunities
20 to provide input.

21 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

22 The next speaker is Charlene Nez. Charlene, can
23 you hear us?

24 SPEAKER NEZ: Can you hear me?

25 MS. VAN HAREN: Yes. Please proceed.

1 SPEAKER NEZ: Okay. Okay. Thank you.

2 I am Charlene Nez, a lifetime resident of
3 Tuba City, Arizona, and a member of the Navajo Nation. I am
4 fiercely advocating that the Independent Redistricting
5 Commission support, adopt and approve the recommended draft
6 map submitted by the Navajo Human Rights Commission. This
7 draft provides a competitive and fair congressional election
8 in which my Dené people and other Native American people
9 from the area can fairly participate in, which was provided
10 to all Americans by the Voting Act of 1965.

11 In conclusion, thank you Commissioners for taking
12 the time to volunteer and participate on this very important
13 process that our State must take every ten years.

14 Thank you.

15 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

16 Our next speaker is Dieter Knecht. Dieter, can you
17 hear us?

18 SPEAKER KNECHT: I would like to add my two bits on
19 this competitiveness.

20 Prop 106 which the voters wrote, they passed, they
21 charged your Commission to create fair and competitive
22 districts and then they list six criteria; unfortunately
23 they -- they put competitive at the end, which really is the
24 main one because what -- other speakers have said.

25 If you're not in a competitive district you

1 essentially might as well write it off and you lose all
2 those voters, both from the majority party a lot of them and
3 from the minority party. You create the case where you --
4 you have extreme people coming in like we have seen this
5 last year who all of a sudden our -- our state senators --

6 (Vice Chair Watchman enters.)

7 SPEAKER KNECHT: -- decide they need to challenge
8 and re- -- really get a -- a forensic audit of the election
9 by it turns out people who don't even understand the Arizona
10 election laws. So we have people like that who have come
11 into the legislature because we have this opportunity where
12 there is highly uncompetitive districts, the -- the extreme
13 people can start to come in through the primaries and
14 that -- that's it.

15 So to me that -- this is the most important
16 criteria and I -- I think your mapping team should have used
17 this first. I think maybe they feel happy that they created
18 12 districts that are mainly one party and 11 districts that
19 are the other party and some districts --

20 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

21 The next speaker is Mary Ellen. Mary Ellen, can
22 you hear us?

23 SPEAKER METZGER: I can, thank you.

24 MS. VAN HAREN: Wonderful.

25 SPEAKER METZGER: I'm coming to you as a second

1 generation Native Arizonan. My family came to Arizona --
2 that's okay.

3 My family came to Arizona in 1920 and I was born in
4 Nogales, Arizona, and have spent my entire life here. I've
5 been an advocate for citizenship and citizenry, I've been an
6 educator and I've seen the state go from having statesmen
7 such as Carl Hayden and Barry Goldwater and also John McCain
8 to a questionable anxiety that goes on in our -- in our
9 electorate today.

10 I think what I see is that in the past few years we
11 have actually seen some balance occur in our -- in our state
12 voting, and when I look at the possibility of redistricting
13 and restructuring and flipping everything upside down, I
14 think it might also make sense just to stay where we are, to
15 stay with the present districts that we have.

16 I know it's kind of strange to have a district that
17 goes all the way from Flagstaff to Casa Grande. I've lived
18 in both those places and I understand how people have a
19 struggle with those two differences, but at the same time
20 it's very valuable to have representation that looks at the
21 entire state.

22 We have been able to see balance beginning to
23 happen in our legislature and also at the congressional
24 level, and to try to regenerate new plans I think might lead
25 us to even more extremism that we've seen develop in our

1 country and our state.

2 I've seen people flying flags that use foul
3 language against our president and the people who voted for
4 him. I don't understand that kind of negativism. I
5 understand people having differences of opinion and being,
6 you know, excited about their opinion, but the vitriol we've
7 seen develop has been very heartbreaking.

8 And again as a second generation Native Arizonan, I
9 think this state has so much to offer in terms of
10 intelligence and the respect for our Native populations. I
11 think it's time for us to really make --

12 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

13 Our next speaker is Phyllis Schiller. Phyllis, can
14 you hear us?

15 SPEAKER SCHILLER: Yes, can you hear me?

16 MS. VAN HAREN: Yes, thank you. Please proceed.

17 SPEAKER SCHILLER: Okay. Good afternoon,
18 Commissioners. My name is Phyllis Schiller, and I am a
19 41-year resident of Flagstaff and retired professor from
20 ASU. I have two main issues with the current draft map.
21 CD-2 was a highly competitive district, now with
22 the addition of Prescott and western Mohave County, it is
23 now solidly Republican. It's disenfranchised the many
24 Native American tribes who will not have representation
25 because of the dominant numbers in the Prescott metro area.

1 The second issue is the LD District 6 and 7. It
2 breaks up the greater Flagstaff metro area into two
3 legislative districts, the Verde Valley into three
4 districts, and Sedona into two districts. These new drafts
5 creates communities of interest very unfairly.

6 Recently a major TV network emanating from Phoenix
7 referred to Representative Gosar who just got censured from
8 the House of Representatives as being from Flagstaff. He
9 represents the Prescott and western Arizona area, not
10 Flagstaff; to me this shows the lack of understanding and
11 interest in Northern Arizona from the Maricopa area and
12 relegates the importance of our region to second-, even
13 third-class status.

14 The Flagstaff metro area is the hub of Northern
15 Arizona, it cannot and should not be divided into two
16 districts. I implore the Commission to listen to and hear
17 the concerns of many of us in Northern Arizona. Choose the
18 map submitted by the Coconino County Board of Supervisors,
19 they represent the fair interests of Northern Arizona.

20 They are endorsed unanimously by the city councils
21 of Flagstaff and Sedona for both the congressional and
22 legislative districts. These maps reflect economic and
23 communities of interest in Northern Arizona while giving the
24 Native American population an opportunity to elect
25 candidates of --

1 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

2 The next speaker is Lisa Marshall. Lisa, Can you
3 hear us?

4 Let's move to Aubrey Sonderegger. Aubrey, can you
5 hear us?

6 SPEAKER SONDEREGGER: I can. Can you hear me?

7 MS. VAN HAREN: Yes. Please proceed.

8 SPEAKER SONDEREGGER: Okay. I am speaking today on
9 behalf of a fellow member of Flagstaff, Mr. Daryl Marks
10 (phonetic) today. He is a member of the Navajo Nation and a
11 resident of Flagstaff. He was unable to attend today since
12 he is at work on midday on a Friday. I understand that
13 there are conflicts no matter when a meeting is held, but I
14 do feel that this meeting could have been scheduled at a
15 more accessible time.

16 Daryl wishes to lend his voice as supporting the
17 congressional map submitted by the Navajo Nation Human
18 Rights Commission, CDF010. This map offers a fair and
19 competitive option that does not compromise the Voting
20 Rights Act or any of the other requirements that this
21 Commission is required to adhere to. Our Native peoples
22 deserve the right to represent -- have a chance to represent
23 people that will represent them and reflect their values in
24 our state.

25 And so we are advocating -- Daryl is advocating for

1 the human right -- Navajo Nation Human Rights Commission
2 map.

3 Thank you very much for your time today.

4 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

5 Our next speaker is Fredi. Fredi, can you hear us?

6 SPEAKER HAMILTON: Yes, I can.

7 MS. VAN HAREN: Please proceed.

8 SPEAKER HAMILTON: My name is Fredi Hamilton, I
9 live in the village of Oak Creek.

10 A functioning democracy requires the push and pull
11 of opposing points of view if it is to remain healthy.
12 Proposition 106 was put in place to aid in that by ensuring
13 that we have competitive voting districts. Such districts
14 encourage candidates to debate the issues, hopefully find a
15 middle ground that will attract the most voters to their
16 point of view. That is the glory of our democracy.

17 But your proposed maps of Northern Arizona are
18 weighted to favor only one side of the debates and it is for
19 that reason that I implore you to reconsider the lines you
20 have drawn. Instead, follow the LDF50 and 51 maps so that
21 we might guarantee robust debates and encourage candidates
22 representing all sides of the issues to run for office in
23 our districts; otherwise, we risk cutting the very heart out
24 of our democracy and then we could all find ourselves
25 traveling down some very dangerous paths in this country.

1 The fate of our democracy is in your hands. I
2 thank you.

3 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

4 Our next speaker is Deborah Dyjak. Deborah, can
5 you hear us?

6 SPEAKER DYJAK: (No audible response.)

7 MS. VAN HAREN: Yes, please proceed.

8 SPEAKER DYJAK: Hello, my name is Deborah Jean
9 Dyjack, I live in Maricopa County. So I've never done this
10 before, I apologize because I couldn't get on the meetings
11 here locally so they said I could join this one. Native
12 Arizonan and I'm here today to give you information just
13 about my community of interest.

14 So I actually live near the 101 and Baseline on the
15 west side of Dobson Ranch which is a neighborhood and it's
16 comprised of three different precincts in Legislative
17 District 18. So my community here currently is made up
18 mostly of single-family homes although there is obviously
19 some, you know, apartments and condominiums with very active
20 neighbors, very healthy neighbors; they like to get out and
21 walk and ride bikes and things like that. They mostly know
22 each other and they're very committed to helping each other
23 out. I notice that most people do take their own cars and
24 there's a lot of local businesses close by and those are
25 patronized by my neighbors.

1 So in terms of my community of interest, I know
2 there's talk about changing Legislative District 18. I
3 definitely utilize, like, the Tempe Town Lakes area, the
4 mall, the Tempe mall there along the 202, the Chandler mall
5 along the 101; I usually travel about as far south as like
6 the 202 and maybe slightly beyond. That's kind of the area
7 of my interest, you know, the kind of to the north, south,
8 east and west. Most of my doctors and dentists are in
9 Chandler or maybe as far east as Country Club in Mesa.

10 So because many stores and businesses are so
11 readily available, I really don't have to travel that far,
12 although I do travel into Maryvale for church, but usually
13 I'm kind of in those areas, like I-10, Broadway, Country
14 Club and maybe the 202 to the south.

15 And so I look at that area as community of
16 interest. I would appreciate the Dobson Ranch community and
17 maybe Tempe Lakes community where I used to live kind of
18 being kept in --

19 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

20 The next speaker is Lisa Marshall. Lisa, can you
21 hear us? Lisa, we see that you're unmuted. Lisa, can you
22 hear us?

23 Okay. We'll come back to Lisa.

24 There's another speaker. Linda Edgar, who we don't
25 have -- I'm sorry, Sharon Edgar. We don't have a microphone

1 next to us so we can't unmute you. Sharon, if you could log
2 back in with a computer or phone that has a microphone so
3 that we can hear you, that would be great.

4 And then I think our next speaker is -- I believe
5 Austin Aslan was on the line. Austin? Can you unmute
6 yourself?

7 All right. Austin, go ahead.

8 SPEAKER ASLAN: Me?

9 MS. VAN HAREN: Yep. Please proceed.

10 SPEAKER ASLAN: Wonderful. Thank you.

11 So I'm Austin Aslan, I'm a Flagstaff City Council
12 member. I'm also the chair of the Coconino Plateau Water
13 Advisory Council, which is a large and diverse body of
14 stakeholders and experts up here in Northern Arizona. I
15 want to thank you all very much for your service and for the
16 hard work that you're doing.

17 I think it's really important that you guys do not
18 put Prescott and Flagstaff in the same congressional
19 districts. I actually grew up in Prescott and now I'm a
20 long-term resident of Flagstaff, and I love both
21 communities, and they're both great assets to the State of
22 Arizona; but from my personal experience, Prescott and
23 Flagstaff are entirely incompatible and would present
24 enormous challenges for any congressperson constantly trying
25 to reconcile vastly opposing issues and values.

1 This is particularly true from a water perspective.
2 Prescott is ruled by a groundwater active management
3 district that is failing and Flagstaff is not ruled by an
4 active management district but is voluntarily enacting, to
5 great success, its own management efforts.

6 I'd like to say something personally to you guys.
7 You know, making incredibly strong partisan districts
8 creates a cognitive dissonance between what local
9 constituents are asking for and what far off political
10 powers dictate. We run a very real risk of encouraging
11 extremism when our parties' primaries decide elections.

12 You know, right now we've got a guy from Lord knows
13 where waiting until this process was done to swoop in here
14 and plant a flag to run for the district. He's eyeing the
15 district because the way it's proposed he'll waltz into
16 office.

17 This -- is that kind of outsider going to
18 understand the tribal needs of our region, our water issues,
19 the vastly different forest health concerns between Prescott
20 and the peaks? Is that what we want for Northern Arizona?
21 Is that in the best interest of Republicans, for Democrats?
22 Is that the kind of choice Independents want for about a
23 third of the state everywhere?

24 So this country is tearing itself apart right now
25 and we need to be mindful and thoughtful about creating

1 districts that create an opportunity for healing and actual
2 dialogue. That's not going to happen in front of the
3 television cable news channels. It's not going to happen
4 unless our politicians are forced to wrestle with the
5 nuances and overlaps that exist in our politics. You guys
6 are doing this role because --

7 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

8 Our next speaker is Sharon Edgar. Sharon, can you
9 hear?

10 SPEAKER EDGAR: Yes, can you hear me?

11 MS. VAN HAREN: Yes. Please proceed.

12 SPEAKER EDGAR: My name is Sharon Edgar. I live in
13 Flagstaff, I agree with everything Austin just said. I also
14 want to echo the sentiments of my friends in Sedona,
15 Verde Valley, and Oak Creek.

16 Our community of interest has a sense of
17 stewardship for our residents and our natural surroundings.
18 We share the same housing, workforce, water, and
19 healthforce -- health issues. We belong in the same
20 legislative district.

21 Please consider legislative district maps LDF0050
22 and LDF0051. Those LD-6 and LD-7 maps were submitted by the
23 Coconino County Board of Supervisors on October 27th and
24 unanimously endorsed by the city councils by Flagstaff,
25 Sedona, and Clarkdale. LDF0051 meets the Voting Rights Act

1 requirement to not dilute votes of a minority community that
2 would be unable to elect candidates of their choosing
3 because of racially polarized bloc voting. It also does not
4 pack that district with voters, including Native American
5 voters, who can make a neighboring district competitive.

6 In the draft map, LD-6 has a vote spread of over
7 42 percent, the neighboring LD-7 has a vote spread of almost
8 30 percent. High vote spreads like 42 percent and
9 30 percent discourage voting. Those districts should be
10 drawn to be more competitive.

11 The Coconino County map has a vote spread of
12 15.84 percent for Native American voting rights district,
13 and less than 1 percent for a competitive Republican --
14 Republican neighboring district.

15 Please give LDF0050 and LD 5501 some consideration.
16 Thank you very much. I appreciate your service to all of
17 Arizona.

18 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

19 Our next speaker is Dawn Schackner. Dawn, can you
20 hear us?

21 SPEAKER SCHACKNER: Yeah, can you hear me?

22 MS. VAN HAREN: Yes. Please proceed.

23 SPEAKER SCHACKNER: Okay, hi, my name's Dawn
24 Schackner, I live in Doney Park area of Flagstaff. I'm
25 speaking in behalf of myself.

1 I'm respectfully asking the Commission to consider
2 adopting the Navajo Nation Human Rights draft proposal and
3 here are the reasons why.

4 When the IRC Commission was formed, my
5 understanding of the criteria was that to the extent
6 possible competitive districts should be favored when to do
7 so would create no significant detriments to the other
8 goals.

9 The proposed draft map takes a highly competitive
10 district and makes it noncompetitive to the detriment of
11 Native Americans without justification.

12 Native Americans deserve to have a voice.

13 If a party is sure to win, why would we want to
14 vote? Don't we want all Arizonans to be engaged?
15 Competition means that candidates must pay attention to all
16 of their constituents. While one party is sure to win, the
17 representative can ignore constituents outside their party.

18 I ask the Commission to strongly consider the
19 Navajo Nation Human Rights Commission proposal known as
20 CDF010.

21 I thank the Commission for hearing our concerns and
22 for their very hard work in making these most difficult
23 decisions.

24 Thank you.

25 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

1 The next speaker is Cora Phillips. Cora, can you
2 hear us?

3 SPEAKER PHILLIPS: Yes, can you hear me?

4 MS. VAN HAREN: Yes. Please proceed.

5 SPEAKER PHILLIPS: Yes. Thank you very much. My
6 name is Cora Phillips from Navajo Nation and I serve on the
7 Navajo Nation Human Rights Commission; and I speak for the
8 Navajo people who don't have Internet capacity, for those
9 elders who are unable to speak English language but who have
10 been faithful voters, and lastly for our veterans who
11 believe and fought for America's democratic principles of
12 fairness and justice.

13 Congressional District 2 has the largest
14 concentration of Native American votes in the United States,
15 and I strongly believe that we deserve a chance to elect
16 congressional representation who will truly represent our
17 interests, and a competitive district will certainly give us
18 that chance or opportunity.

19 A majority of registered Democrats and in the
20 proposed district map the represent- -- the representative
21 will be chosen in the Republican primary. This will surely
22 diminish our voice, creating a significant detriment to
23 being part of a fair and competitive map.

24 Competition basically means that candidates must
25 pay attention to all their constituents. Where one party is

1 certainly -- will win -- they know they will win, their
2 representative can also give -- or ignore constituents
3 outside of their party.

4 The draft map has taken a highly competitive
5 district and it's really unfair to make it solidly
6 Republican.

7 This is not necessary to accommodate the other five
8 constitutional criteria. The addition of all of Yavapai
9 County to Congressional District 2 will rigorously dilute
10 the voting power of Native Americans.

11 I fully support the congressional map submitted by
12 the Navajo Nation and please redraw the district lines for
13 Congressional District number 2.

14 Thank you very much.

15 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

16 Our next speaker is Rennae Ward. Rennae, can you
17 hear us?

18 Rennae, can you hear us? We can hear you.

19 SPEAKER WARD: Now can you hear me?

20 MS. VAN HAREN: Yes. Please proceed.

21 SPEAKER WARD: Okay. Technical difficulty there.

22 I agree with the last speaker and I would like -- I
23 am currently -- the way that District 9 is set up, I live in
24 Maricopa County, I live in the area of north
25 Peoria/Vistancia near the 17 and 303 freeway where there's

1 an enormous amount of construction and building that's going
2 on and we are probably, if not the fastest growing area of
3 Arizona, we are pretty close to it.

4 We have been included in District 9, congressional
5 district, and we do not resemble any of that district
6 whatsoever; that is a very rural district. We do our
7 shopping and schools and all of that in Peoria and Glendale
8 and Sun City; and I would advocate that we are nothing like
9 Wickenburg or Prescott. That maybe instead of having
10 Prescott in District 5 it should be moved to District 9
11 which is rural, as is Prescott, and much of that area in
12 that -- the area around Prescott. I know Prescott is up and
13 moving, too, but it still is, in my mind anyway, a rural
14 area of the -- of the state and definitely my area,
15 District 28, is not --

16 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

17 Our next speaker is Kristie Blackman. Kristie, can
18 you hear us?

19 Kristie?

20 SPEAKER BLACKMAN: (No audible response.)

21 MS. VAN HAREN: Yes. Please proceed.

22 SPEAKER BLACKMAN: Hi. So I wanted to talk to you
23 about District 6 and District 7. I would like to definitely
24 keep Flagstaff in District 6. If you look at the Navajo
25 Nation, they had a massive loss of 40,000 citizens that left

1 the Navajo Nation according to the census, which puts --
2 puts that -- that's why they're having to recount and get
3 other areas in both the congressional district and also the
4 legislative district.

5 But there is a large population of indigenous in
6 Flagstaff, many of them shop in Flagstaff. We over here in
7 Navajo County over by Snowflake/Pinetop/Lakeside, we tend to
8 stay over here. We do most of our shopping up in Pinetop,
9 up in Snowflake, or even going to the Valley; rarely do we
10 go to Flagstaff.

11 So I am a proponent of keeping Flagstaff with
12 District 6 and I also am -- love the way you have
13 Congressional District 2 set up.

14 Thank you.

15 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

16 And Commissioner Mehl, that was our last speaker
17 for now that is logged in. I think we are all set.

18 COMMISSIONER MEHL: Well, we certainly want to
19 thank everyone who spoke today and thanks for the incredible
20 amount of input that we have been getting throughout these
21 different meetings we've had.

22 We invite you to go online and submit a map using
23 our mapping software at IRC.AZ.gov.

24 Our next business meeting will be next -- will be a
25 week from Tuesday -- well, we won't -- we will not be

1 meeting next week which is Thanksgiving week, but we will
2 meet the following Tuesday. And our next in-person meeting
3 will be tomorrow and in Prescott at 10 -- 10:00 a.m.

4 Lori, any other information we should pass on about
5 future meetings?

6 MS. VAN HAREN: So we will have our next meeting
7 tomorrow in Prescott; and then we'll have another meeting
8 on -- in the Hopi Reservation at Kykotsmovi; and then our
9 next meeting, a business meeting, is on November 30th at
10 8:00 a.m.; and you can also submit comments through the
11 IRC.AZ.gov website.

12 COMMISSIONER MEHL: And with that we want to thank
13 you all and we hereby adjourn the meeting. Thank you.

14 (Whereupon the town hall concludes at 12:47 p.m.)
15
16

17 **"This transcript represents an unofficial record. Please**
18 **consult the accompanying video for the official record of**
19 **IRC proceedings."**
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF ARIZONA)
) ss.
COUNTY OF MARICOPA)

BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings were taken before me, Angela Furniss Miller, Certified Reporter No. 50127, all done to the best of my skill and ability; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter reduced to print under my direction.

I CERTIFY that I am in no way related to any of the parties hereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome thereof.

I FURTHER CERTIFY that I have complied with the requirements set forth in ACJA 7-206. Dated at Litchfield Park, Arizona, this 10th of December, 2021.



Angela Furniss Miller, RPR, CR
CERTIFIED REPORTER (AZ50127)

* * *

I CERTIFY that Miller Certified Reporting, LLC, has complied with the requirements set forth in ACJA 7-201 and 7-206. Dated at LITCHFIELD PARK, Arizona, this 10th of December, 2021.



Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
Arizona RRF No. R1058