

THE STATE OF ARIZONA
INDEPENDENT REDISTRICTING COMMISSION

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF LISTENING TOUR PUBLIC MEETING

Flagstaff, Arizona

Tuba City, Arizona

Page, Arizona

Online via Webex

July 29, 2021

5:00 p.m.

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
PO Box 513, Litchfield Park, AZ 85340
(P) 623-975-7472 (F) 623-975-7462
www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

Reported By (via Webex):
Deborah Wilks, RPR
Certified Reporter (AZ 50849)

1 LISTENING TOUR PUBLIC MEETING, BEFORE THE
2 INDEPENDENT REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, convened at 5:00
3 p.m. on July 29, 2021, at NAU High Country Conference
4 Center, 201 West Butler Avenue, Flagstaff; with satellite
5 locations at Tuba City Chapter House, 220 West Main
6 Street, Tuba City; Page City Hall, 697 Vista Avenue,
7 Page; and online via Webex.

8
9 COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:

10 Ms. Erika Neuberg, Chairperson
11 Mr. Derrick Watchman, Vice Chairman (via Webex)
12 Ms. Shereen Lerner, Commissioner (via Webex)

13 STAFF PRESENT:

14 Ms. Loriandra Van Haren, Deputy Director
15 Ms. Valerie Neumann, Executive Assistant
16 Ms. Michele Crank, Public Information Officer
17 Mr. Shawn Summers, Ballard Spahr
18 Mr. Ryan Regula, Snell & Wilmer
19 Mr. Mark Flahan, Timmons Group
20 Mr. Parker Bradshaw, Timmons Group
21 Ms. Ivy Beller Sakansky, National Demographics Corp.

22 PUBLIC COMMENT SPEAKERS:

23 Matt Ryan, Flagstaff
24 Jeronimo Vasquez, Flagstaff
25 Judy Begay, Flagstaff
Patricia Horstman, Flagstaff
Tim Nuvangyaoma, Flagstaff
Robert O'Donnell, Flagstaff
Ann Heitland, Flagstaff
Charlene Nez, Tuba City
Lena Fowler, Flagstaff
Linda Guarino, Flagstaff
Levi Tappan, Page
Nelson Cody, Tuba City
Nancy Branham, Flagstaff

1 PUBLIC COMMENT SPEAKERS:

2 Larry Schuq, Flagstaff
Chris Rhode, Flagstaff
3 Jerry Nabours, Flagstaff
Lorenzo Gomez, Flagstaff
4 John Propster, Flagstaff
Monty Hutson, Flagstaff
5 Don Howard, Flagstaff
Joe Donaldson, Flagstaff
6 Charlie Silver, Flagstaff
Joan Harris, Flagstaff
7 Carl Taylor, Flagstaff
Kris Culbertson, Flagstaff
8 Jim McCarthy, Flagstaff
William Culbertson, Flagstaff
9 Laura Huenneke, Flagstaff
Marilyn Weissman, Flagstaff
10 Thomas Broderick, Flagstaff
John Moore, Flagstaff
11 Thomas Bianciotto, Flagstaff
Sallie Kladnik, Flagstaff
12 Becky Lewis, Flagstaff
Carl Slater, Flagstaff
13 JB DeWitt, Flagstaff
Rob Wilson, Flagstaff
14 Kara Kumon, Flagstaff
Richard Duran, Flagstaff
15 Gail Tobin, Flagstaff
Matthew Capably, Flagstaff
16 Jim Parks, Flagstaff

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

P R O C E E D I N G

1
2
3 MS. VAN HAREN: My name is Lori Van Haren. I
4 am the deputy director of the Independent Redistricting
5 Commission, and tonight we have several special guests
6 in attendance, the first of which is the mayor of
7 Flagstaff, Paul Deasy, and I would like to welcome him
8 up to make some opening comments.

9 Sorry, Mayor. I apologize. I have Supervisor
10 Begay is going to do the Pledge of Allegiance, and then
11 we will open it up.

12 (Pledge of Allegiance recited.)

13 MR. DEASY: Thank you, Supervisor.

14 Good evening, everyone. My name is Paul
15 Deasy, and I serve as the mayor of Flagstaff, and I
16 would like to welcome the Independent Redistricting
17 Commission, the IRC, to Flagstaff, and thank them for
18 scheduling a listening session in our city.

19 Arizona is one of the -- one of only ten
20 states in which an independent commission, instead of
21 the state legislature, has the primary responsibility
22 of redrawing legislative and congressional districts.
23 As such, the work of the Arizona IRC is incredibly
24 important and represents a unique opportunity for
25 Arizonans to share their values and concerns in shaping

1 how our districts are redrawn. The legislative and
2 congressional districts drawn by the IRC will be used
3 in state and federal elections for the next decade, and
4 it is critical that these districts respect communities
5 of interest, foster competitive elections, and are
6 compliant with the federal Voting Rights Act. Public
7 comments that you share tonight will help inform the
8 Commission of important values and concerns that they
9 need to be aware of when establishing district
10 boundaries.

11 Speaking on behalf of the Flagstaff city
12 council, it is very important, very important, that all
13 of the communities in the greater Flagstaff area be
14 placed in the same legislative and congressional
15 district. Residents of the greater Flagstaff area
16 experience the same challenges and utilize the same
17 resources, so it is critical that we have a united
18 voice when we go to the polls.

19 Additionally, the Flagstaff city council would
20 value Flagstaff being placed in a district with other
21 communities that share the same values and concerns.
22 Specifically, Flagstaff should share a district with
23 communities that value forest health and watershed
24 protection, shared healthcare resources, host Grand
25 Canyon tourists, are interested in growing

1 interconnected economies, investing in infrastructure,
2 and promoting workforce development, and value the
3 protection of state-shared revenues. Sharing a
4 district with such communities will allow us to more
5 effectively weigh in on these issues at the state and
6 federal legislatures.

7 Now the Independent Redistricting Commission
8 would like to hear from you. What are the important
9 issues and values you would like the Commission to keep
10 in mind?

11 I will turn it back to the IRC to begin the
12 public comment period. I just want to say briefly my
13 apologies for being unable to stay for the entirety of
14 this. It is my wife's birthday, and there may or may
15 not be a surprise party involved, so --

16 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Not anymore.

17 MR. DEASY: She's not watching, I'm hoping.
18 Thank you all for being here this evening, and for
19 sharing your perspective. Thank you.

20 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you, Mayor.

21 At this time we will now call the meeting to
22 order, and I'll turn it over to Chairwoman Neuberg.

23 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Hello, everybody. It's
24 an honor to be here. Before we dive into our agenda I
25 just want to give a special thank you to Coconino

1 County Chairman Matt Ryan and county manager Steve
2 Peru, and if I'm making a mistake with your name I
3 apologize, and Colleen Knaggs.

4 And with that, I'm just so honored and excited
5 to start our sixth public hearing. It's been
6 remarkable listening to all of our communities around
7 the state, and we're super excited to hear from you.

8 So with that we'll dive in with Agenda Item
9 Number 1, call to order. I now call to order the next
10 meeting of the listening tour of the Independent
11 Redistricting Commission. We would like to remind the
12 public that COVID-19 is still prevalent, and we ask
13 that you follow the Arizona Department of Health's
14 guidelines. If you are not fully vaccinated you should
15 wear a mask in a public space. If you would like to
16 participate from home, each of these meetings is being
17 streamed through Webex. Please note that if you'd like
18 to make a public comment you may do so by signing in
19 with staff and filling out the public comment card. If
20 you haven't already done so, please fill out the
21 community of interest survey. There is a QR code on
22 signs at the sign-in desk and on the public comment
23 cards that will direct you to the link. Please see a
24 member of staff if you have any questions.

25 Please know that this data is being considered

1 very seriously, and we care. We have an American Sign
2 Language interpreter joining us virtually, and we have
3 interpreters and headsets available for those in
4 attendance. We also have a transcriptionist who will
5 be transcribing every meeting. Please speak slowly and
6 clearly so we have a clear record of your input.

7 Will the interpreters in attendance introduce
8 themselves now?

9 THE INTERPRETER: Tiana. I am one of the
10 interpreters for ASL, and my team tonight is Tiffany
11 Jones.

12 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Thank you for joining
13 us.

14 MS. FOULER: Hello. I am also an interpreter
15 for Page. My name is Delores Fowler.

16 THE INTERPRETER: I'm here to interpret for
17 Spanish. Unfortunately, we had an equipment
18 malfunction, so if you need Spanish interpreting please
19 let me know. Thank you.

20 MR. BEGAY: Joe Begay, Navajo interpreter. If
21 you need translation I'll be sitting at the far end
22 over here. Just see me interpreting.

23 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Thank you. At this time
24 I believe I may be the only Commissioner this evening.
25 There are some conflicts in schedule. But it's a

1 remarkable honor. My name is Erika Neuberg. I
2 represent Maricopa County as an independent, but in
3 full disclosure I just want to say that my sister has
4 been a resident of Flagstaff for 37 years. This has
5 been my home away from home, and so truly I actually
6 feel kind of one of the people.

7 So with that, now we'll move to Agenda Item
8 Number 2, a presentation on the process.

9 First, a representative from our legal team,
10 Shawn, from Ballard Spahr.

11 MR. SUMMERS: Good evening, everyone. My name
12 is Shawn Summers. I'm one of the Commission's
13 attorneys. I'm from the firm of Ballard Spahr. I'm
14 joined tonight by my colleague, Ryan Regula, from the
15 firm of Snell & Wilmer.

16 And we're going to talk a little bit first
17 about what the Commission is, what it does, what we are
18 doing here tonight and what the next six months or so
19 are going to look like.

20 So let's start with the Constitution. Every
21 ten years the Constitution requires a census of the
22 whole country. As a result of that census, the number
23 of seats in Congress are reapportioned between the
24 states. You may remember a few weeks ago the
25 reapportionment came out, and Arizona did not gain a

1 seat. Some states gained seats; some states lost.
2 Arizona had nine the last ten years. It will have nine
3 the next ten years.

4 However, redrawing the districts within each
5 state to take account of changes in population is
6 something that's left to the states. From statehood in
7 1912 to the year 2000, Arizona did what pretty much
8 every state did then and what most states still do now,
9 and the legislature controlled redistricting. So the
10 state legislature drew its own districts, and it also
11 drew the congressional district for the U.S. Congress.

12 In 2000 that changed. The voters of Arizona
13 passed Prop 106, which amended the Arizona Constitution
14 to create an Independent Redistricting Commission. The
15 Commission is not static. It changes every ten years,
16 so every ten years in a year ending in 1, like 2021,
17 there has to be established a new Independent
18 Redistricting Commission to draw the lines for the next
19 ten years.

20 The Arizona Constitution has requirements
21 about how the Commission is made up. It requires there
22 be five members. No more than two of the members can
23 be from any one political party, and no more -- so
24 there will be basically two Republicans, two Democrats,
25 and then they will choose an Independent chairperson.

1 Of those original four, no more than two can reside in
2 the same county. So you can see on the screen the
3 current members of this decade's Redistricting
4 Commission. We have Chair Erika Neuberg here with us
5 tonight, who is the Independent, and then Derrick
6 Watchman and Shereen Lerner are the Democrats, and
7 David Mehle and Douglas York are the Republicans.

8 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: And, by the way,
9 Commissioners Watchman and Lerner are live virtually.

10 MR. SUMMERS: Great.

11 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Maybe when we introduce
12 ourselves we can go to them.

13 MR. SUMMERS: The Constitution also prescribes
14 six goals for the Independent Redistricting Commission
15 in redrawing the district. These are the things that
16 the Commission needs to take into account when it's
17 drawing. First, districts have to comply with the
18 U.S. Constitution and the federal Voting Rights Act.

19 Congressional districts shall have equal
20 population to the extent practicable, and state
21 legislative districts shall have equal population to
22 the extent practicable.

23 Districts should be geographically compact,
24 and they must be contiguous, to the extent practicable.

25 District boundaries shall respect communities

1 of interest to the extent practicable. That fourth
2 goal, communities of interest, is a big part of what
3 we're here tonight about, to hear from you about what
4 your communities of interest are.

5 To the extent practicable, district lines
6 shall use visible geographic features, city, town, and
7 county boundaries, and undivided census tracts.

8 And then, finally, to the extent practicable
9 competitive districts should be favored where to do so
10 would create no significant detriment to the other
11 goals.

12 So this is the timeline about what the rest of
13 the Commission's work is going to look like. July and
14 August is our listening tour, our first listening tour.
15 That's what we're doing now.

16 In August, we think August 16th, that's what
17 the Census Bureau has promised, the Census Bureau will
18 release the data. That's later than usual. The census
19 was delayed this year because of COVID-19. But in
20 mid-August we should get the census data, and that will
21 allow the Commission to beginning drawing maps.

22 In September the plan is that the Commission
23 will draw and adopt a grid map. A grid map is a map
24 that all it's meant to do is clear away the previous
25 map, the previous districts. The Commission has to

1 start from scratch every ten years, and the way they do
2 that is they create districts that are as compact as
3 possible, as contiguous, and of equal population. So
4 if you imagine a grid put over the state with different
5 boxes of equal population, but otherwise taking none of
6 the other factors into account, that's what the grid
7 map will look like.

8 After that the Commission will develop draft
9 maps and adopt an official draft map, so by adjusting
10 the grid map the Commission will create a draft map.

11 The Constitution then requires a 30-day,
12 minimum 30-day public comment period on that draft map.
13 Once that's done the Commission will revise the draft
14 map to take that commentary into account and adopt a
15 final plan. The final map we're hoping to have done at
16 the end of December.

17 So there are many opportunities for public
18 involvement throughout this process. First, all
19 Commission meetings by law are open to the public.
20 They are streamed online, and you can submit public
21 comments at irc.az.gov/public-meetings.

22 Then what we're here tonight to do, to get
23 initial input on your communities of interest, and
24 we'll talk a little bit more in a few minutes about
25 what a community of interest is, but that is what this

1 listening tour is really about.

2 And then, finally, before the draft maps are
3 submitted, once the -- or, sorry, before the draft map
4 is adopted and then after the Commission has begun
5 looking at some draft maps and even adopted one, we
6 have tools that we'll talk a little bit more about to
7 submit your own proposed draft maps, comment on
8 in-progress draft maps, submit proposed revisions and
9 comments to the draft map once it's adopted, and then
10 submit comments on the near-final maps later on in the
11 process.

12 So with that I will turn it over to Mark from
13 Timmons, our mapper, who will talk a little bit more
14 about the tools that we have put together to take
15 public input.

16 MR. FLAHAN: Hello, everyone. My name is Mark
17 Flahan from Timmons Group. I'm joined up here with Ivy
18 Beller Sakansky, who is our demographer from NDC, and
19 in our audience I have Parker Bradshaw from Timmons,
20 who is also our coordinator.

21 So what I want to talk to you guys about today
22 is some of the empowerment tools that we're putting in
23 your guys's hands to solicit feedback. The first tool
24 we have is a socioeconomic report. It's an interactive
25 web map that allows you to look at social and economic

1 data. And we'll go to another slide on it in just a
2 second.

3 The other two tools that we have for mapping
4 is community of interest survey, which is what we're
5 here to talk about today. So this allows you to go
6 online and submit your own community of interest survey
7 and even draw your own community's interest on a map,
8 so that way we can be as accurate to represent what you
9 are trying to tell us.

10 The last tool that we'll have is the
11 redistricting system, and that will allow you to draw
12 and submit your own proposed map changes.

13 So let's talk about the socioeconomic report
14 real quick. On the right side is a screenshot of it.
15 It is a web app that is up 24/7 that you can get to the
16 from the Commission's website. It takes in 14
17 different demographic points throughout the entire
18 state of Arizona. You see an acronym up there that
19 says CVAP. That is citizen voting age population. And
20 then we have some other demographics such as housing,
21 other languages at home, education, et cetera, so this
22 will allow you to start looking at that to put your
23 community interest of together.

24 The next tool we have and why we're here today
25 is talking about communities of interest. So we have

1 put the survey out there that's on the web, accessible
2 to you 24/7. You might have seen the QR codes when you
3 walked in today that allows you to scan it with your
4 phone and fill out the survey here on your phone or go
5 home and do it on your computer.

6 Part of the community interest survey is also,
7 like I said, allowing you to draw your own community of
8 interest on our map, so that way we can accurately
9 represent exactly what you are trying to tell us. So I
10 would encourage you to fill this out, either go home
11 tonight and fill it out or fill it out on your phone.
12 That way we can get all the information we need back.

13 The second thing is if you fill this out ahead
14 of time with these meetings I can actually bring up
15 your community of interest survey up on the screen so
16 everybody can see about the exact location you were
17 talking about, so some of the nice tools that we have
18 made for you guys.

19 And with that being said, I'm going to turn it
20 over to Ivy to talk about what is a community of
21 interest.

22 MS. BELLER SAKANSKY: Thank you, Mark.

23 So what is a community of interest? Seems to
24 be the topic of the evening. A community of interest
25 is a geographic area, people who share a common story

1 or connection. That connection can be common social
2 interests, shared demographic characteristics, similar
3 impacts from a legislative and/or congressional issue,
4 any other connection that leads people within a given
5 area to believe they would benefit from being kept
6 together in one legislative and/or congressional
7 district.

8 As you think about your community, think about
9 the factors that Mark listed on the community survey.
10 The survey said think about you and your neighbors. Do
11 you have similar jobs? Do you rely on similar public
12 services? Belong to the same neighborhood
13 associations? Are you impacted by some regional
14 environmental concern? Is your community defined by
15 similar regional land use issues, transit concerns,
16 languages spoken, community celebrations or traditions,
17 or other similar issues or characteristics? Any of
18 these characteristics could define a community of
19 interest.

20 Now it is your turn. As they travel the state
21 on this listening tour, the Commissioners very much
22 want to hear from you. What do you want the
23 Commissioners to consider as they draft and ultimately
24 adopt their maps? How do you define your community of
25 interest? Using the tools that Mark described and in

1 your testimonies this evening, we want to hear what
2 brings your community of interest together and what are
3 your community's geographic boundaries. Remember, the
4 Commissioners can incorporate your community into their
5 maps only if you let us know where your community is on
6 the map.

7 Thank you very much for being here tonight.
8 Now I will turn this back over to the Commission staff
9 to begin taking your comments.

10 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Before we move to the
11 next agenda item -- and, actually, I just want to make
12 a note. I believe Commissioners Lerner and Watchman
13 have joined. I do now see them through the link.

14 Hello. Can you please introduce yourselves?

15 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Nice to be here with
16 you, even virtually. My name is Shereen Lerner. I am
17 a Commissioner from Maricopa County and one of the
18 Democratic Commissioners. Thank you all for being
19 here.

20 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Hi, and thank you Madam
21 Chair.

22 Good evening, everybody. I am Derrick
23 Watchman. I am the Apache County Democratic
24 representative to the Commission, and it's good to see
25 everybody there. My apologies for not being there. I

1 just want to say that Flagstaff is my birthplace, and
2 so hopefully I'll get back there, but good evening to
3 everybody and (speaking in Native language). So I'm
4 looking forward to everybody's comments, and this will
5 be a great night.

6 So thank you, Madam Chair. Appreciate it.

7 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Great seeing you.

8 With that I will turn it over to staff to lay
9 some ground rules and begin the show.

10 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you, Chairwoman.

11 Citizens may only speak when recognized by the
12 Chair or the presiding officer of the meeting if the
13 chair is absent or has otherwise delegated hearing
14 administration authority.

15 In compliance with Arizona's Open Meeting Law,
16 speakers should confine their statements to the issue
17 on the posted agenda, which is before the Commission.

18 Speakers are also requested to limit their
19 comments to approximately three minutes.

20 Additionally, speakers are required to follow
21 proper decorum. Speakers must use appropriate
22 language. Foul and/or abusive language will not be
23 tolerated. Any speaker failing to follow proper
24 decorum or any other guidelines may be asked to leave.
25 Any breach of the peace or disruption of the Commission

1 public hearing may be the cause of report to law
2 enforcement, arrest, and prosecution.

3 If someone has expressed the same sentiment as
4 you, you do not need to speak in order to have your
5 comment recorded. As long as you have filled out the
6 survey your input will be received and considered by
7 the Commission. Everyone is welcome to speak, however,
8 should you choose to do so.

9 Opposing viewpoints may be expressed by the
10 citizens present. As a courtesy, citizens are reminded
11 to address your comments to the Chair and the
12 Commission and not to the audience present. Please
13 show respect for all speakers and avoid personal
14 comments. Remember, the Commission must hear all sides
15 of an issue to make an informed decision.

16 And with that I'll send it back over to
17 Chairwoman Neuberg.

18 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: And with that, we will
19 move into Agenda Item Number 3, what we're here for,
20 public comment.

21 Will staff please read the names of the first
22 speaker and the one in the queue?

23 MS. VAN HAREN: Yes. Chairwoman Neuberg, we
24 have Chairman Matt Ryan from the County Board of
25 Supervisors first, and then joining us virtually is

1 Supervisor Jeronimo Vasquez.

2 MR. RYAN: And be careful of the steps as you
3 walk up and down on this for those coming.

4 Good evening, Madam Chair, and members of the
5 Independent Redistricting Commission. As noted, my
6 name is Matt Ryan. I'm the chairman of the Coconino
7 County Board of supervisors, and we welcome you to
8 Coconino County, and some of our Northern Arizona
9 hospitality, and to some of you, welcome home.

10 It was a pleasure to offer comments a couple
11 of days ago in Sedona. Like the mayor, it was my
12 daughter's birthday that I stepped away from, but very
13 important reason.

14 This evening I'm joined by members of the
15 Coconino County Board of supervisors who will be
16 providing comments on some of our guiding principles we
17 ask for you to consider in your deliberations. While
18 these are not all the principles I read the other
19 night, our supervisors will in more detail provide the
20 following principles.

21 For regional economic development, which our
22 vice-chair, Lena Fowler, has been active in, she'll
23 provide District 5 -- she is from District 5, will be
24 commenting on that.

25 Indigenous nations provided comment by

1 supervisor, Judy Begay, District 4.

2 Rural nature of Coconino County, comments by
3 Supervisor Patrice Horstman, District 1.

4 And Supervisor Jeronimo Vasquez, District 2,
5 as noted, and he'll be attending virtually, will be
6 commenting on the diversity of Coconino County.
7 Supervisor Vasquez is traveling and so will be joining
8 us virtually.

9 In Sedona this week I expressed our strong
10 affinity with the Eastern Yavapai County, Verde Valley,
11 and Sedona. This evening we appreciate the opportunity
12 to express a similar affinity to the rural portions of
13 Coconino County, including our sovereign indigenous
14 nations which make up a large part of our tapestry of
15 our many cultures, as well as further elaborating on
16 our communities, economies, industries such as tourism,
17 ranching, and forestry, and the spectacular beauty of
18 Coconino County, which we are best known for.

19 The Coconino County Board of Supervisors
20 support and will be expressing comments on competitive
21 districts so voters have legitimate choices,
22 communities of interest which represent important
23 relationships to each other and our land, and, finally,
24 the tenets of the Voting Rights Act, which was pivotal
25 in removing barriers at state and local levels that

1 have prevented citizens in the past from exercising the
2 right to vote.

3 Thank you for your time and your service and
4 for listening to our citizens of Coconino County.

5 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

6 Our next speaker will be Jeronimo Vaquez, and
7 then Supervisor Judy Begay is after that.

8 MR. VASQUEZ: Good evening, everyone, Madam
9 Chairperson. My name is Jeronimo Vasquez. I am proud
10 to serve as Coconino County Supervisor from District 2.
11 I join my fellow board members, elected officials, and
12 members of the community in welcoming the Independent
13 Redistricting Commission and staff to Flagstaff as you
14 continue your efforts to perform one of the essential
15 functions for the state of Arizona. We welcome you
16 with open arms to Coconino County and its diverse
17 communities of interest and rich cultures that have
18 woven the fabric of this state and this nation and this
19 state for decades.

20 One of the most notable natural resources in
21 the world, the Grand Canyon, is located in Coconino
22 County, and one need to look no further than our logo
23 that references Arizona as the Grand Canyon State to
24 appreciate the importance of this resource. And, yet,
25 the Grand Canyon is only a piece of our Coconino County

1 fabric. Our fabric also consists of Hispanic and
2 African American communities of interest that may not
3 be as established as our Native American tribes but are
4 equally important. Hispanic and African American
5 individuals help the development of our county through
6 ranching, farming, and logging, to name a few
7 industries. All have been the subject of inequities in
8 Arizona's K-12 education system for many years. So,
9 too, have these communities been adversely and
10 disproportionately impacted by recent emergencies such
11 as COVID-19, wildfires, and flooding.

12 Of course, woven into every piece of fabric in
13 Coconino County is the background of the extremely
14 rural nature of many of our communities that, standing
15 alone, constitute a separate and important community of
16 interest. While rural Arizona lacks the population
17 base of the urban communities, this Commission must
18 respect and protect this important community.

19 In representing and managing these communities
20 of interest, the Cochise County Board of Supervisors
21 have fully embraced the principles of fundamental
22 fairness and rejected policies that may discriminate
23 against any constituency. I am proud to say that we
24 have done so not because of federal law, but because it
25 is the right thing to do. In the face of recent legal

1 rulings interpreting the Voting Rights Act, I ask this
2 Commission to abide by the same guiding principles.

3 While I appreciate the Commission's effort to
4 date and the daunting task that lies ahead for the
5 Commission, I would be remiss if I did not express
6 disappointment by your decision to conduct satellite
7 meetings in some communities, not failing to
8 effectively communicate the meeting details, and then
9 canceling some of these meetings entirely.

10 Unfortunately, this has had the effect of obstructing
11 or even denying some significant communities of
12 interest from participating in this process. It is my
13 hope that the Commission will improve its commitment
14 and outreach to ensure all communities of interest are
15 afforded an opportunity to gain -- to easily gain
16 access to this process. I would submit that this is
17 one of the core responsibilities of this Commission
18 that has not been achieved in Northern Arizona and
19 should be corrected.

20 In closing, it is my hope that this Commission
21 will recognize, respect, and protect Coconino County's
22 diverse communities of interest. The citizens of
23 Coconino County are deserving of legislative and
24 congressional districts that reflect the fabric of our
25 community and provide an opportunity for effective

1 representation. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Thank you.

3 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

4 The next speaker is Supervisor Judy Begay, and
5 then supervisor Patrice Norseman -- Horstman.

6 MS. BEGAY: Good evening, everyone. Glad
7 you're all here, making this a part of your evening and
8 making -- making sure that, you know, you're getting
9 educated in the redistricting process.

10 So Madam Chairman, members of the Independent
11 Redistricting Commission, thank you so much for coming
12 to Coconino County. My name is Judy Begay. (Speaking
13 in Native language.) I am originally from Coal Mine
14 Mesa, which is like 20 miles east of Tuba City. And
15 I'm really -- as a member of the Coconino County Board
16 of Supervisors, I'm proudly representing the eastern
17 portion of the Coconino County. My district includes
18 the great Navajo Nation, the great Hopi tribe,
19 Moenkopi, Forest Lakes, Mormon Lake, Country Club area
20 of Flagstaff, Arizona. It's a very rural area, but
21 also encompasses important areas of Flagstaff. My
22 constituent are farmers, ranchers, business owners,
23 educators, among others.

24 As you have heard from my fellow supervisors,
25 we are very proud of our history, culture, and

1 diversity of our country. Many families have lived on
2 and cared for this land for generations, especially our
3 Native Americans. The indigenous nations within the
4 Coconino County are the Hualapai tribe, Havasupai
5 tribe, Hopi tribe, Navajo Nation, Kaibab, Pauite tribe,
6 and San Juan Pauite tribes.

7 A good number of Native Americans reside in
8 Flagstaff, but many of our people live on their native
9 lands throughout the county. However, it must be noted
10 what an important role tribal commerce plays as an
11 economic driver for the cities and the towns of the
12 counties. Tribal members travel from their homes to
13 border cities for the purchase of goods, services,
14 recreation, and entertainment. Some of the tribes own
15 property in the county and some of the cities. They
16 all have a strong intergenerational connection to the
17 national monuments within our county. Many hold jobs
18 at those monuments as well as the border cities of
19 Williams, Flagstaff, and Page, where spending -- where
20 spending by tribal members is substantial.

21 Reflective of the county's value of
22 inclusiveness and diversity, we are proud of the
23 county, indigenous people's advisory county, and the
24 important work they have done for many years to
25 represent the constituency and communities of interest.

1 Finally, it's important that the Independent
2 Redistricting Commission understand the importance of
3 the voting block of the Native American communities.
4 It is essential that they may remain within the same
5 congressional district as Coconino County, as they are
6 an integral part of our community, and they have been
7 for years and will remain so for generations to come.

8 I again want to thank you for your attention,
9 and thank you again for your dedicated services to the
10 state of Arizona through the redistricting process.

11 (Speaking in Native language.)

12 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you so much.

13 The next speaker is Supervisor Horstman, and
14 after that is Supervisor Lena Fowler, who is the vice
15 chair.

16 MS. HORSTMAN: Good evening, Madam Chair,
17 members of the IRC, and our community. Thank you all
18 for being here this evening. My name is Patrice
19 Horstman. I serve as Coconino County Supervisor for
20 District 1. Thank you very much for your efforts in
21 gathering input, opinions, and suggestions as you
22 travel around our great state. The mission of the
23 Independent Redistricting Commission is to ensure
24 fundamental fairness, one person, one vote, and create
25 districts that are equal in population, and to also

1 ensure the communities of interest are maintained so
2 that the unique nature and common concerns of neighbors
3 are heard.

4 An important community of interest for us here
5 in Coconino County in Northern Arizona is the voice of
6 rural Arizona. As the second largest county in the
7 United States at over 18,000 square feet, we are larger
8 than several states on the northeast and larger than
9 the country of Switzerland. Our vast land mass
10 consists of 39 percent tribal nations, 27 percent
11 forest service, 12 percent -- 12 percent private land,
12 9 percent state land, and 7 percent other public lands,
13 and 5 percent land grants. Our ruralness not only
14 comes from this small percentage of private land as
15 compared to the public land here in Coconino County,
16 but it also comes from the history of farming,
17 ranching, and stewardship and our relationship to the
18 land that has forged Coconino County and Northern
19 Arizona, and this has created our identity and purpose
20 that must be maintained and heard in our largely urban
21 state.

22 Forestry also binds much of Arizona and
23 Coconino County together. Coconino National Forest is
24 home to the largest stand of Ponderosa pine trees in
25 the world. It covers over 1.8 million acres. While

1 the forest industry has certainly undergone massive
2 changes since the time where lumbering was Arizona's
3 first manufactured -- manufactured industry in the
4 1880s, efforts to balance forest restoration and
5 management for including sustainable harvesting while
6 preserving old growth forest and developing biomass
7 industries now exists through a collaborative effort
8 known as the Four Forest Restoration Initiative, or
9 4FRI. We have been very active here in Coconino County
10 and in Coconino National Forest in this 4FRI
11 initiative. The initiative spans 2.4 million acres
12 across the Apache-Sitgreaves, the Coconino, the Kaibab,
13 and the Tonto National Forest. It includes over 30
14 stakeholder groups. It is important that this forested
15 community of interest and its unique ecosystem be
16 maintained so that as a community we can shape our
17 futures together.

18 As I noted, ranching has also created our
19 identity here in Northern Arizona and Coconino County.
20 Cattle ranching in Arizona dates back to 1690 when the
21 first cows were introduced by the Spanish. There are
22 over 6,000 farms and ranches with cattle here in
23 Arizona, and here in Coconino County we are home to
24 many of them, the Bar T Bar, the Flying M, and others.

25 Groups like the Diablo Trust collaborate with

1 a variety of stakeholders to protect our open spaces
2 and wildlife by promoting research and responsible
3 grazing throughout our area. This type of
4 collaborative stewardship has resulted in over
5 100,000 acres of grassland being restored here.

6 Watershed -- now, watershed is a term that's
7 not typically used to discuss urban issues, but it's a
8 common topic here in Coconino County. A watershed is
9 an area of land that drains streams and waterfalls to a
10 common outlet. Our watersheds, now more than ever,
11 serve to connect us. Our changing climate and
12 landscape has brought us together to face some extreme
13 dangers. This has been brought by drought, wildland
14 fires, and of course now recently post wildfire
15 flooding. These dangers do not recognize county or
16 political boundaries. Earlier this summer the Rafael
17 fire started in Yavapai County. It quickly spread up
18 here to Coconino County where the Sycamore Canyon
19 watershed was threatened. The watershed serves
20 Flagstaff, Sedona, and the Verde Valley. We have
21 common interests in facing these challenges and shaping
22 our water management and water use.

23 There are also certain inequities and
24 challenges implicit in rural Coconino County. Now,
25 many of us choose to live in rural Coconino County,

1 including your sister, because we yearn for open
2 spaces, we yearn for endless blue skies and our tall
3 Ponderosa pines.

4 MS. VAN HAREN: Supervisor, that's time,
5 please.

6 MS. HORSTMAN: Very good. I want to just once
7 again say we are here, neighbors helping neighbors. We
8 are part of the same community of interest. Please
9 keep rural Arizona together. Thank you so much. I
10 appreciate your time.

11 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

12 And the next speaker is Tim, the chairman of
13 the Hopi tribe, followed by Robert O'Donnell.

14 That is the place to get the best view for the
15 camera, and that's where our Webex people are saying we
16 can see you better because the camera is set up right
17 there.

18 MR. NUVANGYAOMA: Good evening, Madam Chair,
19 members of the Independent Redistricting Commission
20 staff. My name is Timothy Nuvangyaoma. I serve as a
21 chairman of the board for the tribe. I do want to
22 thank you for the opportunity to have me provide a
23 statement on behalf of the Hopi people and for the
24 record.

25 First off, I am very pleased that the state of

1 Arizona has an Independent Redistricting Commission
2 which allows for a balanced approach to the important
3 work of redrawing the lines every ten years. It is our
4 hope this results in fair representation such that the
5 Voting Rights Act is no longer under assault, as this
6 places undue burden on Native Americans and people of
7 color. At the outset, the communities of interest for
8 the Hopi tribe is the entire Hopi reservation, within
9 which are our 13 villages, most of which predate the
10 establishment of the state of Arizona. This is the
11 place where our people continue to farm, ranch, hunt,
12 gather, and rely on the precious water from our
13 watershed. The majority of our workforce come from our
14 village, as do our students who attend preschool,
15 elementary, junior and senior high school located
16 within our communities. We enjoy one community college
17 locally, but most attend colleges off the reservation,
18 many here at Northern Arizona University. Many of our
19 Hopi and non-Hopi employees who work for our tribal
20 government, our schools, and our Hopi healthcare center
21 actually reside here in Flagstaff and in the city of
22 Winslow. Our communities of interest include Winslow,
23 where the Hopi Housing Authority has 73 housing units
24 on our trust property, all of which are occupied, as
25 well as Flagstaff, where we own several businesses.

1 Our people do the majority of their shopping in these
2 two municipalities.

3 Our community of interest includes the I-40
4 corridor as we own checkerboard lands between Winslow
5 and Flagstaff, most of which is used for our tribal
6 ranch operations. Lands are processed for some
7 commercial development on those lands, which will bring
8 our tribe much needed revenues.

9 Our communities of interest also include our
10 aboriginal lands surrounding our reservation. We
11 continue to use these lands for its many resources,
12 important to our religious and ceremonial traditions
13 which sustains our culture and traditional way of life.
14 We continue to make pilgrimages to the sacred sites of
15 our ancestors, such as Wupatki, Homolovi, Grand Canyon,
16 and so many more.

17 In conclusion, we do sincerely appreciate that
18 you take to heart our strong desire to keep our
19 communities of interest for the Hopi tribe intact.

20 (Speaking in Native language.)

21 MS. VAN HAREN: Our next speaker is Robert
22 O'Donnell, and then after is Ann Heitland.

23 And I'll just remind you make sure you're
24 speaking directly into the microphone, not just because
25 it's amplifying to us, but it's also being streamed

1 over Webex so that they can hear you as well. Thank
2 you.

3 MR. O'DONNELL: Redistricting Committee and
4 members and Chair, I am Robert O'Donnell, a ten-year
5 resident of Sedona in Yavapai County but could not make
6 that meeting in Yavapai County. I want to express my
7 concerns on ensuring that the realignment is done
8 fairly for residents and future candidates. Being a
9 member of Toastmasters International for over 37 years,
10 I have had to deal with the challenges of changing
11 boundaries when trying to balance geographic
12 breakdowns. Granted, that group is not concerned with
13 balancing population as you are required during this
14 process. However, it does have a similar geographic
15 concern as you do.

16 My area of concern is the constituents should
17 be in the same district as fellow local residents. If
18 a district is defined too geographically wide, it might
19 discourage voters from voting or expressing their
20 opinion because the candidate or representative may
21 actually come from an area not directly associated with
22 that rural area up here. Potential candidates also may
23 not decide to run because the geographic area may be
24 too many square miles to properly campaign across the
25 district.

1 The current alignment also breaks apart close
2 geographic areas. Granted, nothing can be done about
3 the county lines dividing areas such as Sedona and
4 Coconino and Yavapai counties, but why do we break
5 Flagstaff from Sedona? We have more in common with
6 them than northern Phoenix. Thus, if at all possible,
7 Flagstaff, the Verde Valley, and Prescott should all be
8 in the same district. If Flagstaff is needed to
9 balance the population distribution for the desert
10 areas, then it's better to keep Sedona with Prescott
11 than to include northern Phoenix in that district.
12 Rural communities can have much different challenges
13 than large cities such as Phoenix and thus should be
14 grouped together. Why should two families that live in
15 the same community be voting for different
16 representatives?

17 I thank you for your time and efforts and hope
18 you consider what I have said during your
19 deliberations.

20 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

21 The next speaker is Ann Heitland, followed by
22 Kerry Nugent.

23 MS. HEITLAND: Madam Chair, Commissioners, my
24 name is Ann Heitland. I'm a 26-year resident of
25 Flagstaff, but not the city of Flagstaff, greater

1 Flagstaff. I grew up in Iowa, and Flagstaff has many
2 of the characteristics of communities that I lived in
3 there. We help each other. We value and respect
4 nature. We believe supporting public education is
5 vital. Coconino is the second largest county in land
6 area in the continental U.S., but most of our
7 population is concentrated in the greater Flagstaff
8 area.

9 I'm here to talk specifically about my
10 neighborhood, which is one mile outside the city limits
11 of Flagstaff east of town, yet it's in a different
12 legislative district. We are surrounded on three sides
13 by LD6, but my little piece of Northern Arizona is in
14 LD7. We shop in Flagstaff. Before retirement I worked
15 in Flagstaff. We enjoy culture and recreational
16 activities in the city of Flagstaff, and many of our
17 friends live here. Forest trails that run behind our
18 home connect seamlessly with the Flagstaff urban trail
19 system. Yet, we're not part of that legislative
20 district. I ask you to do your darnedest to keep
21 communities like mine in the greater Flagstaff area
22 part of the same legislative district so that we can
23 share representation with our community of interest,
24 greater Flagstaff.

25 At the same time, I urge you to respect the

1 wishes of our Native Americans. On many issues from
2 preservation of public lands, the importance of the
3 Grand Canyon, cleaning up uranium mines, water, access
4 to broadband and transportation, greater Flagstaff
5 shares interests with our Native Americans and those
6 who live on sovereign lands far distant in the county
7 from Flagstaff. And, therefore, we are happy to have a
8 congressional district that encompasses all of the
9 county and extends to our sovereign neighbors to the
10 east.

11 I want to thank the Commissioners for the
12 difficult and important task that you are taking to
13 provide Arizona with fair and competitive districts
14 that will assure as much as practicable that Arizonans
15 have a voice in government. I look forward to meeting
16 with you again after census data and maps are
17 available. Thank you.

18 MS. VAN HAREN: Okay. Our next speaker is
19 Kerry Nugent, and then I'm going to send it over. I
20 believe we have a speaker in each one of our satellite
21 sites. And at this time we'll go ahead and send it
22 over to Val, who is in Page.

23 MS. NEUMANN: We're not quite ready yet,
24 please.

25 MS. VAN HAREN: Absolutely. Let's go ahead

1 and send it over to Tuba City.

2 Tuba City, we're having trouble hearing you.

3 MS. CRANK: Good evening, Vice Chair Watchman
4 and also Chairwoman Neuberg and Commissioner Lerner and
5 the listening public. My name is Michelle Crank, and I
6 work as the public information officer for the
7 Independent Redistricting Commission. (Speaking in
8 Native language.) And I know that introduction of
9 myself in Navajo is the proper format when I'm on my
10 Native lands.

11 So Madam Chair and listening public, I have
12 one speaker, Charlene Nez.

13 MS. NEZ: Good evening. I'm Charlene Nez. I
14 live in Tuba City, and thank you for welcoming us, the
15 Independent Redistricting Commission, and having the
16 public hearing and conducting the public hearing,
17 allowing us to express ourselves as well. I understand
18 it is a Constitutional passage legislation that allows
19 this redistricting to take place every ten years, and
20 based on the census from the 2020, which is last year.
21 I just want to just remind what we just went through
22 with the COVID-19 in 2020 and the effect that it had on
23 our Native people, in particular Navajo Nation and the
24 Hopi Nation as well, the impact it had in not allowing
25 the U.S. Census Bureau to hire very many census takers

1 and workers to make the census an appropriate number
2 and to make it take place in a good way or the
3 appropriate way as it should have been. In fact, I was
4 able to at least assist the census workers that I got
5 interviewed from, and the second census worker again
6 who interviewed me again.

7 And so when I look at the redistricting, which
8 is based on the census taken -- that was taken in 2020,
9 it doesn't really give a good, clear census count of
10 what our people are actually able to provide, and I
11 think to the extent possible that the Independent
12 Districting -- Redistricting Commission needs to take
13 that into consideration when you are redistricting your
14 lines that will be affecting Coconino, Apache, and
15 Navajo counties as well to include our indigenous
16 people as well. And that was my main concern that I
17 wanted to express here, and that's what I've been
18 feeling as well. And I'm glad we all made it through
19 here and we're still here, so be good about that and
20 remember your prayers as well. Thank you.

21 MS. VAN HAREN: Our next speaker is going to
22 be back here in Flagstaff, and it's supervisor Lena
23 Fowler, and then followed by Linda Guarino.

24 It's getting caught on my originals here.
25 Nice rain here. Drove in in the rain. It's really

1 nice with the rain. Welcome. You brought some more
2 rain with you. We really appreciate that into our vast
3 land here.

4 I'm Lena Fowler, Coconino County Supervisor.
5 (Speaking in Native language.) I'm the Coconino County
6 Supervisor for District 5, so my district starts about
7 68 miles from Flagstaff. My district is the only one
8 that does not touch Flagstaff, so in our second largest
9 county in the country, lower 48, we are a vast,
10 beautiful land with many national monuments. In our
11 economic region, economic development, we have a -- we
12 really value our land, our -- just the national
13 monuments that are within Coconino County. We have the
14 Grand Canyon and the 196 miles of the Colorado River,
15 where it's famous for its river communities that run
16 the river and all the river companies that are there.
17 Wupatki is right down the road. The -- the Walnut
18 Canyon, Sunset Crater, Paria Canyon and Vermilion
19 Cliffs National Monument, and of course that's where
20 The Wave is where it's very famous and very hard to get
21 a permit. Well, actually they made it easier now,
22 which we object to because it is our wilderness area.

23 As the county attracts many of these tourists
24 from around the world to these natural wonders, they
25 really boost -- they are the boosters of the drive for

1 our local communities. This is where ecotourism takes
2 place, the hiking, biking, hiking, the skis, running
3 the river, camping, and other -- many other activities.
4 The contribution to our local communities cannot be
5 underestimated. For example, in my district the city
6 of Page and the western Navajo really rely on Lake
7 Powell and the Antelope Canyon, the Slot Canyon there,
8 especially during the pandemic. You know, the canyons
9 were closed so what kept the economy going was the
10 lake. Now that the lake is low, it's the land, the
11 vast, beautiful canyons and the vastness of the land.
12 That's what's keeping the economy going and the area
13 now. The town of Tusayan, Williams, the Cameron,
14 they're all gateway into the Grand Canyon National
15 Park. These are -- and then in our -- as you listen to
16 the monuments, what do you think of, you know, when you
17 go out there? You want to relax. You sit back when
18 the sun goes down, and you look up, and what do you
19 see? The starry skies. It's dark skies. We value
20 dark skies. We value our natural beauty and our
21 region. We work to protect those natural beauties.
22 That is preserving our culture, the science. It's
23 protected for its education and the natural and the
24 historical and culture heritage, and it brings
25 wonderful --

1 MS. VAN HAREN: Supervisor, that's time.

2 MS. FOWLER: -- to our community, anyone that
3 comes to visit. What was that?

4 MS. VAN HAREN: The time limit has expired.

5 MS. FOWLER: Oh, okay. Here I wanted to make
6 a huge speech, and then say it in Navajo, also. No.
7 We want to make sure our towns and cities are kept
8 whole. We are -- we want to make sure they're kept
9 whole.

10 During the pandemic, you know, what really
11 came to service is just the broadband, the great
12 challenge. Students couldn't study. The communication
13 and just even the businesses just not being able to do
14 their business was because of the broadband, and the
15 students and, of course, the telemedicine.

16 And we want to make sure that we -- when we
17 talk about our economy we have to think about our
18 transportation, the ruralness of the roads, our dirt
19 roads, our forest roads. And, you know, our I-40 and
20 I-17, these are the -- these are the roads that are
21 workforce -- our workforce travel on, from outside the
22 county, like Verde Valley out from tribal lands, even
23 out from -- from Utah in our region.

24 So I just want to thank you for your time and
25 listening to us and being here. Thank you.

1 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Thank you. We
2 appreciate it.

3 MS. FOWLER: And hi, Derrick, out there
4 somewhere. He told me he wasn't coming. Thank you so
5 much. (Speaking in Native language.)

6 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

7 Our next speaker is Linda, and then I think
8 we're ready in Page after Linda Guarino.

9 MS. GUARINO: My name is Linda Guarino, and I
10 live in Doney Park, which is a community just outside
11 the Flagstaff city limits to the north and the east.
12 It is a collection of neighborhoods with different
13 names, but we all consider ourselves to be Doney
14 Parkers, and we have similar interests and concerns.
15 We have larger lots than the city folks, and we
16 appreciate the independent and sense of individuality
17 that that affords us, but yet we communicate through
18 Facebook and Next Door to organize parades, food truck
19 dinners, picnics, charitable events, and other
20 activities. When we need services, we look first for a
21 neighbor who does that type of work, contracting,
22 plumbing or other trades, just so that we can keep our
23 money within Doney Park to the extent possible.

24 But the one thing that we don't share is our
25 representation at state government. Half of us are in

1 LD6, and half of us are in LD7. As a result of this
2 our voices are diluted because we're speaking to two
3 different sets of legislatures. We need to all be
4 together so that our voice will be stronger and because
5 we will constitute a larger percentage of those
6 legislator's constituent, and that representation needs
7 to be the same as the city of Flagstaff. Although I
8 said that we try to keep some money to Doney Park,
9 virtually everything that we do is within the city
10 limits. All of our shopping is there, department
11 stores, grocery stores, big box stores. All of the
12 services that we get are there: doctors, hospitals,
13 libraries, everything else, as well as 80 percent of
14 the restaurants and almost all of the grocery -- almost
15 all of the gas stations.

16 It's sometimes frustrating for us that
17 decisions made by city government affect us
18 considerably, yet we have no voice because we can't
19 vote in city elections. The one thing that at least
20 half of us have is that we can direct our concerns to
21 the state legislators whose area covers Flagstaff, but
22 the other half of us don't even have that. And the
23 same is true for Fort Valley, which is a neighborhood
24 to the northwest of Flagstaff. If you drove up
25 Highway 180 you would think there was no difference

1 between the people who live to the east and the people
2 who live to the right of that highway, but yet one is
3 in LD6 and one is in LD7, and they have the same
4 relationship to Flagstaff that we do and have the same
5 frustrations with the fact that we're separated.

6 So please consider Doney Park, Fort Valley,
7 all of the other neighborhoods that I didn't mention
8 because that's not where I live, and Flagstaff as one
9 community of interest, because we are one community of
10 interest, and we need to have the same representation
11 at state government, and of course we want to keep
12 having the same representation at the federal
13 government. Thank you.

14 MS. VAN HAREN: At this time we will turn it
15 over to Val in Page.

16 MS. NEUMANN: Good evening. My name is
17 Valerie Neumann. I'm with the Independent
18 Redistricting Commission. I'm the executive assistant.
19 And we have one speaker located here in Page tonight,
20 Levi Tappan.

21 Levi.

22 MR. TAPPAN: Thank you. I've been doing so
23 many Zoom meetings I'm glad I wore my pants tonight.
24 Can you all hear me? Thank you for holding this
25 hearing. My name is Levi Tappan, a Page native.

1 We all make mistakes, but whether it was a
2 mistake or a change in population, the lines are not
3 working. But you really are doing yourself a
4 disservice by not visiting the top of the state. Page
5 and the tri cities have some of the most beautiful
6 areas of Arizona. The history, the geology, and the
7 rocks, the area is just breathtaking. More
8 importantly, when you redraw the lines, I really hope
9 you come in person, at least one more time before the
10 final lines are drawn.

11 Let's talk about LD7 for a minute. When I was
12 on city council, I sat for two hours in state Senator
13 Peshlakai's office begging for help with State
14 Highway 89. Part of the State Highway 89 that is in
15 LD7 goes through our town. But more importantly, it's
16 where people in our town are dying, are being killed in
17 car wrecks. Cameron, her hometown, has a beautiful big
18 roundabout and hundreds of flagpoles. LD7 is not
19 equally represented because the lines were drawn
20 incorrectly. LD7 has 20,000 fewer votes than LD17, and
21 that's not equality.

22 Let's get to CD1. I'm going keep in my time
23 here, so I'm getting close, that red light. CD1. When
24 Tom has a district from Page to Tucson, the top of the
25 state to the bottom of the state, it's hard for him to

1 go down and see all of his district. Now, my theatrics
2 lost my part. The only time we see him here is when he
3 has tribal issues. President Nez accepted \$600,000,000
4 from President Trump. Now, if we were equally
5 represented for CD1, then Page would have got
6 \$32,000,000 to help fight COVID. I think we got
7 \$1,000,000, so thanks, Tom.

8 So, again, I ask before you draw the final
9 lines you come visit the top of the state. We would be
10 happy to have a new congressional seat. But thank you
11 for your time, and go Sand Devils.

12 MS. NEUMANN: Thank you. And now we'll go
13 over to Tuba City.

14 MS. VAN HAREN: And, Tuba City, you're going
15 to have to unmute your mic again.

16 MS. CRANK: Can you hear me?

17 MS. VAN HAREN: Yes. Now we can. Thank you.

18 MS. CRANK: I have another speaker, Nelson
19 Cody.

20 MR. CODY: Good evening to you all from the
21 Arizona Independent Redistricting Commission. My name
22 is Nelson Cody. So I mostly primarily reside on the
23 southwestern portion of the Navajo Nation, and I spend
24 the majority of my money in Flagstaff. So I work on
25 the reservation full time, and I also own a small

1 business. Majority of my time, again, I spend on the
2 Navajo Nation versus the -- what I do with my money is
3 off the reservation. So I just want to also support
4 what was mentioned earlier about basically a lack of
5 resources for rural areas such as the Navajo Nation and
6 for the rest of the tribes. So I like to before the
7 pandemic travel to other reservations to expand my
8 knowledge about other indigenous groups, and so what I
9 see is a lack of resources as much as I see on the
10 Navajo reservation. And as a community planner for the
11 City of Tuba, I have to reach out -- when I can't get
12 the resources on the Navajo Nation I have to reach out
13 to the county, and I am not afraid to reach out to the
14 City of Flagstaff for resources and other -- when I say
15 resources I'm talking about skills and knowledge and
16 the aspect of urban planning. And because of the
17 situation of tribal leakage and lack of political
18 representation for such resources -- I don't want to
19 get into the history of the unfairness of how the
20 Navajo Nation and other tribes were, you know, taken
21 advantage of for their natural resources for the large
22 wealth of a few people that were non-Navajo, but we've
23 inherited the situation. And so I would like to just
24 really emphasize, you know, when you think about
25 redistricting that, you know, the word, I believe it

1 was retribution, to do what's right, to do what's fair,
2 for making up what was done wrong.

3 So I love the state of Arizona, and, you know,
4 this is our home, and we should all work together to
5 make it better, make it fair, and, you know, I'm a firm
6 believer of that, so -- and that's what I basically got
7 to say when you're talking about redistricting. And as
8 a sovereign nation we are separate. We're not
9 minorities. We're a nation within a nation, so give us
10 that respect, our due respect. Thank you.

11 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

12 I'll take it back to Flagstaff now. The next
13 speaker is Nancy Branham, and then followed by Larry I
14 think it's Schuq, Schuq.

15 MS. Branham: Hello, and thank you very much
16 for coming to our beautiful town. I'm here this
17 evening to talk about Flagstaff as a community of
18 interest. My name is Nancy Branham. My husband,
19 Frank, and I moved here over 30 years ago, and we are
20 vital members of the community, and we love living in
21 Flagstaff. I've been a licensed real estate broker
22 here in Flagstaff for over 30 years, which means I'm
23 very familiar with all of the neighborhoods here in
24 Flagstaff. I've watched Flagstaff grow and develop,
25 and I know the -- but most of all I've gotten to know

1 the diverse and amazing folks that make up our
2 community, healthcare workers, hospitality workers,
3 university employees, scientists, folks in the building
4 trades, and so much more.

5 In addition to my career as a successful real
6 estate professional, Frank and I owned one of
7 Flagstaff's iconic restaurants, The Cottage Place, for
8 over 22 years. That gave us a perspective on both our
9 tourism industry and the ups and downs of owning a
10 business in a small town.

11 Volunteer work has also been a mainstay for
12 me. My favorite is reading and tutoring to first
13 graders, but I also have mentored folks in a variety of
14 situations and been a board member at North Country
15 Healthcare Foundation, Northern Arizona Association of
16 Realtors, and also the Chamber of Commerce.

17 My life and time in Flagstaff is living proof
18 that we are truly a community of interest. Surrounded
19 by public lands, we are very definitely a geographic
20 area with shared interests, cultural, historical and
21 economic. Most of our state is rural, including much
22 of the land that is contiguous with Flagstaff.
23 Flagstaff is what holds our region together, and it
24 must be kept whole. We are not like Maricopa County.
25 We have one hospital. We have one university. We have

1 one shopping mall, one car dealership for every kind of
2 car, one school district, one airport, one symphony,
3 one historical museum, and one natural history museum.
4 Oh, but we do have five observatories because we're
5 known throughout the world for our dark skies.

6 You get the idea. Flagstaff is a community
7 where we live and where we do everything. Surrounding
8 smaller communities need to be included. Flagstaff is
9 their town as well. Kachina, Mountaineer, Forest
10 Highlands, Munds Park, Mormon Lake, Bellemont, Doney
11 Park, Parks, Grand Canyon, and Tusayan. They all come
12 here to dine, shop, work, recreate, and be entertained.

13 MS. VAN HAREN: Okay. Thank you. That's
14 time.

15 MS. BRANHAM: I sincerely thank each of you
16 for taking on the task of redistricting, and I know
17 that you will use the six constitutionally mandated
18 criteria to guide your work. Please take my words to
19 heart, and please keep Flagstaff and the surrounding
20 area whole.

21 MS. VAN HAREN: The next speaker is Larry
22 Schuq, and then Chris Rhode.

23 MR. SCHUQ: I'm Larry Schuq from the Williams,
24 Arizona, area. Thank you, Chairwoman Neuberg, and the
25 other commissioners for your hard work to draw

1 redistricting lines and allowing the opportunity for us
2 to speak. I'm a semi-retired business owner and feel
3 it is my duty as a citizen to do my patriotic duty as
4 involved in our city, state and country, as we are a
5 country of the people, by the people, for the people.

6 I'm concerned with the following -- following
7 the United States Voting Rights Act, which was not
8 followed in the previous redistricting process, is what
9 do we have in common with the southern portion of the
10 existing CD1. Districts should have equal population.
11 As it was mentioned earlier, there is some -- a couple
12 of districts that have got more and less by about
13 20,000 voters.

14 This district shall be compact as possible.
15 Just looking at the existing CD1 and how far it goes
16 down into the southern part of the state, it's a
17 screwed up mess. Being rural, we should not be divided
18 into counties and cities. We need to stay together and
19 as compact an area as possible. Thank you again for
20 hearing my concerns.

21 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

22 The next speaker is Chris Rhode, followed by
23 Jerry Nabours.

24 MR. RHODE: Good evening. Thank you for
25 giving me the chance to speak. My name is Chris Rhode.

1 If I look or my name sounds familiar, that's because I
2 previously worked with the Secretary of State's office
3 and actually was a liaison to this board before moving
4 up here to Flagstaff. As such I am a certified
5 elections official and worked in the 2020 election.

6 I would like to pitch the idea not for a
7 particular community of interest here around the
8 Flagstaff area, but for a principle that could be used
9 throughout the state, and that is school districts.
10 It's not one of the six criteria -- cities, counties,
11 and towns are -- but school districts are a focal point
12 of communities, both in rural areas and in urban areas.
13 It's a place where you become engrained with your
14 neighbor because that's where as a parent you have
15 events around schools through sports or other events
16 that schools are hosting. That's an actual literal
17 focal point that you can coalesce around in the
18 community. For the youngest voters who are age 18,
19 that is their literal community every day. They go to
20 school and create a community at their schools.

21 People also have a financial stake in school
22 districts because they pay into that as a taxing
23 district, so that's another way that those people that
24 are geographically similar can be coalesced around
25 them. They are also very clearly defined, so you don't

1 have to look at where does the ruralness of Coconino
2 County extend, where do people start using services
3 differently. There is a line drawn that you can use in
4 a very defined way, so it also makes it easier for
5 elections officials because they have to create ballot
6 styles depending on how many splits there are. That's
7 not one thing you have to constitutionally take a look
8 at, but I'm sure your county recorders would very much
9 like it if you give them less splits.

10 So as you're looking around the state in rural
11 areas and in urban areas when trying to consider what
12 constitutes a community of interest, I encourage you to
13 consider school districts. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: You know, I have a
15 follow-up question on that, and for my colleagues, you
16 know, participating feel -- you know, I don't see you,
17 but if you have questions please chime in.

18 When you mention school districts is there
19 anything that's not working for you now? Is it -- are
20 you satisfied with boundaries of the school districts?
21 Are there changes that you're hoping, you know --

22 MR. RHODE: Of the school districts or of the
23 current legislative and congressional districts?

24 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: You're asking us to pay
25 attention to the school district boundaries as we're

1 doing the redistricting, and so along those lines I'm
2 wondering if there is any inconsistencies or conflicts
3 that you're feeling exist right now.

4 MR. RHODE: None specifically. I just know
5 that as you create a map you'll have to draw defined
6 lines in places, and it will be very hard to draw those
7 lines in areas that are ambiguous, and this is a way
8 that gives you -- I believe gives you a guideline you
9 can already use that's clearly defined and represents
10 communities of interest.

11 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Okay. Excellent. Thank
12 you.

13 MS. VAN HAREN: The next speaker is Jerry
14 Nabours, and then Lorenzo Gomez.

15 MR. NABOURS: Hi. Welcome and thank you for
16 being here. My name is Jerry Nabours. I have lived in
17 Flagstaff for about 40 years, and I served for four
18 years as mayor of Flagstaff, from 2012 to 2016. And
19 talking about community of interest, I had a very
20 interesting experience in those four years. About 20
21 of the mayors -- and there are like 91 mayors in the
22 state of Arizona, and about 20 of us mayors got
23 together and formed a little organization because we
24 all had common interests, and these were the mayors
25 from north of Cordes Junction and from Holbrook to

1 Kingman. If you can picture a T that goes along I-40
2 and then down I-17, that was us, with cities in the
3 Verde Valley, Sedona, Prescott, Clarkdale. And we got
4 together regularly because we had common issues.

5 Now, excluded from our group, not because we
6 didn't want them, but because we just had very little
7 in common when it comes to city government, were the
8 tribal cities in the Hopi and the Navajo areas and
9 other tribal lands because they were not in the Arizona
10 League of Cities and Towns because they just operate
11 differently in their local governments. They had
12 different issues as like real property, the use and
13 ownership of real property, which was quite different
14 from what we dealt with almost every day. They had
15 unique issues. They were affected very differently by
16 state laws in a lot of respects. The state laws tell
17 us what cities can do and what they can't do, but they
18 didn't apply in the tribal lands. So they had their --
19 of course their own sovereignty. So what I learned was
20 that the tribal areas, the nations, should be kept
21 intact. You don't want to split them up. You don't
22 want to dilute them. As much as you can keep the
23 tribal lands together, I believe the more force they
24 will have. I know you have some geographic limitations
25 there, but I think that is a consideration. They have,

1 of course, the Inter Tribal Association of Arizona that
2 deals with unique issues to the tribal lands.

3 There was an article a couple of days in the
4 Arizona Republic about how the water infrastructure is
5 so bad on tribal lands, and so all of the tribal areas
6 are getting together and working on that, so getting
7 federal funding to try to --

8 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you. That's time.

9 MR. NABOURS: Let me real quickly say that we
10 learned that this group of us had very common
11 interests, and this is my point is if you can consider
12 something like this when you're drawing the lines, we
13 have major railroad lines and interstates north, south,
14 and east and west. We have forests. We have snow. We
15 have struggled to be heard against Maricopa County. We
16 are not Colorado River users. We have struggled to get
17 good jobs, and we had discussions about what incentives
18 can a rural small city offer, if any. So what we also
19 learned is that we didn't have --

20 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Please wrap up.

21 MR. NABOURS: -- anything to do with southern
22 Arizona or Phoenix. So if you can draw our CD1 line
23 east and west instead of north and south, we would very
24 much appreciate it.

25 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Thank you.

1 MS. VAN HAREN: The next speaker is Lorenzo
2 Gomez, followed by Vickie Parks.

3 MR. GOMEZ: Hello. My name is Lorenzo. I'm
4 20 years old, and I currently live in Flagstaff as an
5 NAU student. So I am here. I know that I am not
6 typically the demographic you would expect to see here,
7 but I wanted to be here today to give you an honest,
8 genuine statement about the importance of keeping
9 communities together and the importance of this
10 community to me.

11 But first and foremost, I would like to say
12 before I talk about my community of interest I think
13 that it is extremely important that we respect the
14 wishes of indigenous tribes and indigenous lands. As
15 we know, they have been severely mistreated for a
16 long -- for a long, long time, and the least we could
17 do is to respect their wishes when it comes to keeping
18 their very tight-knit culture together, communities
19 together.

20 So, yeah, my community of interest that I will
21 be talking about today is Sedona, Flagstaff, Verde
22 Valley, and also the Village of Oak Creek. And the
23 reason I will be talking about these is simply because
24 of how economically interdependent those communities
25 are. I know lots of people have already been saying

1 ecotourism is huge. I know that I'm not the only
2 person who has come to Flagstaff and then went down to
3 Sedona for the weekend to enjoy that. Plenty of people
4 come here because they want to see the beautiful sites
5 that Northern Arizona has to offer, and for that reason
6 all of these small towns and communities are extremely
7 important to be kept together because they all have
8 that same culturally rich feeling and basis that bring
9 them all together, if that makes sense.

10 On top of that, the workforce, regional
11 workforce, is all interdependent. You may live in
12 Sedona or work in Flagstaff or vice versa. Going off
13 of that, education, if you have a child that -- and you
14 work in a different town, you may need your child to go
15 to that town and go to school there to make it easier.
16 On top of that, transportation goes right into that.
17 For example, the Verde -- the Verde shuttle is paid for
18 by both the communities of Cottonwood and Sedona, and
19 it's used by the regional workforce. So, again,
20 another reason why these communities need to be kept
21 together. Right? Get my notes back up. Okay.

22 And, most importantly, like I said, these
23 areas are very culturally rich, arts, culture. They
24 make up a lot of what Northern Arizona is, and a lot of
25 that is due to indigenous -- indigenous tribes and

1 their culture that has continued to exist even as we
2 began to occupy their land. But what I'm trying to get
3 at is is that these like-minded communities need to be
4 kept together because in the end, regardless of party
5 politics, regardless of any of that, right, these
6 communities that are like-minded in their resource use
7 and in their values, at the end of the day they're
8 going to need the same basic necessities when it comes
9 down to it, regardless of any other thing, so --

10 MS. VAN HAREN: That's time.

11 MR. GOMEZ: -- it is important that we keep
12 these communities together, and I really appreciate all
13 the work you guys are doing.

14 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Thank you very much.

15 MS. VAN HAREN: The next speaker is Vickie
16 Parks, followed by John Propster.

17 The next speaker is John Propster, followed by
18 Monty Hutson.

19 MR. PROPSTER: Good evening. Good evening,
20 Chair and the Commissioners. My name is John Propster.
21 Five and a half years ago I retired and relocated to
22 Flagstaff and was attracted by the arts community.
23 I've been an active member of the theater community,
24 working with five different performing arts groups.
25 Through this work I've seen firsthand the impact that a

1 thriving arts environment can have on a community. I'm
2 here to give input to your important and long-daunting
3 task.

4 Tonight I want to speak to the mandate to
5 include a particular community of interest, the
6 performing arts of theater and film. These arts
7 contribute to the economy of Arizona overall.

8 According to a March 2018 study, Arizona arts and
9 culture industries contributed \$9,000,000,000 to the
10 state's economy, employed 90,000 Arizonans, who
11 contributed 4.9 billion in fiscal year 2015 and
12 contributed more to the state's economy than mining,
13 agriculture, and forestry. Mark Feldman, the chairman
14 of the Arizona Commission on the Arts, cited the
15 following three takeaways for the Arizona business
16 leaders and policymakers at the state and city level:
17 Arts and culture activities form a solid foundation for
18 key drivers in today's economy, namely creativity and
19 innovation, strengthening our economic resilience, and
20 helping us to prepare tomorrow's workforce. Arts and
21 culture organizations represent an important and
22 growing economic sector and contribute to Arizona's
23 significant tourism economy. And, finally, arts and
24 culture investments pay dividends to our tax base, our
25 businesses, and the quality of our lives.

1 Locally, the Arts and Economic Prosperity,
2 Economic Impact of the Nonprofit Arts and Sciences in
3 Flagstaff, published in September 2017, illustrate the
4 local impact of the arts. The nonprofit arts and
5 science sector generates over 4.6 million dollars in
6 city and county tax revenues each year. The City of
7 Flagstaff, which invests about \$500,000 in nonprofit
8 arts and sciences, and Coconino County, which invests
9 \$250,000, each realize a strong return.

10 The cities of Flagstaff, Sedona, and the
11 communities of Verde Valley have thriving, growing and
12 interlinked film venues. Flagstaff has many theatres
13 and live performance venues and shares audiences and
14 actors with Sedona. Sedona shares audiences, actors,
15 and programs with the Verde Valley performance venues
16 to the benefit of both. This establishes a common
17 culture and economic interest. If they are part of the
18 same district it would ensure that the theater and arts
19 communities would have an equitable voice.

20 Therefore, I ask that you consider this
21 community of interest when drawing the new maps and
22 include Flagstaff, Sedona, and the Verde Valley in the
23 same district. Thank you for your consideration.

24 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Thank you. I actually
25 have a follow-up just comment or suggestion. Please

1 make sure you submit your maps and your feedback
2 through the survey. When we think about our
3 communities, congressional district is roughly 800,000
4 plus, our legislative district is roughly about
5 242,000, and so when you're representing your
6 community, the arts community, please communicate to us
7 the boundaries of how you can best be represented.
8 Thank you.

9 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

10 The next speaker is Monty Hutson followed by
11 Don Howard.

12 MR. HUTSON: Thank you. Short here. Thank
13 you. I appreciate you guys coming here and allowing us
14 to speak with you and give our opinions and where we
15 come from. My name is Monty Hutson. I am a business
16 owner in the great town of Williams, Arizona, where we
17 identify ourselves when everybody comes to see us and
18 visit the Grand Canyon and they stop through Williams.

19 Everybody talks about being diverse. Well,
20 the first thing we need to talk about is being
21 Americans, and that's why we welcome everybody. People
22 come -- what we call flat landers, they come up to our
23 mountain up here, and they come to visit, and they say
24 we love it. You guys are different. Things are
25 different here. That's right. We are different.

1 We're Americans, and we welcome that.

2 A lot of people come up -- 85 percent of our
3 accidents and our deaths due to car accidents on
4 Highway 64 is from people coming from other counties,
5 other areas, other states. Then don't have the respect
6 that we have for our land and our people and where
7 we're at at this point in time. We welcome everybody.
8 We respect our visitors.

9 And when you guys go and do these maps, we
10 want you to understand that what we truly respect is
11 the culture that we actually live in. We're rural.
12 We're proud of that. We want to stay that way. It's
13 nothing against the other people. Cultures are created
14 by resource of people getting together, and what
15 destroys it more than anything and fast is when they
16 start talking about being so diverse. They talk about,
17 I'm this. I'm that. I come from here. I come from
18 there. Lily here doesn't know she's a German Shepherd
19 unless I tell her she is. She doesn't know that. She
20 just knows how to respond to me. You need to respond
21 to us. This is not a political ticket. This is not
22 for pandering. This is about the American people and
23 the Arizona way of life. We have to make the quality
24 of what we do outstanding, and we have to lead the way
25 before anybody else.

1 We, again, welcome you guys. You guys have a
2 tough job. I'm even going to say thank you to the
3 lawyers that are up there. You guys are very
4 articulate in the way you explain how this works.
5 Thank you.

6 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you.

7 MR. HUTSON: So, anyways, as a person from
8 Williams, as a great American, think about us as
9 Americans when you guys draw these lines. We have
10 differences in rural from city. We all respect that.
11 We just ask that you guys respect that when you guys
12 look at that.

13 So thank you very much for coming and giving
14 us the opportunity.

15 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

16 The next speaker is Don Howard, followed by
17 June Donaldson.

18 MR. HOWARD: Chair Neuberg and Commissioners,
19 all the staff that's all over Coconino County, thank
20 you very much for being here. My name is Don Howard,
21 and my specific community of interest is that of public
22 safety. I retired as a fire chief of the Summit Fire
23 District for -- I was fire chief for 35 years. Last
24 two and a half years before I retired we worked with
25 the City of Flagstaff Fire Department creating a joint

1 management agreement. As the Summit Fire District
2 grew, we started out on the east side of the San
3 Francisco Peaks, acquired and developed two additional
4 fire stations on the west side of the San Francisco
5 Peaks, with the city of Flagstaff in between us.
6 Together this joint management agreement brings us
7 together to help the entire greater Flagstaff
8 community, and I think it's proven to be very valuable
9 both to citizens in the city as well as the folks in
10 the fire districts on both sides of the San Francisco
11 Peaks.

12 Along those lines, in 1989 we started the
13 Ponderosa Fire Advisory Council, so that was with the
14 City of Flagstaff Fire Department, all the fire
15 districts that are in the area, including Sedona fire
16 district and all of the law enforcement agencies in the
17 area as well. It's proven to be a really valuable
18 organization, and I think it's one of the best
19 collaborations in terms of dealing with fire and EMS
20 that you can find almost anywhere. Recently the Slide
21 fire, Rafael fire, indicated how and shown how Sedona,
22 Yavapai County, Coconino County, all of the fire
23 departments up in greater Flagstaff area have all been
24 able to work together to make a difference and minimize
25 loss in our area.

1 One of the points that I wanted to make is
2 with the Sedona Fire District as well as with the
3 Summit Fire District they're represented by different
4 legislative districts, especially in the Summit Fire
5 District. Out on the east side of town we have LD6 and
6 LD7. They're little fingers that go into our district
7 where people that live on one side of the road are
8 represented by a different legislature than on the
9 other side of the road. This I think wastes some of
10 our time in the fire world, trying to deal with these
11 bills and legislation we have taking place on a yearly
12 basis, those issues that we want to address, as well as
13 the time of the legislators. Sometimes those
14 legislators --

15 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you. That's time.

16 MR. HOWARD: Thank you. Sometimes those
17 legislators have really, really different opinions on
18 things. The state legislature just passed a
19 \$100,000,000 deal with the wildland fire, our biggest
20 concern in this area, and we would like to have a real
21 coordinated effort in our ability (audio distortion).

22 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Thank you.

23 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

24 The next speaker is Joe Donaldson, followed by
25 Charlie Silver.

1 MR. DONALDSON: Good evening. My name is Joe
2 Donaldson, citizen of Flagstaff and Coconino County. I
3 have lived in Flagstaff for almost 80 years so I have
4 some history with Flagstaff. I want to say I'm glad to
5 listen to the young man from Williams that called us
6 Americans. That's one thing that's hard to do with
7 drawing maps is remember we are all Americans. That
8 includes all of the tribal nations and every community
9 north and south, all of us. I'm a former Flagstaff
10 Unified School District president and member and a
11 former mayor of the City of Flagstaff. I know you're
12 aware of how important drawing equitable, fair
13 congressional districting lines are to our state and to
14 our communities.

15 First, I thank you, Chairwoman Neuberg, and
16 Commissioners for giving us the opportunity to have
17 input to this critical process. Especially thank you
18 for taking on this process.

19 As a school board member and mayor, I quickly
20 learned how effectively to serve the folks who elected
21 me to represent their interests. I was besieged by
22 special interest groups who had the time and resources
23 to advocate for their issues. Special interest groups
24 are an important part of the political process, but
25 they are usually -- they usually don't speak for the

1 majority. The one group I saw that was obviously
2 underrepresented was a group of workers who contribute
3 the taxes to pay for the cost of decisions elected
4 officials make. This seems to be true except at
5 election time when it is then everyone's vote counts to
6 those seeking election. We as communities need to be
7 able to truly elect representatives who will be in
8 touch with the environments of the various and
9 different communities. The only way I see to
10 accomplish this feat is to have districts that
11 equitably and fairly represent the makeup of these
12 districts. Effective redistricting cannot resolve all
13 the issues at a political level. Representation begins
14 at the local level with the effective leadership in
15 tune with their communities. Fair and equitable
16 congressional districts give local leadership the tools
17 to address issues within their own communities.

18 I know you folks will do the best to draw
19 district lines that meet the different rules and
20 regulations you must follow and guidance you receive
21 from these outreach meetings. You won't be able to
22 make everyone happy with the final results. I also
23 learned in my role in the political leadership roles I
24 had no good deed goes unpunished.

25 MS. VAN HAREN: That's time.

1 MR. DONALDSON: Thank you for your time, and I
2 wish you the best.

3 MS. VAN HAREN: The next speaker is Charlie
4 Silver, followed by Joan Harris.

5 MR. SILVER: Good evening, IRC Commissioners
6 and staff. Thank you for being here tonight.

7 My name is Charlie Silver. I'm a 40-year
8 resident of Flagstaff. And I would like to start out
9 speaking to you on -- start out locally and then zoom
10 out a bit.

11 Major roadways such as I-40 and I-17 and Route
12 66 and state roads such as 89, 89A, 180, should not be
13 used to artificially bisect Flagstaff. The city of
14 Flagstaff needs to be kept whole. I would like to
15 suggest as a touch point for your reference for
16 Flagstaff Metropolitan Planning Organization when
17 looking at this area and what -- what the FMPO,
18 Flagstaff Metropolitan Planning Organization,
19 encompasses and includes, and I would also like to
20 suggest the Flagstaff metropolitan statistical area
21 with a 2019 population of 143,476 that compromises
22 Coconino County only. This primarily is greater
23 Flagstaff's community of interest.

24 I also support a regional community of
25 interest as including Flagstaff, Sedona, Village of Oak

1 Creek, and all of the Verde Valley. And, finally, we
2 are a rural area that should not include any part of
3 Maricopa County. Thank you.

4 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

5 The next speaker is Joan Harris, followed by
6 Carl Taylor.

7 MS. HARRIS: Good evening, Madam Chair and
8 Commissioners. I'm Joan Harris. My husband and I have
9 been residents of Flagstaff, the city of Flagstaff, for
10 18 years. Thank you. We thank you for taking on this
11 task of reapportioning our state in accordance with the
12 U.S. and Arizona state constitutions and allowing we,
13 the citizens, the opportunity to express our thoughts
14 and concerns about this process which will affect us
15 for the next ten years.

16 As you travel around the state gathering input
17 from various areas, I'm sure you're gaining an
18 understanding of the difficulties presented by the
19 large expanse of both CD1 and LD6, our home districts,
20 and LD4 and 7 as well. It's not just the size of these
21 districts that is daunting, but the difference in
22 communities of interest as well. The distances that
23 our representatives must travel to remain current with
24 constituent issues is an unreasonable burden on the
25 elected officials and limits the time that the citizens

1 of each area can be allotted. In addition, the factor
2 of travel in extreme weather conditions is often a
3 consideration. Although our current representatives
4 confront this Herculean task cheerfully and well, I
5 know that they and their constituents would be better
6 served by more compact and homogeneous districts.
7 Northern Arizona remains rural, while the southern end
8 of the congressional districts contains high density
9 areas that are intended to balance the total
10 population.

11 While the equality of population is a major
12 consideration, it should not be the only consideration
13 to the detriment of others such as the federal Voting
14 Rights Act, district shape, geographical features, and
15 potential competitiveness. Flagstaff provides a hub of
16 activity easily accessible to surrounding areas with no
17 need to travel great distances. Medical care,
18 education, shopping, entertainment, and employment
19 opportunities are all available. Right now our
20 district encompasses such diverse factors as the
21 sparsely populated Native American communities, high
22 population density areas in the south, small towns,
23 ranching, et cetera. There is no one community of
24 interest.

25 Again, let me express my sincere thanks to you

1 for volunteering your time and effort to listen to us,
2 the people who will be affected by your decisions for
3 the next ten years. I trust that you will make your
4 decisions based on the guidelines provided by the
5 U.S. Voting Rights Act, the Arizona Constitution, and
6 the best interests of the people of our region and the
7 state of Arizona. Thank you.

8 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

9 The next speaker is Carl Taylor, followed by
10 Kris Culbertson.

11 MR. TAYLOR: Well, good evening. Thank you
12 for coming. Most of what I wanted to say has been
13 said, but I will say that I was part of this very
14 process as county supervisor ten years ago, and I'm
15 very appreciative of what you're doing. There are lots
16 of interests involved.

17 I live about eight miles west of here, Fort
18 Valley. Fort Valley is interesting in that it's
19 bifurcated by 180, represented in two different
20 districts. But we consider ourselves part of
21 Flagstaff, as people in Bellemont do and so on, so I
22 would really like for you to cast a broad, broad
23 definition of what is Flagstaff and our community of
24 interest. We love this place. My district went from
25 here to Utah, but Flagstaff is definitely the center of

1 Northern Arizona, and we appreciate you recognizing
2 that, so thank you very much.

3 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

4 The next speaker is Kris Culbertson, followed
5 by Jim McCarthy.

6 MS. CULBERTSON: I want to start by thanking
7 the IRC, especially Chairwoman Neuberg, for this
8 opportunity today to give my statement regarding fair
9 redistricting. I understand this public hearing was a
10 big undertaking, and your time and efforts to make this
11 happen are greatly appreciated. Most of what I was
12 going to say has also been said so I'm going to keep it
13 short and sweet.

14 I live in Parks, which is about 18 miles
15 directly west of Flagstaff. I've lived in Northern
16 Arizona over 40 years. Twelve years I lived out on
17 Navajo Nation, and I lived -- had my two sons here in
18 Flagstaff and left Flagstaff to live in a more rural
19 area. And we are definitely a community, together,
20 like-minded, same, and community is important to me. I
21 want to see fair redistricting for Congressional
22 District 1 that includes Northern Arizona rural
23 communities only. That's what I would really like to
24 see. Right now parts of Phoenix and Tucson, it's
25 already been said, are part of our congressional

1 district, and I believe that our needs and our
2 interests don't resemble those communities. I think
3 they would agree as well. I would like to see the
4 Commission consider in December equal population when
5 districting and geographically compacting contiguous
6 districts. I feel like these were disregarded in 2010,
7 so I'm really -- I think because of the fact that we're
8 meeting today, you're open to that suggestion. And
9 thank you very much for your time. Appreciate it.

10 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

11 The next speaker is Jim McCarthy, followed by
12 William Culbertson.

13 MR. MCCARTHY: Thank you, Commission members,
14 for holding this meeting tonight. My name is Jim
15 McCarthy. I serve on the Flagstaff city council. I
16 have the distinction of being on the council longer
17 than any other person at this point. I'm also the
18 chair of the metro plan, which is the affectionate name
19 for the Flagstaff Metropolitan Planning Organization.
20 We concern ourselves with transportation issues for
21 this whole region.

22 I would also like to mention that in 1990 I
23 ran for state legislature, and I came within 56 votes
24 of winning. And in that election, one Democrat got
25 elected and one Republican got elected. So why do I

1 bring that up? I guess my experience of all these
2 years shows me that if we work together as community
3 members that that's the way we can get things done.

4 So my message is that, first of all, the
5 Flagstaff city council sent a letter in, and I trust
6 that you already have that or will have it. It was
7 signed by all of the Flagstaff city council members,
8 and I support the words in that letter, and my comments
9 tonight are consistent with that. The first thing is
10 we absolutely have to keep the Flagstaff region
11 together. I mean, splitting Flagstaff itself would be
12 absolutely unacceptable. What I would suggest is that
13 we -- that the Commission look at the specific
14 boundaries of the Metropolitan Planning Organization,
15 which is on the web. It's called the Flagstaff
16 Metropolitan Planning Organization, and roughly that
17 would go from Bellemont to Winona, east to west, and
18 then from the San Francisco Peaks to Kachina Village
19 and Mountainaire, and, of course, that would include
20 Doney Park.

21 So that is the Flagstaff community. It is
22 important that our community not be divided by
23 congressional or legislative district lines, so that's
24 my simple message: Keep the Flagstaff greater
25 community together. And I want to thank you for your

1 service on the Commission. Thank you.

2 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

3 Our next speaker is William Culbertson,
4 followed by Laura Huenneke.

5 MR. CULBERTSON: Chair Neuberg and members of
6 the Commission, I thank you for the opportunity and the
7 invitation to speak today regarding redistricting. I
8 am William Culbertson from Parks, CD1, LD6, and
9 Supervisory District 3. For those who don't know, and
10 it's already been said a little bit, Parks is a small
11 community, rural community, with Bellemont -- along the
12 40 with Bellemont to the east and Williams to the west.

13 I've been a resident of Coconino County and a
14 professor at Northern Arizona University for nearly
15 30 years, and more recently in full disclosure an
16 elected Republican precinct committeeman for Precinct
17 79 in Coconino County, and I speak today to voice my
18 concerns regarding the fair redistricting in which --
19 for the area in which I've lived for nearly 30 years,
20 and in Parks for nearly ten years.

21 In 2012 Mrs. Culbertson, who spoke just
22 recently, and I moved to Parks because we appreciate
23 the rural lifestyle of a small community. Our concerns
24 there in the small community are somewhat different
25 than those who dwell in large metropolitan areas such

1 as down in Maricopa County and part of Pima County.
2 And I speak today for the benefit of all in my area but
3 as well as the rest of the state, regardless of any
4 political affiliation. Our concerns are schools, first
5 responders, road maintenance, flood control, and forest
6 maintenance, among some others.

7 When we moved to Parks nearly ten years ago
8 the most recent redistricting lines were just put into
9 effect. I believe those 2012 former lines, the ones
10 that we're here to talk about changing, are no longer
11 appropriate due to the marked changes in the population
12 of our state and perhaps because the previous
13 Commission placed more emphasis on favoring the sixth
14 competitive mandate from the Constitution over the
15 other mandates than it did the first five mandates. I
16 think those of us who have recently looked at a map of
17 CD1, for instance, start going up the top and then work
18 our way down, and it reminds me a whole lot of what
19 they used to call a gerrymandered district back in late
20 19th century. If you remember, they call that a
21 gerrymander because it looked like a salamander. It
22 was all twisting and all around.

23 Specifically, the population of Maricopa and
24 Pima counties, not to mention that of our own Coconino
25 County, have grown immensely over just the last few

1 years. The result is a population with wide variance
2 in communities of interest pitting metropolitan
3 values --

4 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you. That's time.

5 MR. CULBERTSON: Oh, getting close to the end.
6 Let me it wrap it up by thanking you all for your
7 diligent work on the redistricting committee, and once
8 again thank you for letting me address it.

9 MS. VAN HAREN: The next speaker is Laura
10 Huenneke followed by Marilyn Weissman.

11 MS. HUENNEKE: Good evening, Commissioners.
12 My name is Laura Huenneke. I'm an environmental
13 scientist and retired from Northern Arizona University
14 here. I've lived just outside Flagstaff for 18 years.
15 I'm speaking tonight about a distinctive set of shared
16 interests here in Northern Arizona. The primary
17 feature of these interests is our social and economic
18 reliance on the natural environment based on
19 neighboring public lands, especially national park
20 units and national forests. There are two major
21 economic drivers here, tourism and our so-called
22 working landscape. Tourism, the millions of visitors
23 we have each year to Grand Canyon and the Red Rocks
24 district, supports thousands of jobs, billions in
25 spending, and many local businesses. Our working

1 landscapes are used for livestock ranching and forest
2 management, as you've already heard, and these are
3 relied upon for food production, recreation, and,
4 increasingly, renewable energy production. We also
5 partner with the Forest Service on forest health,
6 watershed protection, fire risks, so these landscapes
7 really shape our position on state and federal
8 policies.

9 Four quick examples of other issues where our
10 natural resource based region deserves its own
11 representation, one, dark skies protection in
12 Flagstaff, Sedona, Grand Canyon area. This isn't just
13 a tourist draw, but it also generates substantial
14 economic activity from major facilities in the region.
15 The state legislature really struggled with dark skies
16 and digital billboards a few years ago.

17 Second example, we depend on surface water and
18 ground water regional aquifers here, but we're not
19 located in any of the state's active groundwater
20 management areas for protection of those water
21 resources.

22 A third example, tourism, and the second home
23 markets here have produced the highest real estate
24 prices and highest cost of living in the state, so
25 local concerns about affordability, short-term rentals,

1 minimum living wage. Those sorts of issues are highly
2 relevant to discussions of state versus local
3 regulation.

4 A fourth example, climate change. Drought and
5 fire, like you've heard about, but also snow, very
6 central to our winter recreation and visitation, an
7 issue that's probably unique to this part of the state.

8 So not all rural regions are alike. Who might
9 we best be joined with? I think we share interests
10 with some of Verde Valley around river recreation
11 and --

12 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you. That's time.

13 MS. HUENNEKE: My sense is that Prescott and
14 Prescott Valley are very different from groundwater
15 management to real estate and wouldn't necessarily be a
16 good fit with us, and some Northern Arizona tribes have
17 similar interests, but you really need to hear that
18 from them. I hope you'll consider each tribal nation
19 as a unique entity.

20 In closing, thanks for listening, and thanks
21 for your hard work dealing with this issue.

22 MS. VAN HAREN: The next speaker is Marilyn
23 Weissman, followed by Thomas Broderick, and then
24 followed by John Moore.

25 MS. WEISSMAN: Madam Chair, Commissioners, and

1 staff, my name is Marilyn Weissman. I'm a 30-year
2 resident of that portion of Flagstaff that currently
3 lies in Legislative District 6, and I'm also a
4 long-time community activist here. Thank you for
5 giving us the opportunity to express our concerns about
6 how the Commission will use the new census for
7 establishing our new district lines. I understand that
8 one of the goals in creating these districts is to try
9 and keep communities in close proximity and with common
10 interests together. I hope you will consider creating
11 a district that keeps Flagstaff as a city and its
12 surrounding rural areas in the same district.
13 Currently the town is cut into two districts, and our
14 surrounding rural areas where folks come here to
15 Flagstaff to work and shop are also cut up. Please
16 consider also keeping our area of the Grand Canyon and
17 the Verde Valley together since we as Northern Arizona
18 tourist towns have much in common as we seek more local
19 control over our unaffordable housing, the
20 preponderance of vacation rentals, and environmental
21 and economic challenges.

22 Since the last redistricting, it feels as if
23 Flagstaff has had no representation in state
24 government. Every two years, even though we are the
25 largest city in LD6, we seem unable to elect someone to

1 represent our issues in the state legislature.
2 Oftentimes what we try to do here in Northern Arizona
3 the state laws prevent or try to overturn, whether it's
4 plastic bag bans, hiking minimum wages, mask mandates,
5 or creating affordable housing options. It's apparent
6 that our district is not competitive the way it is
7 currently configured. I'm asking you to try to remedy
8 the situation.

9 Some of you may not agree with the policies we
10 are working to enact up here. I respect the right of
11 the communities you live in to reflect your wishes as a
12 member of that community. It's apparent by the many
13 initiatives we have done here in the past that
14 Flagstaff wants a progressive future. Elections are
15 all about democracy and representation. I hope as a
16 sworn member of this Commission that your desire is to
17 strengthen democracy and the will of the people.
18 Please allow Flagstaff to participate in the future of
19 our state by giving us the possibility for
20 representation that reflects our values. Thank you.

21 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

22 The next speaker is Thomas Broderick, followed
23 by John Moore, followed by Thomas Bianciotto.

24 MR. BRODERICK: Good evening. Thanks to the
25 Commission for having us and listening to our input.

1 My name is Tom Broderick. I've lived in Flagstaff for
2 over 25 years, working full time and then declining
3 part time, and now I'm officially 98 percent retired.

4 I want to support the principle that
5 legislative districts, both U.S. and Arizona, should
6 reflect the makeup of the population. Arizona is
7 pretty evenly divided in electing Democratic and
8 Republican statewide candidates. The U.S.
9 Congressional District is pretty evenly split, also,
10 with the advantage to both major parties at different
11 times. The legislature is narrowly held by one major
12 party. The last two presidential elections were also
13 split between the major parties, so the work of the
14 last redistricting commission was successful in
15 reflecting the even split between candidates of the two
16 major parties, and I urge the current Commission to
17 repeat that outcome.

18 I also support the principle that Native
19 Americans and Hispanic communities are able to elect
20 their candidates from their communities to represent
21 them. This is easier in the Arizona legislature since
22 there are 30 districts there as opposed to none in the
23 Congress.

24 Finally, I think Flagstaff as a community of
25 interest should be linked with the Grand Canyon to the

1 north, and the Verde Valley, like Sedona and
2 Cottonwood, in the eastern part of Yavapai County.
3 There is a lot of commercial connection between these
4 communities, and there is a lot of people who live in
5 one part and work in the other part of that region.
6 The region has common interests in forest health. For
7 example, the recent Rafael fire affected both Flagstaff
8 and Sedona with smoke and evacuation warnings. This
9 region has tourism as a key economic driver through the
10 whole region. Medical care through this region uses
11 Northern Arizona healthcare facilities. Those
12 facilities are major employers in their communities and
13 throughout and through the region. Many of the smaller
14 communities, like Grand Canyon and Sedona, rely on
15 Flagstaff for shopping.

16 So that's my suggestion for a community of
17 interest, and it's rural and with some small cities, so
18 it shouldn't be combined with Phoenix area, as many
19 other people have said. We don't want to be part of
20 Phoenix. That's why we live here.

21 Thank you for your work as an independent
22 commission to provide districts that reflect the state
23 population. Thank you.

24 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

25 The next speaker is John Moore, followed by

1 Thomas Bianciotto, and then Sallie Kladnik.

2 MR. MOORE: Thank you. Thank you,
3 Commissioners, and Madam Chairwoman. I'm John Moore.
4 I'm from Williams, Arizona. For full disclosure, I am
5 a candidate for CD1, a representative.

6 My community of interest, of course, is
7 Williams, Arizona. We've quickly become one of the top
8 tourist destinations in Arizona. We have Bearizona.
9 We have the Grand Canyon Railway. We have Bill
10 Williams Mountain. We have several lakes and outdoor
11 activities, and we are considered the gateway to the
12 Grand Canyon. So I'm proud of Williams, but that's not
13 my purpose here tonight. I'll save that for the
14 Chamber of Commerce.

15 My purpose here tonight is to talk about the
16 district, LD6, which needs some improvement in their
17 lines over there. LD7 is not a part of my district,
18 but I have had some concerns with it.

19 CD1 kind of reminds me of a pizza that they
20 set down on a table with the big family, and one kid
21 took a bite out of the sausage part, and another took a
22 bite out of the cheese, and then somebody else ate the
23 pepperoni. I guess what I'm saying about that is it's
24 so irregular, as much as I've studied it for many, many
25 years and looked at it, I still don't even know where

1 it's all at. So I would like to see the rural areas of
2 Arizona that we talked about here tonight be taken into
3 consideration. I know that some of the suggestions
4 that have been made if we bring all of these northern
5 counties together, that may be good, but we have two
6 major cities in Northern Arizona. We have -- we have
7 Flagstaff. We have Prescott. We even have a pretty
8 good-sized city in Sedona. So if we bring all of those
9 under one umbrella, are we really making it a rural
10 district is the question I ask.

11 That's all I have here to say tonight. I want
12 to thank the Commission for doing it. I know you guys
13 have got a hard job ahead of you. Thank you very much.

14 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

15 Next speaker is Thomas Bianciotto, Sallie
16 Kladnik, and then followed by Becky Lewis.

17 MR. BIANCIOTTO: Hi. My name is Tom
18 Bianciotto, Flagstaff. I first moved here to attend
19 NAU in 2001 and have lived in town for 18 of the past
20 20 years. The only time I wasn't living here is when I
21 was living on the Zuni reservation in Mexico and
22 working for the Indian Health Services.

23 As a rural Arizonan my primary concern is that
24 the forthcoming maps will be drawn in such a manner so
25 as to make it easier for legislatures in Maricopa,

1 Pima, and Pinal counties to cast aside the common
2 interests of rural Arizona. Most urban legislatures
3 can't comprehend what we encounter on a daily basis.
4 In rural Arizona we rely more on our vehicles to
5 countless miles of interstate, state highways, and
6 county roads. Our local school districts, hospitals,
7 governmental entities, and private employers often
8 encounter great difficulty filling professional
9 positions such as teachers, nurse, doctor, engineer, or
10 attorney. Lastly, our economies are more dependant on
11 industries prone to greater market fluctuation. We
12 need as many rural legislatures as possible to meet the
13 unique needs of rural Arizona.

14 The best way to meet the contrasting needs of
15 both rural and urban Arizona is to begin the mapmaking
16 process by identifying our states most densely
17 populated residential areas. These areas are always
18 communities of shared interests, because residents live
19 in such close proximity. The most densely populated
20 locales within these areas, often consisting of
21 high-rise condominiums, apartments, townhomes, and
22 multifamily units, should serve as the center for these
23 urban districts. Boundaries should emanate outward
24 from the center so as to include other nearby densely
25 locales in the same districts. Creating densely

1 populated, compact, and small urban districts will
2 allow more land to be included in rural districts.

3 Here in rural Arizona our livelihood is
4 derived from the land itself, and we need as many
5 square miles of rural land under the control of rural
6 legislatures as possible. Even sparsely populated and
7 uninhabitable lands have great social and economic
8 value. We like to hunt, hike, bike, fish, and ATV in
9 these rural lands. These lands are an essential
10 component of our local economies.

11 Please draw as many densely populated,
12 compact, and small districts as possible. Doing so
13 will create the greatest number of communities of
14 shared interest throughout the state and give rural
15 Arizona more equitable legislative representation.
16 Thank you.

17 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

18 Our next speaker is Sallie Kladnik, followed
19 by Becky Lewis, followed by Carl Slater.

20 MS. KLADNIK: I am echoing a lot of my friends
21 and colleagues comments so I will be brief, but I do
22 support keeping the greater Flagstaff area in one
23 district, especially looking at the LD6 and LD7 split,
24 which splits our -- our community of interest. And it
25 should also include, in my opinion, Sedona, Oak Creek,

1 and Verde Valley, but particularly the greater
2 Flagstaff area needs to be one community of interest
3 and makes us more competitive to get representation in
4 the legislature that reflects our values. Thank you.

5 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

6 The next speaker is Becky Lewis, followed by
7 Carl Slater, followed by JB DeWitt.

8 MS. LEWIS: Thank you for being here. I know
9 it's been a long night. I just want to highlight one
10 area that's been referenced a few times. In Fort
11 Valley, for 22 years I lived off of Mount Elden Lookout
12 Road, which comes off of Schultz Pass Road, which
13 intersects with 180, which I'm sure you know of, and it
14 intersects at the last stoplight that kinds of leaves
15 the Flagstaff area. My family and everyone off of
16 Mount Elden Lookout Road basically works in Flagstaff.
17 Our kids go to school in Flagstaff. We dine, we shop,
18 we do everything in Flagstaff, but we are part of LD7,
19 so it seems like a very odd carving out. I know some
20 of that is a numbers game, but I'm hoping that with
21 this new redistricting it can be one district together
22 with either LD6 or however you want to call it, but
23 that it's one district and part of the greater
24 Flagstaff community. Thank you.

25 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

1 Our next speaker is Carl Slater, followed by
2 JB DeWitt, followed by Rob Wilson.

3 MR. SLATER: Good evening. Is it loud enough?
4 Good evening. My name is Cart Slater, and I'm a Navajo
5 Nation council delegate representing five chapters in
6 northern central agency about 200 miles away from here,
7 so many of my citizens also live in this area for
8 temporary periods of time or extended periods of time.
9 (Speaking in Native language.)

10 I have three requests for you, and the first
11 one is going to come about these meetings, how they're
12 organized and the communication with the citizens that
13 are affected by the decisions you'll be making. There
14 are the satellite locations that are organized
15 presently, but I know there is miscommunication and
16 confusion about whether they would be open. That also
17 includes I think the Chinle site that's been organized
18 for tomorrow. So my sincere request is that you
19 communicate as far in advance with our mutual citizens
20 to ensure that they're able to participate in this
21 process and hear what other citizens are communicating
22 to you all. I think that's very important, and I
23 appreciate the outreach, but it does need to be
24 increased. Thank you very much to the Commission on
25 that point.

1 Second, please respect the special political
2 relationships that many citizens within Arizona have
3 with the sovereign state of Arizona and their sovereign
4 tribes. That special political relationship really
5 needs to be taken into consideration. In addition to
6 having shared cultural, educational, and infrastructure
7 needs on the Navajo Nation, we have certain obligations
8 that we have to the land, that the state of Arizona has
9 to us, and that the federal government has to us, and
10 because of that we deserve to have representation both
11 in DC and Phoenix that takes into account, understands
12 our experiences, and can reflect them adequately in
13 both of those venues, so please take into account that
14 special political relationship.

15 And, lastly, I think that the unique geography
16 and the political organizations of the citizens that
17 you are taking into account needs to be considered. So
18 it was mentioned earlier about our water resources. On
19 the Navajo Nation in Northern Arizona we've been
20 blessed with moisture recently. That sacred moisture
21 is what allows us to continue living on this land, and
22 that stewardship in the 21st century with respect to
23 climate change is something that needs to be taken into
24 consideration. What are the obligations that the
25 Navajo people and the federal government have to each

1 other and to the state of Arizona to support economic
2 development, mutual prosperity, and the stewardship of
3 our water resources? That interconnection among
4 tribes, among sovereigns, and between say the city of
5 Flagstaff and LD6 and LD7 over on the Navajo Nation is
6 very important.

7 So thank you for listening to my concerns. I
8 think that if you take them into account and listen
9 adequately to the citizens of the Navajo Nation and
10 other federally recognized American Indian tribes in
11 the state of Arizona, you'll maximize Democratic
12 participation, and build a more prosperous Arizona, so
13 thank you.

14 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

15 The next speaker is JB DeWitt, followed by Rob
16 Wilson, followed by Kara Kumon.

17 MR. DEWITT: Hi. My name is JB DeWitt. I'm a
18 small business owner here in Flagstaff, and I'm here
19 representing the Sunnyside Neighborhood Association of
20 Flagstaff. We feel that it is extremely important this
21 Commission take into account communities of interest,
22 that cities and communities and neighborhoods are held
23 whole, which serves to be sure that the people of these
24 communities are represented, and that means districts
25 that will allow our representatives to actually be

1 representatives for us, of us. If Sunnyside or
2 Flagstaff are split between districts, we will be
3 unable to be properly represented on issues that are
4 very specific to us, such as housing inflation and
5 rental prices, small business, dominant minority groups
6 within Sunnyside and Flagstaff area, and education. We
7 also feel that the census has been undercounted, and
8 that we, we should be asking the governor to call on
9 our federal government for a census recount.

10 Finally, we appreciate the strong stance that
11 our mayor and city council have taken. We support them
12 on this and wish to thank them for continuing to
13 advocate for us. Thank you.

14 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

15 The next speaker is Rob Wilson, followed by
16 Kara Kumon, followed by Tom Pearson.

17 MR. WILSON: Thank you, Chairwoman Neuberg,
18 for -- and the other Commissioners here today for this
19 opportunity to address you. Public input to this
20 process is exactly what I believe the voters wanted
21 when they passed Proposition 106, so we appreciate this
22 community.

23 My name is Rob Wilson. I'm a resident here of
24 Doney Park -- you heard of that earlier -- northwest --
25 or northeast of the city. Excuse me. And I have a

1 somewhat unique understanding of the responsibilities
2 that you face here because I, too, applied to be on
3 this Commission, and congratulations to Chairwoman
4 Neuberg. Good luck.

5 I'm currently the co-chair of an area plan
6 rewrite committee, and this has provided me an
7 opportunity to interface with many of my rural
8 neighbors, to better understand what they value about
9 our neighborhoods. Their number one priority has been
10 maintaining the rural character of our communities.
11 They don't want new roads, new commercial buildings, or
12 higher density. We share those desires with other
13 rural parts of Arizona, along with things like
14 maintaining open space, the threat of fires and
15 flooding, and the high percentages of our communities
16 that are owned by federal and state governments.
17 Issues we don't have are things like where to build the
18 next expressway, where the next high-rise building
19 should go, or other urban challenges. What this means
20 is we need to -- we need and deserve to have
21 representatives that understand the unique nature of
22 rural Arizona and are committed to preserving it. We
23 want representatives that will help us protect our dark
24 skies, our rural community character, and the real
25 neighborhoods that we cherish so much.

1 So I have a couple of points to make. Knowing
2 that you'll be creating congressional districts with
3 equal populations, I would encourage you to do exactly
4 the same with our legislative districts. Equal
5 population means equal representation, and that's a
6 foundational part of our government system.

7 Competitiveness is less important even by law than
8 communities of interest. A community of interest
9 demands equal representation, and that can't happen
10 when competitiveness is the priority. In my opinion,
11 when you introduce competitiveness your difficult or
12 already difficult job becomes pretty much impossible.

13 I propose LD6 be comprised of Coconino,
14 southern Navajo, southern Apache, Graham-Greenlee, and
15 Gila counties. These are generally communities of
16 interest and deserve to be represented as such. LD7
17 should then combine the Navajo -- excuse me, the Native
18 nations in those same counties into one district,
19 assuring voices of all are heard fairly.

20 I think we can all agree, apparently everyone
21 here agrees, that CD1 was done poorly, so it's nice to
22 have unanimous consents on something here. A long,
23 meandering district made up of both rural and urban
24 areas provides huge challenges not just to anyone
25 running for election, but equally so for the

1 constituents. CD1 needs to be fixed, and Northern
2 Arizona would be the correct solution for that, I
3 believe. Clear communities of interest deserve
4 representation of issues that reflect -- that affect
5 them.

6 Thank you again for your personal commitments
7 to this process and your time this evening. Chairwoman
8 Neuberg, as the only independent I would suggest we
9 talk a lot about the left, the right, the Republicans
10 and the Democrats, but the Independents should have
11 just as loud a voice as anyone else, and so I
12 appreciate your efforts to make that voice heard.

13 And just as a side note, I know the technical
14 difficulties are widespread, but the PowerPoints that
15 you're showing here today, nobody in the room here can
16 see those. The text is just too small. It's -- you're
17 trying to put too much on one screen, so maybe in the
18 future that could be changed. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Thank you.

20 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

21 The next speaker is Kara Kumon, followed by
22 Tom Pearson, and then followed by Laura Kessler.

23 MS. KUMON: Hi. My name is Kara, and I've
24 lived in Arizona for 18 years and in Flagstaff for 10.
25 I would like to advocate for bringing together the

1 greater Flagstaff area and to also combine with the
2 greater Sedona area for a presentation. This will
3 include crossing county lines, which I think is
4 necessary and important to keep this community of
5 interest whole.

6 To illustrate, I'm an ambassador for a local
7 hiking group for families with young children, and we
8 are a combined Flagstaff/Sedona branch because we
9 realize how much recreation crossover there is between
10 the two cities. I love taking my kids down to Oak
11 Creek to splash around, and a lot of families come up
12 to hike Mount Elden or Humphries and other activities.
13 We also as a group answer questions from families
14 coming from out of town for outdoor adventure in our
15 region. We host and facilitate tourism in a collective
16 way.

17 I am proud of Arizona for having an
18 independent redistricting process. I look forward to
19 seeing the results representing the great diversity of
20 our state, and providing Flagstaff and Sedona a united
21 voice at our state legislature and in Congress. Thank
22 you for your time.

23 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

24 Our next speaker is Tom Pearson, followed by
25 Laura Kessler, followed by Richard Duncan.

1 It doesn't look like Tom Pearson is here, so
2 let's go ahead and move on to Laura Kessler.

3 Is there Richard Duncan here? I'm sorry.
4 Richard Duran, yes. And Richard will be followed by
5 Gail Tobin.

6 MR. DURAN: Thank you for your time here
7 tonight. Much of what I had to say has already been
8 said, but there is some concerns that I wanted to have
9 brought up. One of those concerns is that the people
10 who live in Flagstaff came from multiple different
11 neighborhoods throughout Flagstaff. My grandparents
12 were born and raised in (audio distortion) area, and
13 now I currently live in the Sunnyside area when they
14 moved. They worked (audio distortion) so these three
15 neighborhoods have a lot in common, and mostly it's
16 Hispanic people. These Hispanic people throughout
17 history have had a hard time getting their voices heard
18 due to just the language barrier, so by keeping these
19 neighborhoods together it would allow us to have one
20 voice for all the neighborhoods and would allow us to
21 have our voices heard. Thank you.

22 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

23 The next and final three speakers are Gail
24 Tobin, Matthew Capalby, and Jim Parks.

25 MS. TOBIN: Good evening, Madam Commissioner,

1 and I appreciate your time in coming up here to visit
2 with us and get our opinions on what's going on. So
3 many times rural communities are kind of left out. My
4 name is Gail Tobin, a resident of Parks, Arizona, a
5 small community to the west of here. My husband and I
6 have had both ranching and construction interests over
7 the years, and we're 40-year residents of this area.
8 Actually, my husband more than 40 years. And we have a
9 huge concern in the fact of seeing rural Arizona being
10 better represented in a more cohesive manner, and CD1
11 is a crazy mess and should be definitely redrawn to a
12 more fair proportion.

13 My concern is that the rural community is a
14 community of interest and not all the time is that
15 fairly represented. The districts don't represent
16 that. In the past that criteria has not been entirely
17 followed. I hope the Commission also realizes that
18 those of us that came here tonight are just the tip of
19 the iceberg. There are many who are not able to attend
20 and feel the same way as so many of us have stated
21 tonight.

22 Thank you for your kind attention time and
23 effort. Have a good evening.

24 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

25 The last two speakers will be Matthew Capalby

1 and Jim Parks.

2 MR. CAPALBY: Good evening, Commissioners. My
3 name is Matthew Capably, and I hope you're doing all
4 right as you've been sitting through this very long
5 process.

6 Again, my name is Matthew Capably. I'm a
7 third-generation Arizonan, originally from Mohave
8 County, and have been residing here in Flagstaff almost
9 20 years. I had a lot of dealings ten years ago, and I
10 want to speak to former Mayor Nabours' points that he
11 made. I worked very diligently with a lot of the rural
12 mayors and supervisors and elected officials in the
13 tribes ten years ago when we came to the realization
14 that we had enough population for two rural
15 congressional districts that weren't sliced up like a
16 pie that went into either the Phoenix or the Tucson
17 areas. For years Phoenix -- or, I'm sorry, Flagstaff
18 was represented by Scottsdale. Kingman used to be
19 represented by Glendale. And it just didn't work.
20 Because that's where the population was, that was the
21 interest. So we wanted two solely congressional rural
22 districts, and we were able to get those. They're, of
23 course, very large in their configuration, but that's
24 for a reason, because they are rural districts. They
25 do not go into the Phoenix metropolitan or Tucson

1 metropolitan areas. We want to maintain that, not just
2 one rural congressional district, but two.

3 And then we also had a very concerted effort
4 on the legislative districts where we wanted nine
5 solely rural legislative districts, and we were able to
6 accomplish that. And, again, that was a consensus
7 among Republican and Democratic elected officials. The
8 enemy was not the partisan makeup, the Republicans and
9 Democrats. The enemy was MAG, the Maricopa Association
10 of Governments, as probably the supervisors and others
11 can speak to, because of the resources that were being
12 sucked up by the urban areas and not allocated
13 adequately because of poor representation in the rural
14 areas.

15 And the other issue is competitiveness. There
16 is a political reality to the fact when you have a
17 competitive district you're not taken for granted. The
18 business community really came out strongly, oddly
19 enough, ten years ago to speak to the interests of CD1.
20 And, well, at the time LD6 was considered competitive
21 as well because it mattered about resources. When
22 you're in a competitive district, and we've seen CD1
23 change hands over the years, you get attention from
24 legislatures and congressional members because you're
25 on that bubble. If you're not keeping the people happy

1 in a competitive district, you're going to lose it, and
2 that is very key to us in rural areas where resources
3 are so scarce and we have to fight for everything we
4 can get. So please consider that political reality of
5 competitive districts and why that occurs and why
6 that's a point in your -- in your guidelines, in your
7 deliberations, that that is very important to have a
8 competitive district whenever possible, because, again,
9 you're not taken for granted, and we do get the
10 attention that is so difficult to get in rural areas,
11 because often we're ignored, especially when we're in
12 non-competitive districts. We're taken for granted.
13 And that's one of the reasons why you see the current
14 configuration of the two rural congressional districts,
15 one that focuses on the Colorado River, and you have
16 others that focus on the national forest on the north
17 and east side of the state going down to Gila, Tonto
18 National Forest, et cetera. So, again, I do greatly
19 appreciate that in all of your efforts.

20 And, also, from the Voting Rights Act
21 standpoint we ask that you maintain all of the current
22 tribal interests in both legislative and the
23 congressional district. If they -- if there is any
24 type of retrogression, you're going to trigger a VRA
25 lawsuit, and we don't want to see that happen, either.

1 So in my opinion we should try to keep the
2 districts as close to as they exist as possible because
3 it is prudent and in the best interests of rural
4 Arizona. So, again, thank you very much, and I'm at
5 your disposal if you have any questions as to what
6 transpired ten years ago, so thank you.

7 MS. VAN HAREN: And our final speaker is Jim
8 Parks.

9 MR. PARKS: Good evening, Madam Chair and
10 Commissioners. My name is Jim Parks. I live out in
11 Doney Park area near Winona.

12 I spent four years in the Navy during the
13 Vietnam war. I spent 38 years as a cow puncher. I
14 spent four years as a county supervisor here in
15 Coconino County, and I have to tell you that the
16 districts as they're drawn now don't work very well.

17 Is this thing on?

18 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Yes. We can hear you.

19 MR. PARKS: We have different issues here in
20 Northern Arizona. I represented part -- in my
21 supervisory position I represented a part of the Navajo
22 Nation, seven communities on Navajo, and the village of
23 Moenkopi on Hopi. I was a cowboy, like I said, for
24 38 years. Ranchers and cowboys have more in common
25 with the rural Navajo and Hopi than we have with the

1 people that live here in Flagstaff. So I guess what
2 I'm trying to say is we need to maintain our rural
3 perspective and our rural community here. We need
4 to -- we would like to see our community of this area,
5 Flagstaff community, kept whole. I would like to see
6 personally that we have a congressional district that
7 is Northern Arizona, not all the way down to Tucson.
8 Our issues are different here. We have forests. We
9 have forest fires. We have snow. We have road
10 conditions that are -- right now on Navajo Nation and
11 Hopi they're impassable. Those -- those issues are
12 different than folks down in Phoenix. We have water
13 issues. We have -- we have ATV and OHV issues here
14 that don't exist down there because those are the
15 people that are coming up here that tax our -- our
16 sheriff's department and our forest service people.

17 And the people that live in the communities
18 down in the forested areas, Forest Lakes, Blue Ridge,
19 Mormon Lake, those folks down there in the summertime
20 they have -- I don't want to use word "hell" so I'll
21 say heck -- with those people who don't have any
22 concept of what it is to own property in a national
23 forest. They think it all belongs to them.

24 So we have different issues here, and what I'm
25 trying to get across is please keep our community

1 separate from the folks that live in those highly
2 densely populated areas. Thank you.

3 MS. VAN HAREN: Thank you.

4 And I will turn it back over to Chairwoman
5 Neuberg to finish the meeting.

6 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Thank you.

7 Thank you, everyone, for participating. It is
8 a time investment, particularly those who have traveled
9 in our satellite locations. This participation and
10 democracy is truly meaningful, and we're deeply, deeply
11 appreciative for your input.

12 With that, as you've seen today on our
13 website, we have easy-to-use tools for learning about
14 and for sharing information about your community of
15 interest. Rather than relying purely on our
16 interpretation of your comments today, we encourage you
17 to please go online and submit a map to us. This will
18 ensure we correctly understand the definition of your
19 community. Please encourage your friends and neighbors
20 to share their thoughts, too. Anyone can do so online
21 any time. There is no requirement to attend one of
22 these meetings to be heard.

23 We hope to see some of you. If not, spread
24 the word. We will be tomorrow 2:00 p.m. in Window
25 Rock, 3:00 p.m. Navajo time. On Saturday we will be in

1 Show Low, 10:00 a.m. Sunday morning, Payson, 10:00
2 a.m. We look forward to as much vibrant conversation
3 and information as possible.

4 And with that, we will adjourn the meeting.
5 Thank you again, everybody.

6 (Meeting concluded at 7:37 p.m.)
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the proceedings had upon the foregoing meeting are contained in the shorthand record made by me thereof, and that the foregoing 108 pages constitute a full, true, and correct transcript of said shorthand record, all done to the best of my skill and ability.

DATED at Phoenix, Arizona, this 20th day of August, 2021.

-----*Debbie Wilks*-----

Deborah L. Wilks, RPR
Certified Court Reporter
Certificate No. 50849

* * *

I CERTIFY that Miller Certified Reporting, LLC, has complied with the requirements set forth in ACJA 7-201 and 7-206.

Dated at Litchfield Park, Arizona, this 10th day of August, 2021.

-----*MCR*-----

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
Arizona RRF No. R1058