

THE STATE OF ARIZONA
INDEPENDENT REDISTRICTING COMMISSION

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF LISTENING TOUR PUBLIC MEETING

Show Low, Arizona

Online via WebEx

July 31, 2021

10:00 a.m.

***Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
PO Box 513, Litchfield Park, AZ 85340
(P) 623-975-7472 (F) 623-975-7462
www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com***

Reported By (via WebEx):
Angela Furniss Miller, RPR
Certified Reporter (AZ 50127)

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC

This transcript represents an unofficial record. Please consult the accompanying video for the official record of IRC proceedings.

1 LISTENING TOUR PUBLIC MEETING, BEFORE THE
2 INDEPENDENT REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, convened at 10:00 a.m.
3 on July 31, 2021, at City of Show Low Council Chambers, 181
4 North 9th Street, Show Low, Arizona, and online via WebEx.

5
6 COMMISSIONER(S) PRESENT:

7 Ms. Erika Neuberg, Chairperson
8 Mr. David Mehle
9 Ms. Shereen Lerner

10 COMMISSIONER(S) PRESENT VIA VIDEOCONFERENCE:

11 Mr. Derrick Watchman, Vice Chairman

12 STAFF PRESENT:

13 Mr. Brian Schmitt, Executive Director
14 Ms. Loriandra Van Haren, Deputy Director
15 Ms. Valerie Neumann, Executive Assistant
16 Ms. Michele Crank, Public Information Officer
17 Mr. Roy Herrera, Ballard Spahr
18 Ms. Jillian Andrews, Ballard Spahr
19 Mr. Dennis Burke, Ballard Spahr
20 Mr. Shawn Summers, Ballard Spahr
21 Mr. Ryan Regula, Snell & Wilmer
22 Mr. Mark Flahan, Timmons Group
23 Mr. Parker Bradshaw, Timmons Group
24 Ms. Ivy Beller Sakansky, National Demographics
25 Corp.

PUBLIC COMMENT SPEAKERS:

Ms. Judy Begay
Ms. Patrice Horstman
Representative Walt Blackman
Ms. Kristie Blackman
Mr. David Peelman
Ms. Jodie Humphrey
Mr. Eric Kramer
Mr. Steven Slaton
Ms. Molly Ottman
Ms. Sylvia Allen
Ms. Laura Doty
Ms. Kathleen Dubbs

1 PUBLIC COMMENT SPEAKERS (continued):

2 Ms. Kelly Meixler
3 Mr. Jim Vance
4 Mr. Clay Howard
5 Ms. Toni Beetham
6 Mr. Byron Lewis
7 Mr. Nicholas Scienski
8 Mr. Robert Hephner
9 Ms. Allison Hephner
10 Mr. Jesse Bryant
11 Mr. Paul Conathers
12 Ms. Louise Liggett
13 Mr. Scott Caswell
14 Ms. Kelly Rael

15 * American Sign language interpreters, and
16 Spanish interpreters are also present.
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

P R O C E E D I N G

1
2
3 MS. VAN HAREN: Good morning, everyone.

4 We don't have microphones here that can amplify, so
5 you'll have to speak loudly and clearly. You'll see I'm
6 holding a microphone but that's going to our WebEx audience
7 who is participating online, okay.

8 So we would like to get the meeting started. If
9 you will all stand, we have Supervisor Patrice Horstman
10 here; she's going to lead us in the Pledge of Allegiance.

11 (Whereupon the Pledge of Allegiance is recited.)
12

13 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you so much. So now I'll
14 turn it over to Commissioner Lerner who is chairing the
15 meeting.

16 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Good morning, everybody.
17 Very nice to see you all here; we're all happy to be here as
18 well.

19 I now call to order the next meeting of the
20 listening tour of the Independent Redistricting Commission.

21 We would like to remind the public that COVID-19 is
22 still prevalent and we ask you to follow the Arizona
23 Department of Health guidelines. If you're not fully
24 vaccinated, you should wear a mask in public space.

25 If you'd like to participate from home, each of

1 these meetings is being streamed through WebEx.

2 Please note that if you would like to make a public
3 comment, you may do so by signing in with staff over in the
4 back where you came in and filling out the public comment
5 card.

6 If you haven't already done so, please fill out the
7 community of interest survey. There is a QR code on signs
8 at the sign-in desk and on the public comment cards that
9 will direct you to the link. Please see a member of staff
10 if you have any questions.

11 We have an American Sign Language interpreter
12 joining us virtually and we have interpreters and headsets
13 available for those in attendance. We also have a
14 transcriptionist who will be transcribing every meeting.

15 Please speak slowly and clearly so we have a clear
16 record of your input.

17 Will the interpreters in attendance introduce
18 themselves now.

19 ASL INTERPRETER: Hello. My name is Tiana. I am
20 one of the ASL interpreters today; and my team today will be
21 Katherine Montoya.

22 PUBLIC SPEAKER: Good morning; my name is Gloria
23 Watson; I'm a resident of Show Low, and I'm here to
24 interpret in Spanish.

25 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Thank you.

1 Anyone else?

2 Okay. At this time we will introduces ourselves.

3 Again, I am Commissioner Lerner; I represent

4 Maricopa County, and I am a Democrat.

5 Chairwoman.

6 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Hi. I'm Chairwoman Neuberg;

7 I'm an Independent and I'm from Maricopa County and I'm

8 super excited to be here.

9 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Commissioner Mehl.

10 COMMISSIONER MEHL: I'm David Mehl; I'm from Pima

11 County and really appreciate the public giving us input.

12 COMMISSIONER LERNER: And we have virtually

13 Commissioner Watchman.

14 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Thank you,

15 Commissioner Lerner. I am Derrick Watchman; I am the

16 Democratic appointee to the Commission, and I'm from

17 Apache County. So good morning and thank you, everybody.

18 COMMISSIONER LERNER: We're all pleased to be here.

19 Thank you.

20 Now we will move to Agenda Item II, which is going

21 to be a presentation on the process. First we will have a

22 representative from our legal team begin.

23 MR. SUMMERS: Good morning. My name is Shawn

24 Summers; I'm one of the attorneys for the Commission. I'm

25 here from the firm Ballard Spahr. I'm joined this morning

1 by my colleague Ryan Regula, who is another attorney from
2 the Commission; he's from the firm of Snell & Wilmer.

3 And I'm just going to begin today by talking a
4 little bit about what the Commission is, what it does, and
5 what we're here today to do on the listening tour.

6 So we're going to start with the Constitution. As
7 you probably know, every ten years the Constitution requires
8 the federal government to take a census; from that census
9 congressional representation is reapportioned among the
10 state, but each state is responsible for redrawing the
11 districts within the state to account for changes in
12 population in the state over the previous ten years.

13 From Arizona statehood in 1912 until the year 2000,
14 Arizona did what most states do still, what pretty much
15 every state did at the time, and the state legislature
16 controlled redistricting. So state legislators drew their
17 own districts, they also drew Arizona's congressional
18 districts in the U.S. House of Representatives.

19 That changed in the year 2000, when voters approved
20 Prop 106, Prop 106 amended the Arizona Constitution to
21 create the Independent Redistricting Commission. So you can
22 see there, the language of Article IV of the Arizona
23 Constitution says that every year ending in "1," like 2021,
24 there has to be established a new commission to draw new
25 lines for the next ten years.

1 The Arizona Constitution has some requirements for
2 how the Commission has to be structured. First, it has to
3 have five members; no more than two of those members can be
4 of the same party. Typically how this has worked out is
5 that there are two Democrats, two Republicans, and then
6 those four choose an Independent chairperson. No more than
7 two of the original four members can be from the same county
8 either.

9 And you can see there on your screen the -- the
10 names of the current Commissioners, four of whom have
11 already introduced themselves to you.

12 The constitution also prescribes six goals for how
13 the Commission is to redraw the maps. These are what the
14 Commission has to take into account in redrawing both the
15 legislative districts and the congressional districts.

16 First, the districts must comply with the
17 U.S. Constitution and the Federal Voting Rights Act; second,
18 congressional districts and legislative districts shall each
19 contain equal population to the extent practicable; third,
20 districts should be compact and contiguous to the extent
21 practicable; fourth, districts should respect communities of
22 interest to the extent practicable -- that's largely what we
23 are here today to get input from you on this listening tour
24 about what you consider your communities of interest to be
25 before the Commission begins drawing the maps; fifth, to the

1 extent practicable, district lines should follow visible
2 geographic features, cities, towns and county boundaries,
3 and undivided census tracts; and then finally, to the extent
4 practicable, competitive districts should be favored where
5 to do so would create no significant detriments to the other
6 five goals.

7 These are the six goals the Commission will be
8 taking into account in drawing the maps.

9 Next, we have a timeline about what the map-drawing
10 process is going to look like over the next six months or
11 so.

12 First, in July or August the Commission is going on
13 this listening tour. Like I said, this is to collect input
14 from you about what you consider your communities of
15 interest to be.

16 In August, mid-August, the Census Bureau will be
17 releasing data from the 2020 census. The Commission does
18 not have this data yet, the Census Bureau hasn't released
19 it, so the Commission can't start drawing maps until we get
20 the 2020 census data. That's later than usual, typically it
21 would be released already but it was delayed because of
22 COVID-19.

23 In September the Commission will draw and adopt a
24 grid map. A grid map is meant to clear away the old
25 districts line. Whatever districts there are now, they're

1 -- the Commission has to start from scratch; the old
2 districts will be wiped away. And the Commission will adopt
3 a grid map that only takes into account two of the six
4 factors. It will be -- will contain districts of equal
5 population and they will -- it is compact and contiguous as
6 possible.

7 So if you imagine a grid laid over the state with
8 equal -- districts of equal population, that's what the grid
9 maps will be.

10 From September through October, the Commission will
11 draw and develop draft maps. That is they will adjust the
12 grid map in order to take into account the other four goals
13 that aren't reflected in the grid map.

14 Then, once the Commission has adopted draft maps,
15 there's a mandatory 30-day comment period in the
16 constitution that's required before the Commission can
17 finally adopt a final map.

18 So October/November, 30-day comment period on the
19 draft maps; and then from December to the end of the
20 project, the Commission will revise the draft maps and adopt
21 the final map.

22 So what are some ways that you as members of the
23 public can get involved?

24 Well, first, all meetings of the Commission are
25 open to the public, they're streamed online, and you can

1 submit public comments to the commission at
2 IRC.AZ.gov/public-meeting.

3 Second, we want to hear your initial input on your
4 communities of interest. We have some tools that will allow
5 you to do that in addition to this meeting today that we're
6 going to talk about in just a few minutes. But communities
7 of interest are something the Commission really needs to
8 know about.

9 Finally, input on draft maps. So before draft maps
10 are adopted there will be a mapping tool that we'll speak
11 about in a minute that will allow you to draw and input your
12 own draft maps; submit comments on the Commission's draft
13 map once it's adopted; and in the late stages once we
14 approach a final map, you will be able to comment on that
15 map as well.

16 So with that, I'll turn it over to Mark from
17 Timmons, our mapping consultant, and he'll talk a little bit
18 about information and empowerment tools that we put
19 together.

20 MR. FLAHAN: Good morning, everyone. My name is
21 Mark Flahan with Timmons. Part of my team I have up here is
22 Ivy Beller Sakansky, she's our demographer from NDC and --
23 Sure.

24 We have -- my name is Mark Flahan from Timmons
25 Group. Can you hear me now in the back?

1 Perfect.

2 Next to me I have Ivy Beller Sakansky, she's a
3 demographer from NDC; and also on my team I have Parker
4 Bradshaw over there also from Timmons as our project
5 coordinator.

6 So I want to talk to you about a couple empowerment
7 tools that we have put in the hands of you guys that are
8 available on the web 24/7 for access.

9 The first one is a socioeconomic report. It is an
10 interactive site with geographic and socioeconomic in the
11 data, and we'll talk about that in the next slide.

12 The two other mapping tools that we have is our
13 community of interest survey which you probably saw on QR
14 codes when you came in today; and it's another 24/7
15 available online that allows you to submit your community of
16 interest. And we'll, again, talk about that in a future
17 slide.

18 The third mapping tool that we have that we're
19 currently setting up is the redistricting system and that
20 will allow you to draft and submit proposed map changes.

21 Okay. So let's talk about the socioeconomic
22 report.

23 Like I said, it's a 24/7 web app that's available,
24 and you can go to the IRC website and get a link to it. It
25 has 14 different points of demographic data throughout the

1 entire state of Arizona.

2 So you see an acronym up there that says "CVAP,"
3 that is citizen voting age population; and then it also has
4 a bunch of other demographics. So rental and renter's
5 housing, other languages at home, et cetera. So that's
6 available to you today.

7 The next piece that we have is our community of
8 interest survey, which is why we are here today to learn
9 about your community of interest. Like I said, it is
10 available online. You can see on the right side it has a
11 community boundary map, so it allows you to draw your own
12 community of interest on a map to be able to submit back to
13 the Commission. This is really putting the power in you
14 guys' hands to accurately depict what your community of
15 interest is.

16 With that being said, I'm going to turn it over to
17 Ivy to talk about exactly what a community of interest is.

18 MS. SAKANSKY: Thanks Mark.

19 I'm sorry?

20 Good morning. Can everybody hear me?

21 Okay. We're going to try this again.

22 Good morning, everybody. It's great to see you.

23 So what is a community of interest?

24 It is a geographic area of people who share a
25 common story or connection. That connection can be common

1 social interests, shared demographic characteristics,
2 similar impacts from a legislative or congressional issue,
3 or any other connection that leads people in a given area to
4 believe they will be benefit from being kept together,
5 united, and in one legislative or congressional district.

6 As you think about your community, think about the
7 factors that Mark mentioned on the survey online. And that
8 survey says: Think about you and your neighbors, do you
9 have similar jobs? Do you rely on similar public services?
10 Belong to the same neighborhood associations? Are you
11 impacted by some regional environmental concern? Is your
12 community defined by similar regional land-use issues,
13 transportation concerns, languages spoken, community
14 celebrations or traditions, or other similar
15 characteristics?

16 Any of these characteristics could define a
17 community of interest.

18 Now it is your turn. As they travel the state on
19 this listening tour, the Commissioners want to hear from
20 you. What do you want the Commissioners to consider as they
21 draft and ultimately adopt their maps?

22 How do you define your community of interest?

23 Using the various tools that Mark described and in
24 your testimony today, we want to hear: What brings your
25 community of interest together and what are your community's

1 geographic boundaries?

2 Remember, the Commissioners can incorporate your
3 community into their maps only if you let us know where your
4 community is on the map.

5 Thank you for being here today, and now I will turn
6 this back over to the Commission staff who will begin to
7 take your comments.

8 COMMISSIONER LERNER: So before we move to -- and
9 thank you all for the presentation.

10 Before we move to Agenda Item III, public comment,
11 staff will be reading you the rules of the meeting.

12
13 MS. VAN HAREN: (Inaudible.)

14 In compliance with Arizona's open meeting law
15 speakers should confine your statement issued on the posted
16 event which is before the Commission. Speakers are also
17 requested to leave the comments to the (inaudible).

18 Additionally, speakers are required to follow
19 proper decorum. Speakers may (inaudible); foul and/or
20 abusive language will not tolerated. Any speaker
21 (inaudible) or any other guidelines may (inaudible) of peace
22 or disruption of the Commissioner's (inaudible) may be cause
23 of report to law enforcement, arrest, or prosecution.

24 (Technical/audio disruption.) As long as you
25 filled out the survey your input will be (inaudible).

1 Everyone is welcome to speak if you choose to do
2 so.

3 Opposing viewpoints may be expressed by
4 (inaudible). As a courtesy, citizens are reminded to
5 address the their comments to the Chair and the Commission
6 and not the audience present.

7 Please show respect for all speakers and avoid
8 personal comments.

9 Remember, the Commission must hear all sides of the
10 issue to (inaudible) informed decisions.

11 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Thank you.

12 We are now in to Agenda Item III, public comment,
13 and we will begin the public comment portion.

14 Will staff read the names of the first speaker and
15 the one in the queue.

16 Thank you.

17 MS. CRANK: Madam Chair, (technical/audio
18 disruption).

19 PUBLIC SPEAKER: Hello. I welcome you, the Arizona
20 Independent Redistricting Commission, to our beautiful city.
21 This is a great place to live, a great place to vacation.

22 I would like to welcome the general public for
23 attending this and thanking the elected officials that are
24 in our audience today as well.

25 I just wanted to say, you know, thank you for

1 coming up here and doing this; it is very, very, very
2 important. And I would like to encourage the citizens that
3 are here today, the citizens that are listening online to
4 participate in meetings such as this; whether it be online
5 or whether it be in person, I really would like people to
6 get involved. This is extremely important; your voice needs
7 to be heard, and it's going to get heard if you participate.

8 And that's the biggest thing I wanted to say. And,
9 again, welcome.

10 COMMISSIONER MEHL: Thank you.

11 MS. CRANK: I'd like to introduce in the listening
12 audience Mr. Jerry Smith, the vice mayor of
13 Pinetop-Lakeside, Ms. Whitesinger who is supervisor for
14 Navajo County, Mr. Darryl Semore, supervisor for Navajo
15 County; they will be not be speaking.

16 And I would like to introduce the next speaker who
17 is Supervisor Judy Begay from Coconino County.

18 MS. BEGAY: Good morning. I guess I can be heard,
19 right?

20 Good morning, Chair and members of the Independent
21 Redistricting Commission. My name is Judy Begay and I'm a
22 member of the Coconino County Board of Supervisors
23 overseeing District 4.

24 And my tribe is (Navajo language - Diné Bizaad.)

25 Originally from Coal Mine Mesa which is 20 miles

1 east of Tuba City, Arizona.

2 I'm here and I represent the eastern portion of the
3 Coconino County; I also am a member of the Navajo Nation.

4 My comments this morning focuses on the outreach to
5 the rural citizens of throughout Arizona. While living in
6 rural Arizona on our ancestral lands aligns us with our
7 traditional lifestyle and upbringings that we have on the
8 reservation and in -- within Arizona, we often feel that our
9 voices do not have the same impact as those who live in the
10 populated areas of our -- our state of Arizona.

11 Unfortunately, rural Arizona suffers from high
12 unemployment, struggling economic development, lack of jobs,
13 and fewer services and resources compared to the urban areas
14 where the opposite exist.

15 In addition, as the world, the nation, and our
16 state and our region become more and more connected through
17 Wi-Fi, broadband, WebEx, Zoom and Teams, rural Arizona
18 typically does not have the infrastructure or the digital
19 pipeline. While the digital divide has always existed,
20 COVID created it even greater; we need to be connected.

21 Which brings me to the IRC's listening sessions.
22 Many individuals who would not have traveled to the cities
23 to participate -- participate did so, they did it by
24 traveling to the satellite locations to listen and provide
25 their comments.

1 At the satellite sessions held in Page, Tuba City,
2 Chinle, Eagar, Sedona, and Congress as well as state
3 satellite listening in Arizona: You heard from rural
4 Arizona; and this is why it was so important and
5 disappointing to the extent that those two opportunities in
6 Navajo County, namely Keyanta and Teec Nos Pos to the Navajo
7 and Hopi reservation was canceled.

8 I believe I can speak for my colleagues in Navajo
9 and Apache Counties, that the counties, including Coconino,
10 would gladly assist in the IRC staff in arranging meeting
11 locations for future IRC listening sessions so that the
12 needs and sentiments for rural Arizona, in particular Native
13 American communities, are shared and heard.

14 I want to thank the IRC for being here today and
15 also the people that are in attendance to be part of these
16 sessions.

17 Thank you so much.

18 (Applause.)

19 MS. CRANK: Thank you, Supervisor.

20 Next speaker is Supervisor Patrice Horstman, and
21 after Supervisor Patrice Horstman is Brandon Martineau.

22 MS. HORSTMAN: Good morning, Chair and
23 Commissioners and members of Navajo County. Thank you for
24 the opportunity to provide comments on the redistricting
25 process for congressional and legislative seats to represent

1 our Northern Arizona communities. I am here along with
2 Supervisor Judy Begay.

3 My district in District 1 encompasses Flagstaff, it
4 goes west through Coconino County to the Grand Canyon to
5 Yavapai County and the Mohave County border. My colleague,
6 Judy Begay's district also serves East Flagstaff and then
7 east to Navajo County border and south to borders of Gila
8 and Yavapai County.

9 I provide this location orientation to illustrate
10 that while our neighbors -- neighborhood counties are
11 contiguous, each contain various types and sizes of
12 communities of interest. These communities of interest
13 extend beyond county borders.

14 Creating a redistricting outcome that accommodates
15 communities of interest is daunting. At the same time we
16 are all here attending these listening sessions and
17 benefitted by becoming aware, learning, and respecting what
18 matters most around the state, the county, the region,
19 chapters, villages and neighborhoods.

20 At the public hearing this week in Flagstaff where
21 I saw most of you, our Board of Supervisors commented on
22 guiding principles or areas of focus that we consider
23 important communities of interest for those of us here in
24 Northern Arizona. They include regional economic
25 development, sovereign indigenous nations, the rural nature

1 of the counties here in Northern Arizona, and the rich
2 diversity we have up here in Northern Arizona.

3 While these are important issues to raise and as
4 the Commissioners may find all of this somewhat challenging,
5 in the coming weeks Coconino County, and I'm sure many other
6 Northern Arizona rural counties, will be submitting specific
7 maps that address the four areas that I've mentioned,
8 communities of interest, but also we will be including what
9 we are learning by attending these listening sessions.

10 This is an opportunity for all of us to hear each
11 other and to come together.

12 MS. CRANK: Time.

13 MS. HORSTMAN: I want to thank you Commissioner
14 and -- Chair and the Commissioner for your important work
15 and your service here in the state of Arizona.

16 Thank you very much.

17 (Applause.)

18 MS. CRANK: The next speaker is Brandon Martineau.

19 MR. MARTINEAU: Chairman, members of the
20 Commission, I want to thank you for the opportunity to
21 speak. Welcome to Show Low and Navajo County.

22 I live in Heber and Overgaard community; it is the
23 largest unincorporated community in Navajo County. I am the
24 president of the Chamber of Commerce and have been there for
25 six years. I've been living in Heber and Overgaard for over

1 20 years, and I have immediate family and close friends in
2 almost every community in Southern Navajo and Apache County
3 and as far south as Safford and Pima and -- and that area.

4 And these communities are very close knit, they --
5 we attend church, local and regional church activities
6 together. Our schools interact on a regular basis with
7 sports and academics.

8 We are -- we attend each other's community events,
9 4th of July's and other events, 24th of July. These --
10 these communities are very close knit.

11 And this summer with the Wyrick Fire and other
12 fires burning in our area and recently the flooding, these
13 same communities that pull together to offer aid and
14 assistance to each other, and I just want to emphasize the
15 importance of keeping these communities together in -- in a
16 legislative district so that they can continue to work
17 together in the same way that they have in the past.

18 I do have two proposed maps that -- that have been
19 put together that I would like to present to the Commission
20 of suggestions that we have of -- of proposed districts.

21 The first one would be our -- our preferred option,
22 the second one would include the reservation communities
23 together if -- if that's what they prefer.

24 But just want to offer these suggestions to the
25 Commission and thank you for your time.

1 (Applause.)

2 MS. CRANK: The next -- the next speaker is
3 Representative Walt Blackman, and after Representative Walt
4 Blackman is Kristie Blackman.

5 REPRESENTATIVE BLACKMAN: Madam Chair, members of
6 the board, thank you for allowing me to be here.

7 My name is Representative Walt Blackman. I
8 represent Legislative District 6, and I also represent
9 Congressional District 1. I've represented LD-6 for the
10 past two sessions.

11 And typically in this district where I represent in
12 this area, it tends to also come over into as we are in
13 now -- or in Show Low; and I am representing those folks in
14 Show Low that are not in my legislative district that do not
15 have the same interests -- community interest, family
16 interest, religious interest -- as some of the counties that
17 are in the current map that we have right now.

18 When we're talking about communities of interest,
19 traveling around the second largest district in the United
20 States, CD -- or LD-6, and also Congressional District 1
21 which is --

22 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE SPEAKER: Oh. You're not going
23 to be able to hear it.

24 Hold on.

25 REPRESENTATIVE BLACKMAN: Also Congressional

1 District 1 --

2 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE SPEAKER: Yeah, but it's going
3 in my ears. Hold on.

4 REPRESENTATIVE WALTMAN: Do I get to reclaim my
5 time?

6 (Laughter.)

7 You're watching it, right?

8 But also a Congressional District 1 which is the
9 size of Pennsylvania, there are a lot of discrepancies in
10 those districts.

11 So being a rural representative in this area is
12 quite challenging because of the differences that the
13 present map had.

14 The best fit for this community is to align the
15 districts that have the same interest as you already know.
16 That's going to get the word out; that's going to be able
17 to -- the votes will be counted more. There will be more to
18 say at the table because of the new maps that are being
19 proposed to you for the new districts to include the
20 legislative and congressional district.

21 I'm going to stop now and let other folks speak. I
22 appreciate you being here and we really do hope that you
23 will take that in account when you are voting and when you
24 are realigning these districts.

25 So thank you.

1 (Applause.)

2 MS. CRANK: Next speaker is Kristie Blackman, and
3 then following Kristie Blackman is David Peelman; following
4 David Peelman is Judy [sic] Humphrey.

5 MS. BLACKMAN: Good morning. I hope you guys are
6 having a great day. We're so grateful that you're taking
7 the time to consider our input.

8 Rural Arizona often feels like we're unheard. The
9 current districts leave us with an even weaker voice.
10 Legislative Districts 6 and 7 are the largest legislative
11 districts in the country; Congressional District 1 is the
12 size of Pennsylvania. I would argue that these districts
13 are not set up in communities of interest and, in fact, I
14 know they're not because my husband is a current state
15 representative and Flagstaff's needs and desires are very
16 different than ours.

17 In our area you'll find a lot of cattle ranching,
18 farming, mining, and then there's also -- when people
19 generally come up to these areas they come up here because
20 they are family. Snowflake is -- I think it's the best
21 place. I think Show Low is the best place. But most people
22 head over to Flagstaff for recreational. When they come up
23 here, it's more like hunting and fishing and that type of
24 stuff.

25 So I feel like there's two things I would like you

1 guys to consider. One, the land mass of the district. It's
2 extremely hard as we have a vehicle that is two years old
3 and it has 80,000 for our Legislative District 6. That's
4 one legislative (technical/audio disruption).

5 I don't know who designed the last map but it's
6 like you're popping over each other all the time; and then
7 we have the issue that Show Low, that the representatives
8 who are currently on the Navajo Nation, it's hard for them
9 to get up to Show Low. And so all of Show Low, they go to
10 Walt when they need legislative issues done.

11 And it's kind of the same thing with Congressional
12 District 1. Flagstaff is also represented by Gosar.
13 Show Low, Snowflake, they call Walt and Walt always connects
14 them with Gosar. We've had a difficult time getting in
15 contact with the current representative. I'm not saying
16 that he's bad; but that's a huge -- the size of Pennsylvania
17 is a big massive district; and there -- the issues are so
18 different, they're just all so completely different, that
19 it's hard to represent as one voice when we -- we feel like
20 a lot of the things that they are representing don't
21 represent what we want. You know, we very much need to
22 align them.

23 I think it's the responsible thing to do. I think
24 if you align us as communities of interest, it gives a
25 better voice and right now we -- we really don't have that.

1 Right now it's very confusing. Very, very
2 confusing. And, in fact, I have to argue that these people
3 in Show Low, Pinetop, Quartzsite, they believe Walt is their
4 state representative. And I know this because I field the
5 calls and they're like, "We're not going to vote for you
6 again," and I'm like, well, I don't know how you did the
7 first time, but we'll still help you.

8 MS. CRANK: Time.

9 MS. BLACKMAN: So please consider that.

10 I feel like that Coconino County would probably be
11 better off over with Yavapai, they're all a lot of
12 recreation, a lot of hiking and this type of stuff. The
13 people that come up here are generally more your fishing,
14 your hunting, so it would be almost better.

15 The Navajo Nation I'm not sure because, man, the
16 Navajos do a lot of --

17 MS. CRANK: Time.

18 MS. BLACKMAN: Sorry. Thank you so much.

19 (Applause.)

20 MS. CRANK: Next speaker is David Peelman. After
21 David Peelman, Judy [sic] Humphrey, after Judy Humphrey,
22 Eric Kramer, after him Steven Slaton.

23 MR. PEELMAN: Good morning, Commissioner, Chairman.
24 Thank you for coming to Show Low.

25 I appreciate the opportunity to finish the comments

1 that I started yesterday in Eagar. Yesterday in Eagar you
2 heard many of the problems that are faced between -- or
3 differing problems north of I-40 and south of I-40. You've
4 heard reference to areas as large as states. The Navajo
5 Nation being as large as West Virginia, LD-7 being as large
6 as Indiana, and CD-1 being as large as Pennsylvania. You
7 have a monumental task ahead of you; I do not envy you
8 whatsoever.

9 Your decisions will impact the state of Arizona far
10 more than any single legislator, representative, and
11 politician for ten years to come.

12 As Representative Walt Blackman mentioned, we
13 feel -- I feel, and many on this Southern Apache County
14 areas feel, he is our representative. I will tell you I
15 have called him personally on numerous occasions to help
16 resolve issues, not the least of being the latest incident
17 of COVID spreading among our community and the issues and
18 problems it faced.

19 You know that the Navajo Nation north of I-40 had a
20 radically different solution for their community as
21 differing from the rest of the state of Arizona. They
22 locked down a portion of the State of Arizona as large as
23 West Virginia, denying the opportunity and access of the
24 rest of the people of Apache-Navajo Counties and the state
25 of Arizona.

1 Mr. Martineau presented you a map, a generalized
2 map. We don't come before you and tell you these problems
3 without trying to offer a reasonable solution to these
4 problems. He provided you a map of East Central Arizona,
5 which is representative of what you've heard here, what you
6 heard yesterday in Eagar, and hopefully most likely you will
7 hear in other testimony.

8 The people of the Mogollon Rim, the largest
9 national -- or the largest ponderosa forest in the world;
10 we're involved in cattle, forestry, ranching, farming,
11 business. We have an entirely different structure for
12 creating entrepreneurial businesses here in the White
13 Mountains than what occurs north of I-40.

14 I would ask you to take the comments you hear today
15 and elsewhere to heart and truly recognize that we all want
16 and deserve representation, but you're here to listen to
17 communities of interest. As LD-7 and LD-6 are currently
18 laid out, they do not represent in any way, shape, or
19 fashion our communities of interest.

20 Please, you have the opportunity with your wisdom,
21 your knowledge, your abilities to redraw these lines and
22 provide the representative to these communities --

23 MS. CRANK: Time.

24 MR. PEELMAN: -- that we're so sorely lacking.

25 Thank you for the opportunity.

1 (Applause.)

2 MS. CRANK: Jodie Humphrey.

3 MS. HUMPHREY: Good morning, Madame Chairwoman and
4 Commission.

5 My name is Jodie Humphrey, and I am a lifelong
6 resident of this particular political district. I lived in
7 Vernon for over 25 years, and I just recently moved to
8 Winslow where I've lived for the past year and a half.

9 I just want to make one general point and then one
10 specific point.

11 There are over six distinct political districts
12 within the Phoenix metro area. Anyone who doesn't live
13 there will tell you that Tempe is the same as Mesa which is
14 the same as Glendale which is the same as Phoenix which is
15 the same as Queen Creek; however, the people who live there
16 in those communities will tell you: No, they are distinct;
17 they are different.

18 However, we in this particular political district
19 have not been given the same courtesy and the same equity.
20 Anyone who lives here will tell you Winslow is different
21 from Show Low which is different from Heber-Overgaard which
22 is different from Tuba City which is different from
23 White River which is different from Chinle, yet we are all
24 lumped together and counted as one area; and everyone -- and
25 it is assumed that our interests, economically and

1 geographically is the same. So that is the general point in
2 that we are not. We are all vastly different.

3 My specific point is I believe that Winslow should
4 be counted as part of Flagstaff's political district. And
5 why that is is because Winslow citizens do not go to
6 Show Low for any of their major needs. They do not go there
7 to go to the hospital; they do not go there for shopping.
8 They do not go to Flagstaff. I'm one of the exceptions, but
9 that's because I have family here.

10 So we also share the railroad, which is something
11 that Show Low and the other southern part of the district
12 does not include. We also don't have the major forest needs
13 that this southern area has. We live in a desert so
14 therefore the threat of wildfire is not the same as it is
15 here.

16 So those are my two points. Please give us the
17 courtesy of having the same fair and equitable
18 representation as people and citizens in the Valley have.

19 And I will also -- I will take advantage of the
20 tools that you've mentioned and I include Winslow in -- as a
21 community of interest with Flagstaff because I believe that
22 our economic values align with theirs.

23 And hopefully we will -- our voices will be better
24 heard with the redrawing of the district.

25 Thank you so much.

1 (Applause.)

2 MS. CRANK: Next speaker is Eric Kramer.

3 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Thank you very much for your
4 comments so far. These are all wonderful to hear from you.

5 Just a little note, as you're providing us this
6 feedback it's great to hear how you would like things to be
7 grouped. Keep in mind there is also a population threshold
8 that has to be reached, so if you can kind of think -- think
9 about that as well and provide us with that input because
10 that's one of the issues, right, we have to reach. In rural
11 areas it's a lot tougher to get that population threshold,
12 so we would really like to hear from you how you come up to
13 speak about those kinds of thing of how you hope to get to
14 that.

15 Thank you.

16 MR. KRAMER: Thank you for coming to the White
17 Mountains; thank you for the work you do.

18 I am Eric Kramer from Pinetop, Arizona. I'm here
19 today to speak in favor of the Native American community of
20 interest, and I consider this in Northeast Arizona to be the
21 Navajo, Hopi, White Mountain, and San Carlos Apache
22 reservation; they certainly are the strongest community of
23 interest in the state of Arizona and they -- and they
24 definitely need to be kept together.

25 Partially to -- you know, you heard from the

1 Blackmans, one other community of interest I hope you
2 consider is Navajo County, keeping that together as one --
3 in one legislative district. I think you heard the
4 Blackmans explain how it's hard that the county is -- the
5 middle part of the county is chopped out and connected to
6 Flagstaff and points west; it would be better if the entire
7 county was kept together, it would result in better and
8 clearer representation for everyone involved.

9 I think the -- the interest of the Natives being
10 together is -- is obvious. One story I will tell you, we
11 went through this terrible pandemic; we're still going
12 through this terrible pandemic. When the State set up the
13 unemployment program for people in the COVID pandemic, it
14 was absolutely essential that the Natives had representation
15 in Phoenix. If they had hadn't had that representation in
16 Phoenix, we certainly wouldn't have never got those state
17 programs off the ground to serve the -- the Native
18 Americans.

19 Thank you very much. Appreciate your time.

20 (Applause.)

21 MS. CRANK: The next speaker is Steven Slaton,
22 after Steven Slaton is Molly Ottman, after Molly is Sylvia
23 Allen.

24 MR. SLATON: Good morning. My name is Steven
25 Slaton; I live here in Show Low. I work and own with my

1 wife the one and only pump store here in Show Low.

2 I would like to thank Chairman Neuberg,
3 Commissioners Mehl, Watchman, Lerner, and York for the
4 dedication to look over this redistricting process and later
5 decisions on redistricting which will affect so many people.

6 My wife and I, we represent the White Mountain
7 conservatives. We represent thousands of folks who pass
8 through our store monthly with all having the same community
9 interest.

10 We currently are in Congressional District 1 and
11 Legislative District 7. Due to the size of both districts
12 is the same state as Pennsylvania -- you heard a lot of that
13 today. With the size of these districts, half our
14 population is bound to feel unrepresentative [sic] and they
15 are. Districts should be compact to actually represent
16 community of interest who live and work together.

17 A new Congressional District 1 and Legislative
18 District 7, or whatever you decide to call these new
19 districts, should actually represent communities of interest
20 which is required by state and federal law.

21 I recommend keeping both the congressional and the
22 legislative districts the same size and math which keep both
23 representation on the same on a state level or federal level
24 for common interests.

25 For example, communities of Saint Johns, Snowflake,

1 Taylor, Holbrook, Joseph City, Winslow, the Navajo Nation
2 are not part of these communities of interest of the White
3 Mountains. Made up of primarily rock and high desert
4 plateau with a vast valley of ranchland, architectural
5 between the two regions. The culture and the way of life is
6 different than those communities of interest south of these
7 cities.

8 The White Mountain community which is outlined on
9 the map which I turned in the other day for you folks, the
10 community of interest is committed to bringing tourism to
11 the region along with common interest with other White
12 Mountain communities. We share rivers and lakes, national
13 forests, winter sports activities with ongoing economic
14 development with the White Mountain Apaches and San Carlos
15 Apaches.

16 Please do not include us in a legislative district
17 with these northern cities and the Navajo Nation. These
18 will arguably dilute our representation which is commonly
19 referred to as retrogression.

20 The White Mountain communities need to be with the
21 White Mountain communities of the same interests. These
22 interest are nonpartisan and are for the common good of our
23 locals and region.

24 I thank you and God bless you.

25 (Applause.)

1 MS. CRANK: Molly.

2 MS. OTTMAN: Hello. Thank you for letting me speak
3 and welcome to Show Low.

4 My name is Molly Ottman. I have two bachelor's
5 degrees, one from FAU in mechanical engineering, and the
6 other from NAU in education. I've worked with NASA, and
7 I've also consulted on the space shuttle.

8 I live in Linden, a part of LD-7. I'm a mother of
9 three and my husband is a firefighter.

10 Whether it's fire, floods, or natural disasters, we
11 need legislative representation. Many roads in Linden are
12 not maintained by the county, that means if we have a flood
13 or snowed in, no one is coming for us.

14 So it's very important you understand that. If we
15 have four feet of snow and some roads in Linden or we're
16 flooding, no one is coming for us.

17 We are on our own.

18 Have you heard the term "taxation without
19 representation"? It clearly defines the present state of
20 LD-7 and the rural areas of Navajo and Apache County.

21 And, by the way, we all call Walt.

22 (Applause.)

23 LD-7 is a populace that is required to pay taxes to
24 a government authority without having any say in the
25 government's policies. I want to be able to elect a

1 representative that is from my area and one that understands
2 our community and culture.

3 You moved the goalpost too far; move them back and
4 redraw LD-7.

5 Thank you.

6 (Applause.)

7 MS. CRANK: Michele --

8 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Before you -- I just want to
9 make one comment. It's super helpful when we hear specific
10 information about what fundamental needs are not being met
11 so when we're thinking through all the complex decisions, we
12 understand the specifics of what your needs are.

13 So -- so thank you for diving into those specifics.

14 MS. ALLEN: Thank you and good morning. Thank you
15 fellow Commissioners for being willing to serve on -- on
16 this Commission because I know it's a lot of work. Thank
17 you so much.

18 I'm Sylvia Allen, former Arizona State Senator for
19 District 5 and District 6 and former Navajo County
20 supervisor.

21 Representation by the people of the people is
22 fundamental to our constitutional republic in forming
23 legislative districts that are based upon communities of
24 interest, geographically compact and competitive is
25 essential to better representation.

1 Dividing up our counties into multiple legislative
2 and congressional districts impact our representation. When
3 I represented District 5 as a true rural district, and we
4 need a true rural district because rural is different than
5 urban, we have different issues, which I'm going to list
6 nine of them.

7 The five Eastern counties are South Apache, South
8 Navajo, Gila, Graham, and Greenlee with small portions of
9 Pinal County. I'm asking that we again have an Eastern
10 Arizona rural legislative district because we are all
11 communities of interest.

12 One: The copper corridor. Copper is critical to
13 national security and more copper is located in those five
14 counties than all across the country.

15 We have the largest stand of ponderosa pines and
16 forest and our issues are catastrophic fires and forest
17 health programs like 4FRY, keeping our timber industries and
18 common issues that are common to all of your communities.

19 Ranching is realized in all five of these counties.

20 Farming is realized in five of these counties
21 bringing millions of dollars and food security to our state.

22 Recreation is huge; the Valley comes to our area to
23 recreate, and it brings in over \$50 million as camping,
24 hunting, and fishing is very important to our areas.

25 The watershed, where the watershed the forest is

1 critical for the water that ends up in Salt River Lake and
2 irrigation system in the Valley.

3 Seven, our pioneer heritage in all five of these
4 counties are -- are similar and connect us. As Brandon had
5 testified, the people in these counties are hardworking, God
6 fearing, freedom loving, constitutional Bill of Rights
7 believing people, and it doesn't matter what party they
8 belong to because we're just this good-ole rural people.

9 We struggle to maintain our small business; it's
10 really hard to have a small business up here, and it's
11 different and to create jobs.

12 And we have more federally controlled land than any
13 other area in the state and we must deal with these federal
14 regulations and federal lands and these federal agencies.
15 And that's what the Eastern Arizona County Association does,
16 deal with all the federal agencies like the Mexican Wolf
17 program, that impact our private property rights and our tax
18 base.

19 I believe that the Flagstaff area fits very well
20 into the District 7 because they're -- they're closer to
21 them and Flagstaff provides so much for the Navajo Nation.
22 It provides education opportunity. I know the
23 Coconino County provides workforce development for many of
24 -- of the citizens from the Navajo Nation. They have their
25 healthcare needs, a lot of state and federal government

1 agencies are there to -- to service the tribe; and the tribe
2 has more in common with the Flagstaff City Council
3 philosophically and -- and in goals they're trying to reach
4 than they do with, like, Show Low and Vernon and these other
5 communities.

6 Also, the Navajo Nation doesn't have some of our
7 issues like the hunting and fishing and camping, the mining,
8 and all of those other issues that we deal with so -- so
9 completely with -- with these five rural district counties.

10 Another thing is we -- we do feel like our White
11 Mountain Apaches really have a lot in common with us. They
12 have the beautiful forest land, we work with them on the
13 forest health and the -- the forest fires and forest
14 recreation. They have the best elk permits in the world.
15 So they have that in common with us, but they still want to
16 be in Indian district which I would totally understand.

17 Then these maps -- and if I can hand this to the
18 Commission.

19 The maps that -- these are grassroots maps worked
20 on from -- first started down in Gila County. It shows the
21 way that the White Mountain Apache and San Carlos Apache can
22 still be in with District 7 at the same time allowing these
23 other communities of interest: South Navajo, South Apache,
24 Greenlee, Graham, Gila, and parts of --

25 MS. CRANK: Time.

1 PUBLIC SPEAKER: Thank you so much for allowing me
2 to speak today, and thank you for your work.

3 I tried to talk as fast as I could.

4 Thank you.

5 (Applause.)

6 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Before you -- Ms. Allen,
7 before you leave, I have a quick question, follow-up
8 question if I could.

9 It's okay. It's all right. I couldn't go above
10 the applause, the applause was great.

11 Could you just for all of us, we heard a lot about
12 the copper corridor as we've been traveling the state. Can
13 you give us what your definition is of that.

14 MS. ALLEN: Yes. The copper corridor is historical
15 communities that were founded on these copper deposits. So
16 you've got Superior, you've got Miami, Globe; you've got
17 Kearny, Winkelman, Oro Valley. All of that is the copper
18 corridor.

19 You got, of course, Greenlee, Morenci, Graham
20 County. They have -- Morenci is the largest copper deposit
21 in the world. So that is the copper corridor that has
22 historically been founded, and those communities have
23 depended greatly upon the jobs over the years of the up and
24 down of the copper market.

25 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Thank you. I just wanted to

1 make sure, and that way everybody is on the same page as
2 well.

3 MS. ALLEN: Yes.

4 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Thank you very much.

5 (Applause.)

6 MS. CRANK: The next speaker is Laura Doty,
7 Kathleen Dubbs, Jim Vance.

8 MS. DOTY: Thank you very much for being here and
9 taking the time to listen to what we have to say.

10 I've been a resident here from -- for about the
11 last 17 years, and during that time I have noticed that
12 there is very little opportunity for the people of the White
13 Mountain communities to be adequately represented in the
14 state legislature and the -- because of the size of the
15 congressional legislature as well, congressional area.

16 I agree and I would call attention to what
17 Mr. Blackman said, Representative Blackman, Mr. Perlman --
18 Peelman, excuse me, what he has said, in the fact that we
19 are not adequately represented.

20 Some of the major issues that we have, we cannot
21 afford another Rodeo-Chediski or wildfire. I was reading an
22 article not too long ago, in the past two weeks, that the
23 ponderosa pines in our area, here in Northern California
24 [sic] are diminishing, the forest is diminishing
25 tremendously. We need good forest management. We can only

1 get that through good legislative representation, and I hope
2 that you can find it in a way to get the representation when
3 you draw the maps that will show good, adequate
4 representation and forest management for our communities.

5 Thank you.

6 (Applause.)

7 MS. DUBBS: Hello. I'm Kathleen Dubbs. It's nice
8 to see you all in person instead of in little boxes on the
9 screen. Your -- the job you're doing is just tremendous. I
10 can't imagine all the work that you've been doing, and the
11 Independent Redistricting Commission is -- is the pride of
12 Arizona and I'm -- I'm just so glad that you're doing this
13 job to make it independent and fair.

14 What I have to say is very simple. When I bought
15 my home up here five years ago I was amazed to look at the
16 districts and see that there was this huge chunk of Navajo
17 County that wasn't in the same LD, and I just think that all
18 of Navajo County should be in the same LD.

19 I also agree that the -- that the Native American
20 Nations should also be in the same LD so that they have a
21 voice.

22 And that's all I have to say. Thank you.

23 (Applause.)

24 MS. CRANK: The next speaker is Kelly Meixler,
25 after Kelly is Clayton Howard, after Clayton Howard is Toni

1 Bee- -- Beethman.

2 MS. MEIXLER: Hi. Thank you for this opportunity
3 to speak. Thank you for coming to our lovely community.

4 I am a business owner up here and I want to just
5 tell some anecdotal stories but I want to agree with the
6 eloquent and thoughtful Sylvia Allen on that map, I think
7 that gives us the right population.

8 But I want to talk about my experience.

9 So COVID, Executive Order 202043, and this is on
10 point, immediately shut down my business and it shut down
11 all my friends here, right? I have friends from Oro to
12 Sanders, people who are from Heber, they're spread
13 throughout this region that we're discussing; it's all
14 rural, ranching, lovely people who have the least number of
15 HOAs in the whole country -- that must say something about
16 us as a community of interest.

17 So I -- when this happened we went into like panic
18 mode, a friend of mine we started talking about how are all
19 these bands that are suddenly out of work, how are they
20 going to feed their families and what are they going to do?

21 And we put in our community action network before
22 the federal government, before the state government, before
23 anybody else. And that region that she's showing on that
24 map, that's the group, that's the area that we were trying
25 to cover helping our friends and our neighbors.

1 And so I want to say another thing about the White
2 Mountain Apache, about these reservation that are in our
3 schools, they're our friends. When I hire bands and I'm
4 hiring people from White River, I'm not thinking that
5 they're Natives, I'm thinking they're my friends; they're
6 the ones I pray with, they're the ones I play with, they're
7 the ones that I work with. So I very much see them as part
8 of our community.

9 And in fact from the world of music venues, bands
10 rarely get the night off to go out and party themselves,
11 they're always working Friday and Saturday nights. And last
12 night one of the founding members of The Apache Spirit, the
13 oldest, longest running reservation band up here was
14 partying at my bar because I'm her local date-night bar.
15 We're just -- we're like this and we can't be torn apart
16 because it looks like -- it looks like -- well, here's what
17 I've been told.

18 Is that there's a reason we have such a dominance
19 of one side, one party, and that that was like -- it's like
20 we have to go to court so I can be equally represented by my
21 legislative district which doesn't seem fair. Who -- who
22 made it so that my vote counts less than anyone else in
23 Apache County, or anyone else here in Arizona? If they're a
24 percentage they're trying to hit, then aren't you
25 predetermining?

1 Anyway, that's my point, I hope you guys all have a
2 great day and come live with us in Apache County, Southern
3 Apache County, Southern Navajo County, and our region again.

4 (Applause.)

5 MS. CRANK: Jim Vance.

6 Jim Vance. Or could be Jay -- is it Jim Vance?

7 MR. VANCE: Chairman and members of the Commission,
8 appreciate you being here today and listening to the
9 comments that have been made.

10 I do know that there were people that came here
11 today who were turned around because they felt there were
12 too many people in here. We've got seats that aren't
13 available here that they would have liked to had their voice
14 heard also.

15 I don't have a whole lot to say because most of
16 what I have to say has already been said. There are a few
17 things which I won't take your time to discuss, but I'll
18 write them in.

19 But one thing that I'm kind of concerned about is
20 we didn't have a change in the number of representatives in
21 this state and things are going to be -- remain basically
22 the same as far as the number of representative and other --
23 and representatives that we had. So the simple thing to do
24 was just leave the boundaries as they are and continue --
25 and continue as normal.

1 That's what I'm afraid of, but there are areas of
2 interest that just are not being taken into consideration
3 the way things are.

4 Those boundaries need to be changed in order for
5 some people to be represented and to have their voice heard,
6 and I'm thinking specifically of parts of Apache County. So
7 that's my -- my main concern, and I'll leave it at that.

8 I definitely do want to change the boundaries, I
9 noticed Senator Allen's changes in the maps that she gave
10 you, they look very good to me, especially the first map.
11 But, you know, I'd hate to say Apache -- the Apache people
12 and their areas to be completely neglected. And if they
13 want to join the other Native Americans in their -- in their
14 legislative district, that would be -- that would be great.

15 But we do need a change.

16 Thank you.

17 (Applause.)

18 MS. CRANK: Next speaker is Clay Howard. After
19 Clay Howard is Toni Beethman, after Toni is Byron Lewis.

20 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Just as a reminder, thank you
21 for the comment about people who did not attend, if you know
22 folks who did not attend today, they can submit their
23 comments online, so please remind them to do so because we'd
24 love to hear from as many people as possible.

25 Thank you.

1 MR. HOWARD: Thank you for coming; we appreciate
2 you being up here to look at our area, you're probably going
3 to have little things a little bit different from me.

4 I'm what I consider a common man. I was born and
5 raised in Kansas. My parents and grandparents lived through
6 the Dust Bowl.

7 I was born and raised on a farm. Your farmers need
8 representation; your forest people need representation. You
9 probably have the most difficult job that there is -- and to
10 be fair, is more than difficult -- but you need to look at
11 an area and understand that your milk doesn't come out of
12 the store. You may buy it at the store, but it is grown on
13 a farm and it is raised, and the meat you eat is raised by
14 ranchers and people of that speed or nature.

15 The thing is, is that in doing what you do -- or
16 what you're going to be required to do, is going to be very,
17 very difficult, but you need to look at the people that you
18 are placing in these particular areas and see what their
19 needs are and also, you know, what the state or the county
20 or the country can provide for them to assist them in making
21 the best that they can with what they have.

22 These areas, a lot of them are not destitute, but
23 they are approaching that area, and from my standpoint you
24 need to pay attention to individuals or a group of
25 individuals and analyze the areas or the situations that

1 they are in.

2 I guess I -- you may have heard something that you
3 really didn't expect out of this area, but we have forests,
4 we have mining, we have mining that should be going on. We
5 have resources that can be used if the proper representation
6 is given and people are represented as they should be.

7 Thank you very much for being here and thank you
8 for listening to me.

9 (Applause.)

10 MS. CRANK: Toni, I think it's Bethham -- Beetham.

11 MS. BEETHAM: Good morning. Thank you for being
12 here.

13 I'll be very brief. I've been reading a lot about
14 the redistricting, and my main concern is just that
15 things be done fairly without gerrymandering, and I'd like
16 to see rural communities remain rural.

17 Apache and Navajo County are vast because the
18 population is vastly spread out. Much of the population is
19 tribal, and I strongly believe that the tribal nations could
20 be kept as a whole when you consider these maps.

21 Thank you.

22 (Applause.)

23 MS. CRANK: Next speaker is Byron Lewis, after
24 Byron Lewis is Nicholas Scienski, and Robert Mayhanher or
25 Hephner.

1 MR. LEWIS: Madam Chair, members of the committee,
2 thank you very much for being here on a Saturday. I'm sure
3 there's other fun things that you would like to be doing,
4 but it's doubtful that there would be anything more
5 impactful or long lasting than what you're hearing today and
6 the decisions you're going to make, which will impact us and
7 not only our voting but our social interactions and the way
8 we conduct our business.

9 With that in mind, I do feel the weight of your
10 responsibility. Four of the 11 largest counties in America
11 are under your -- under your immediate consideration.
12 Coconino is number two, Apache is number six, Mohave is
13 number five, Navajo is number 11. Throw into that mix, the
14 Navajo Nation is 22,000 square miles which is approximately
15 the size of the Nation of Israel, and you have a very
16 daunting task.

17 As you look at the county map, Elbridge Gerry would
18 be very impressed at the way the county seats or the
19 counties themselves, largely the county's boundaries have
20 been ignored.

21 One of the main issues that are facing us here in
22 this area as you've asked for specifics is water
23 adjudication. The way the legislative jurisdictions are set
24 up right now, neither entity, those of the Native American
25 population or those of the civil -- of the civil communities

1 such as Snowflake where I represent as an elected official
2 have adequate representation. That means both entities at
3 the table are lacking and that has perhaps precluded a
4 solution that will solve a decades-old conflict where
5 hundreds of thousands of dollars are being spent every month
6 for water adjudication.

7 The map proposed by Sylvia Allen has several
8 advantages. One is combining the nonreservation areas of
9 Apache and Navajo Counties with Yavapai, Gila, Graham,
10 Coconino, and Greenlee preserves county boundaries and
11 communities of interest. That is something that is very,
12 very significant.

13 It's also worth mentioning than here in the White
14 Mountains -- and, by the way, again, welcome, when you are
15 on the top of the mountain, you are a little bit closer to
16 heaven. But when you're here, you are part of a lot of
17 contingency people that come here to get away, and we are
18 providing citizens of the individuals who are not
19 necessarily part of our voting district.

20 Again, I thank you for your time. I will urge you
21 to remember the thing that unites us all is that we belong
22 to the same country. We may have different outlooks; we may
23 have different views -- certainly in terms of water
24 adjudication, and that one of the best ways to -- to handle
25 that would make sure that each -- each interested party

1 would have adequate representation.

2 Thank you and I wish you well in your daunting
3 task.

4 (Applause.)

5 MS. CRANK: Nicholas Scienski.

6 MR. SCIENSKI: Good morning, Commissioners.

7 I'd like to remind all of us that the point here is
8 representation. And I had an experience a couple of months
9 ago that may reveal some of our frustrations.

10 My wife and we have property both in Navajo County
11 and Apache County; we've been living here for over 30 years.
12 And it's only been in the last two years that we've seen
13 more interests and activity and real estate being bought and
14 sold than we have had in over 30 years.

15 We're in the midst of a great change in -- in the
16 mountain -- in the White Mountain area. So I reside in
17 Vernon, and we are experiencing the impact of that influx of
18 folks. The infrastructures are being strained; we're
19 working -- we're unincorporated, and I was encouraged and I
20 did, I wrote a letter to our representative of LD-7 inviting
21 her to come to a community meeting, that she might get to
22 know who we are in Vernon and what our concerns are; and if
23 she was able to help us, to lead us, to give us some insight
24 and understanding as to how we can develop a community that
25 we as a people who live there who thought we would like to

1 have and not just helter-skelter.

2 Well, I wrote the letter and three or four weeks
3 went by and I received no response, so I was encouraged to
4 call her office; and I did, talking to her secretary and
5 explained who I was, the letter I wrote, and I had not heard
6 anything. The office said: I will pass the message on to
7 her, and she would respond back as quickly as she could.

8 To this day I've had no response.

9 So in my investigations, I discovered how large
10 LD-7 is. And whether it's the size of Pennsylvania or
11 Vermont, I don't know, but it's big. And I can understand
12 physically why she's not able to respond to our needs in the
13 Vernon area, the Show Low area.

14 So I would like that to be -- I wanted to share
15 that in the -- in the simple understanding that the
16 geography here is quite different than any place I think
17 anywhere else in Arizona.

18 So the cultural and the common social interests of
19 a people group, i.e., the Navajo Nation and us that are
20 not -- do not belong to that nation, there is a line,
21 Interstate 40, that seems to be a wonderful place to start;
22 and economically and socially the interests that we have as
23 a people should be recognized and kept and considered in any
24 other --

25 MS. CRANK: Time.

1 MR. SCIENSKI: -- district.

2 So I want to thank you very much for your coming
3 out and hearing us this morning.

4 Thank you.

5 (Applause.)

6 MS. CRANK: Our next speaker is Robert Hephner,
7 after Robert is Allison Hephner, after Allison Hephner is
8 Jesse Bryant.

9 MR. HEPHNER: Madam Chair, Commissioners, thank you
10 for your time. I understand the -- it is a time give that
11 you're giving to the community; I appreciate that very much.

12 So I want to talk about two things, one is the
13 districts as they are now and hopefully a solution to help
14 you understand the community, the divider that you need to
15 do.

16 One, obviously the congressional or legislative
17 districts that we have are kind of wonky. This area
18 specifically I would say to you that Navajo Nation really
19 has less to do with us than the White Mountain Apache Tribe.
20 White Mountain Apache Tribe, Snowflake, Taylor, those should
21 be within our state legislature district, that's who we are
22 as a community.

23 Secondly, you know, you look at the congressional
24 district that runs all the way over. If you look at all the
25 congressional districts, there's only one congressional

1 district in the state of Arizona that's actually an area and
2 that's 2; everything else has part of Maricopa County in it,
3 and that's because of population. I get it, you got to
4 divide it out by population.

5 I would rather Maricopa County have four districts
6 and you put rural out to everyone else. So how do you
7 divide that? How do you figure that out and how do you get
8 population in?

9 I think your best way to do that is you use school
10 districts. School districts will be a way to identify
11 communities very easily; they already identify the
12 communities. And if you're crossing or cutting through
13 school districts to create specifically a legislative
14 district, you're probably not representing the community
15 they should be representing.

16 So that's the thing that I would -- I would say
17 look at that as -- as, you know, everything else can be
18 hard. I can't tell you -- I can't give you the map because
19 I don't know what the data is. I can't give you a map now
20 when you don't have the census data.

21 So good luck, thank you, and appreciate your help.

22 (Applause.)

23 MS. HEPHNER: Madam Chair, Commissioners, thank you
24 so much for being here.

25 I've been a resident of Navajo County for 28 years

1 living all throughout southern Navajo County, Snowflake and
2 down. I've been in population health for 18 of those years
3 either serving as a firefighter for the Show Low District,
4 emergency manager in Navajo County, public health for Navajo
5 County, so I've seen a lot of social determines of health,
6 and that's kind of what I want to talk to you today.

7 We are extremely under represented in our area, and
8 I'm saying Southern Navajo County. I, too, utilize Walt,
9 Representative Walt Blackman all the time in trying to get
10 resources to our community.

11 During COVID we created the Community Feeding
12 Collaborative, it was a collaborative to address our high
13 poverty rates. Our poverty rates about three years ago were
14 going up, we were reducing; we were doing really good; and
15 then COVID hit and we went back to very high, we're about
16 30, 34 percent poverty in our areas. And what this does is
17 it puts a very big stress on our resources; and when we're
18 not represented, we can't get the supported resources we
19 need.

20 So during the feeding collaborative we ended up
21 trying to create -- it was just going to be Southern Navajo
22 County, but we found we needed to include the whole county
23 and we did, but when we did that a lot of the food and a lot
24 of the resources we couldn't tap into because they were all:
25 Oh, we serve the 40, north of the 40; we can't serve your

1 area. So it really limited our ability to access those
2 resources.

3 Other things that ended up happening and that
4 people need to understand, White Mountain Apache Tribe is
5 not San Carlos, San Carlos is not Navajo Nation, Navajo
6 Nation is not Hopi. To be culturally competent is to
7 understand that each one of these tribes has their own
8 beliefs, their own cultures that need to be respected.

9 So when you say: Oh, it's going to work for White
10 Mountain Apache Tribe and Navajo Nation, it's not; it's two
11 completely different things. And in public health we were
12 constantly brought through cultural competent training to
13 understand. We have -- I've worked on every single
14 reservation providing services, and I can tell you right now
15 that White Mountain Apache tribe is completely different
16 than Navajo Nation, not just in their -- in their belief
17 structure, but in their topography, in what they -- their
18 needs are and -- and what their -- and how their people --
19 it's a beautiful thing. I work more with White Mountain
20 Apache Tribe now that I'm not with public health anymore,
21 but it's a beautiful community that needs to be seen, and
22 they're not when you lump them together.

23 So the other thing is I worked with Walt Blackman
24 on trying to address our substance abuse rate up here. We
25 are three times -- this is preCOVID numbers -- three times

1 the rate of substance abuse disorder in Navajo County than
2 in the state of Arizona. Now, I bring that up because
3 you're looking, oh, Navajo County as a whole.

4 Well, the difference is is Winslow actually has a
5 treatment center, Winslow actually has housing for it,
6 Winslow actually has these things because what we -- what I
7 find is Winslow and Navajo Nation -- I'm sorry, Flagstaff
8 and Navajo Nation end up being this suction. And when I
9 tried with Walt -- and he tried hard -- to get funding to
10 stay here and address the substance abuse in our -- justice
11 system, and actually ended up going to NAU. And we have to
12 wait and see if they -- what they came out with it and if
13 it's anything that's going to actually benefit us.

14 Because Flagstaff rural is not Navajo County rural,
15 it's not Apache rural, we're completely two different rural
16 places. In fact, I would say they're a little bit
17 urban/rural.

18 So I'm asking you today, you have a big job ahead
19 of you, obviously. I'm asking you to look at the
20 redistricting that does not exploit and disadvantage our
21 nontribal and tribal areas; because right now with what
22 happened ten years ago, I have watched our population health
23 diminished; I have watched our resources reduced. We had a
24 minimum wage increase that cost so much money to where our
25 government resources, all of our other resources, cut them

1 in half --

2 MS. CRANK: Time.

3 MS. HEPHNER: -- we couldn't serve.

4 So thank you so much, I appreciate your time, and
5 wish you guys all the best.

6 (Applause.)

7 MS. CRANK: Next speaker is Jesse Bryant, after
8 Jesse Bryant is Paul Conathers, and after Paul is Louise
9 Liggett.

10 MR. BRYANT: Guess I'll have to bend over.

11 Thank you all for the opportunity to be here.

12 (Technical/audio disruption.)

13 COMMISSIONER LERNER: We had a glitch in our
14 connection so we just got back online. So we are -- you did
15 not miss anything for those of you that are online. We are
16 going to get back on track with our speakers.

17 So thank you everybody for your patience.

18 MR. BRYANT: (Technical/audio disruption.)

19 One of those resolutions that was adopted ten years
20 ago from the -- from the town of -- of Pinetop and Lakeside,
21 and they said that the communities of interest in Eastern --
22 Eastern Central Arizona have strong ties, mutual interest,
23 and recent history of legislative district representation;
24 and the town of Pinetop-Lakeside is closely associated and
25 identified with the immediately adjacent unincorporated

1 county and in particular those areas that use either Pinetop
2 or Lakeside postal addresses. And the town of
3 Pinetop-Lakeside are closely associated and actively working
4 with the other municipalities and entities in Navajo County,
5 but in particular the city of Show Low and White Mountain
6 Apache Tribe.

7 I'll leave it -- I'll leave it there to give you a
8 sense of how we see ourself in this region here.

9 And where I'm from, we have -- we have the San
10 Carlos Apaches are our neighbors and we have the economic
11 exchange. We need to understand that rural Arizona, we --
12 we have the same issues and concerns as mentioned in urban
13 areas, but we have to approach them in a unique fashion.
14 And in our region we do so, we have that common thread
15 amongst ourself, it transcends all other demographics.

16 So we care about water, we care about education, we
17 care about infrastructure but we are kind of the forgotten
18 part of Arizona, and that's not a complaint, we have to be
19 more self-sufficient and we prefer to be that way.

20 Perhaps you heard about the floods that hit Miami a
21 day or two ago. Well, yesterday morning the people of that
22 town, not -- not the local governments necessarily, although
23 they were there, the people went out with shovels and
24 started digging the mud out of their streets and sidewalks.

25 I spoke to a gentleman I believe here today from

1 Vernon, and he told me during the flooding the past few days
2 him and his neighbors are out there digging out the drainage
3 ditches. You know, we can't always rely on emergency
4 services, we have to rely on ourselves, and that's the
5 nature of our region.

6 So the five eastern counties -- the five-plus
7 eastern counties, we strongly recommend that to you and hope
8 that you'll be hearing that same message and I'll see you
9 again in Safford as well and you're going to keep hearing
10 that message from our region.

11 As far as the maps, I'll speak to that very quickly
12 that were -- that were given to you today. If the Apaches
13 so desire that they wish to remain with the Navajos,
14 certainly they should have the right to do so. We feel they
15 are our neighbors, the White Mountain and San Carlos
16 Apaches, we very much enjoy having them as part of our
17 representation, we do business together and so forth.

18 But they -- they can be connected as you'll see on
19 one of those maps.

20 MS. CRANK: Time.

21 MR. BRYANT: There's an uninhabited area that
22 connects them.

23 I will leave this resolution for your people here
24 for your review.

25 Thank you very much.

1 (Applause.)

2 MS. CRANK: Next speaker is Paul Conathers, and
3 following Paul is Louise, following Louise and the final
4 speaker is Scott Caswell.

5 MR. CONATHERS: Good morning.

6 Yes. I'm Paul Conathers; and I live in Pinedale
7 community which is about 20 miles west of here on the 260 on
8 way to Heber-Overgaard. My office, I'm an insurance agent
9 and Realtor, my office is on Deuce of Club in Show Low, just
10 a stone's throw from here; and my clients range from
11 Saint Johns to Concho to McNary to Whiteriver to Cibecue,
12 Heber-Overgaard over to Winslow and Holbrook is my marketing
13 area which I have clients.

14 And right now we're in District 7, and just a few
15 minutes away I'm in District 6 for legislative district
16 which is what I want to speak about.

17 So our community, right now our community is split,
18 and that makes no sense at all. And the reason that I'm
19 going into reasons why that happened, but I think that's a
20 mistake. Because in the rural areas of Apache County, the
21 rural areas of Navajo County, we all work here in Show Low
22 most of us. The big employers is, you know, Walmart and
23 hospital are here in Show Low; and people commute
24 from Vernon where I'm at, Heber-Overgaard, they commute here
25 to work. There's a common -- there's a common interest.

1 I would implore you to put those -- our communities
2 back together and like was mentioned, so I'm just kind of
3 echoing what was mentioned before me.

4 And like Walt Blackman, yeah, some people in
5 Show Low, they think of him as theirs and he's not. So I
6 ask you to really consider that. Specifically it makes
7 sense to -- and also in congressional district have south of
8 I-40 be one district combined, and I think that will
9 better -- give us better representation.

10 So thank you for your time.

11 (Applause.)

12 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Thank you.

13 MS. LIGGETT: Good morning. All Commissioners for
14 being here for us. Can you hear me?

15 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Mm-hm.

16 MS. LIGGETT: Okay. I am new to this area; I came
17 from North Phoenix, Cave Creek, lived there for almost
18 20 years; loved living there, but it just got too crowded so
19 my husband and I moved out here to the rural area.

20 We live in -- just north of Snowflake and we love
21 it. We love it. We love it. There's so little traffic,
22 there's less people; and people talk to each other. It's
23 awesome and it's wonderful; people are real.

24 They know their neighbors, they want to know their
25 neighbors even though they're -- we have 36 acres and our

1 neighbors have property too, but we gather together because
2 we want to be together not 'cause we're squeezed together
3 into a city together on the same block. You know what I
4 mean?

5 So we are learning to live the country life and we
6 love it. It's harder but we love it. We have space, we
7 have air, beautiful clouds, we love Arizona.

8 And we believe that Sylvia Allen, Walt Whitman --
9 I'm sorry, Walt Blackwell -- I'm new here.

10 But we believe that the northern and the middle
11 eastern sections should be separated and grouped the five
12 counties together that -- that Sylvia noted; we think that
13 they have more interests in common.

14 And I also want to say that there's a lot of people
15 moving here. There's a lot of people from the cities moving
16 here, and they're going to have to learn Arizona ways.

17 And the people coming to the country, they need to
18 be together and they need to think -- think neighborly, I
19 guess you would say, and to work together. We want to work
20 together and we want to have these five areas together so we
21 can work. Whether they're white men, whether they're
22 Natives, whether they're Europeans or whatever, whoever they
23 are, we want to work together, and we want to have common
24 interests.

25 And also the legislators they don't need to be

1 going all over, you know, crazy areas, we want a more
2 compact area also.

3 Thank you for listening. Have a great day and
4 thank you for all your hard decisions you're going to make
5 and listening to all the people and caring.

6 Thank you.

7 (Applause.)

8 MS. CRANK: Next speaker is Scott Caswell and the
9 final and last speaker is Kelly Rael.

10 MR. CASWELL: Hello.

11 Our problem now is that we are taxed without
12 representation. Taxation without representation is not
13 American, it is not for my child to live up -- to grow up
14 being taxed without representation.

15 Our taxes are taken and very little benefit comes
16 to our people; that is slavery. We want our people to be
17 represented by our people. And if a foreign nation, the
18 Navajo Nation, they are unite and other nations, they have
19 no right to tax us. They can take care of themselves; we'll
20 take care of ourselves. We can no longer permit a foreign
21 nation to tax us and not give us any benefits.

22 We need representation for our taxation here. They
23 have different values, they have different school systems,
24 they have different police system, they are separate. They
25 are their own nation, let them be their own nation.

1 Thank you.

2 (Applause.)

3 MS. RAEL: Hello. My name is Kelly Rael; I'm from
4 Florence, Arizona, but after serving my time in the military
5 and after my husband retired 30 years in the military, we
6 chose this place out of the whole country to come live and
7 raise our family. This is truly God's country.

8 And as soon as I came here I saw the dysfunction of
9 our representation. Last year when businesses were being
10 forced to shut down, I reached out to our state
11 representatives, Arlando Teller and Myron Tsosie. I called
12 their office numerous times, sent numerous e-mails, no
13 response. I'm not even a business owner, but I could feel
14 the pain.

15 Out of desperation I created a BOLO alert for our
16 leadership "missing leadership." Because they were missing.
17 And I shared it on every Navajo Nation yard sale page, every
18 yard sale page in this area, and throughout the White
19 Mountain Apache Tribe.

20 In that, in the responses I saw that no one was
21 getting representation. It's very easy to sit on the Navajo
22 Nation and virtue signal (phonetic) but not do anything.

23 So I believe Sylvia's Allen proposed map is
24 adequate representation; it would make this area competitive
25 again.

1 If you want a point of reference to look at what
2 would make us communities of interest, the first place I
3 would start, looking at the DES office locations.
4 White River recently closed their offices, Show Low closed
5 their office, they moved it to Pinetop-Lakeside so it would
6 be fair for -- for people looking for work and looking for
7 assistance.

8 On the Navajo Nation they can go to Tuba City or
9 they can go to Flagstaff; and based on the data, a lot of
10 Natives are -- Navajo Natives are going to Flagstaff and
11 Tuba City for services.

12 Here at the Show Low office, they are seeing over
13 50 percent members from White Mountain Apache Tribes as
14 their clients.

15 Secondly, another point of reference would be
16 looking at the VA Medical Center the way they have their
17 maps laid out. Navajo Nation is part of Northern Arizona VA
18 medical program. Here in White River, San Carlos Apache
19 tribes, Payson, they are all out of the Phoenix VA tribe --
20 or, excuse me, Phoenix VA health center.

21 I believe that this would be a lot more
22 competitive. It's very disheartening to look at the voting
23 ballots and not seeing any conservative representatives
24 because there's no point. As Dave Peelman has said many
25 times "Jesus Christ couldn't even win LD-7 at this point."

1 I believe that we do deserve better representation,
2 we --

3 MS. CRANK: Time.

4 MS. RAEL: Okay. Thank you.

5 (Applause.)

6 COMMISSIONER LERNER: First of all, I want to just
7 say thank you to everybody for coming out on a Saturday
8 morning. It's a beautiful day; I'm sure there were a lot of
9 other things you could have done.

10 But we really appreciate you being here. We very
11 much appreciate hearing from you and want -- so I just
12 wanted to say thank you, this was a great morning.

13 As you've seen today, on our website we have some
14 easy-to-use tools for learning about and sharing information
15 about your communities of interest. We are all very
16 appreciative of the maps you all have been talking about,
17 clearly you have been sharing those. We would appreciate
18 all that kind of feedback from you.

19 Rather than relying purely on our interpretation of
20 your comments today, we encourage you to go online and
21 submit a map to us or provide any additional feedback that
22 you would like to. This will ensure we are correctly
23 understanding the definition of your community.

24 Please encourage your friends and neighbors to
25 share their thoughts as well. Anyone can do so online at

1 any time, there's no requirement to attend any one of these
2 meetings to be heard.

3 We are appreciative of you being here, but we also
4 want to make sure that you know we are not -- this is not
5 the end of hearing from you in terms of public comment.

6 So, again, I just want to say thank you very much
7 from myself and other Commissioners and our staff, and I
8 will now adjourn the meeting.

9 Thank you.

10 (Applause.)

11 (Whereupon the proceeding concludes at 11:45 a.m.)
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF ARIZONA)
) ss.
COUNTY OF MARICOPA)

BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings were taken before me, Angela Furniss Miller, Certified Reporter No. 50127, all done to the best of my skill and ability; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter reduced to print under my direction.

I CERTIFY that I am in no way related to any of the parties hereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome thereof.

I FURTHER CERTIFY that I have complied with the requirements set forth in ACJA 7-206. Dated at Litchfield Park, Arizona, this 17th of August, 2021.



Angela Furniss Miller, RPR, CR
CERTIFIED REPORTER (AZ50127)

* * *

I CERTIFY that Miller Certified Reporting, LLC, has complied with the requirements set forth in ACJA 7-201 and 7-206. Dated at LITCHFIELD PARK, Arizona, this 17th of August, 2021.



Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
Arizona RRF No. R1058