

1 session.

2 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Madam Chair,

3 Vice Chair Watchman. So moved.

4 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Do I have a second?

5 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Commissioner Lerner seconds.

6 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Further discussion?

7 Commissioner Watchman.

8 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Aye.

9 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Mehl.

10 COMMISSIONER MEHL: Aye.

11 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Lerner.

12 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Aye.

13 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner York.

14 COMMISSIONER YORK: Aye.

15 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Neuberg is an

16 aye.

17 And I'm getting really fast at this.

18 With this, we're going to move into executive
19 session. Please exit out of this link and move into the
20 next link. Thank you.

21 (Whereupon the proceeding is in executive session
22 from 3:30 until 3:51 p.m.)

23

24

* * * * *

25

1 (Whereupon the proceeding resumes in
2 general session.)

3 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Okay. We have our
4 commissioners; we have our counsel online.

5 We are back in public meeting. Thank you for
6 everybody's patience. We are were continuing the
7 conversation on hiring an expert in differential privacy.

8 Based on the conversation, I will entertain a
9 motion to retain an expert witness in differential privacy
10 from a statistical perspective to see how this issue affects
11 Arizona, with a particular focus on one-vote, one-person,
12 and to mitigate any dilution of votes.

13 With that, I will enter- -- entertain the motion.

14 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Madam Chair, so moved.

15 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Do I have a second?

16 COMMISSIONER YORK: I have a comment. We need to
17 amend the motion to make sure counsel -- I don't think.

18 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: I'm sorry. There was an echo
19 and I didn't hear what you said, Commissioner York.

20 COMMISSIONER YORK: Isn't counsel going to -- isn't
21 going to find the expert?

22 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Yes.

23 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Yes.

24 COMMISSIONER YORK: That was not in the order.

25 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: We are authorizing counsel --

1 COMMISSIONER YORK: There you go.

2 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: -- to select and retain an
3 expert witness in differential privacy.

4 COMMISSIONER YORK: Perfect.

5 COMMISSIONER MEHL: I'll second.

6 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Any further discussion?
7 Commissioner Watchman.

8 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Aye.

9 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Mehl.

10 COMMISSIONER MEHL: Aye.

11 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Lerner.

12 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Aye.

13 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner York.

14 COMMISSIONER YORK: Aye.

15 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Neuberg is an
16 aye.

17 And, with that, Counsel is authorized to move
18 forward with retaining an expert witness in differential
19 privacy to ensure that the interests of Arizona are
20 protected.

21 If there's no further conversation on that agenda
22 item, we will move forward to No. X, discussion of future
23 agenda item requests.

24 I do know that legal our counsel would like to do
25 some training when we have the time sufficient.

1 Anything else in particular that my fellow
2 commissioners would like to add or raise at this point?

3 COMMISSIONER YORK: Were we going to post community
4 outreach coordinator position before we vetted the job
5 description?

6 Did you hear that? No?

7 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: I'm sorry, what are you
8 asking?

9 COMMISSIONER YORK: I said did we -- were we going
10 to post the community -- the community outreach coordinator
11 position?

12 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Are you asking to put that on
13 the future agenda item?

14 That is not --we're not in the middle of discussing
15 hires right now, so -- so are you asking for to put that on
16 a future agenda item, our hires, which will automatically
17 roll into next week?

18 COMMISSIONER YORK: Okay.

19 COMMISSIONER LERNER: So -- so you said that there
20 was going to be some training, which would be great, from
21 legal counsel. Could they as part of that talk -- come
22 back, circle back around about subcommittees?

23 We talked about that a while ago and whether that
24 could be part of -- they seemed to have said that there was
25 a potential for that. I would just like to get the final

1 word from them because we may want that in the future.

2 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Okay. Let's add to that on
3 the discussion of subcommittees.

4 If there's no other additions, Agenda Item No. XI,
5 discussion and possible action on the scheduling of future
6 meetings.

7 I would like to note that the next two weeks we
8 have hard stops actually at noon for a variety of conflicts
9 amongst the commissioners. So both on the 11th and 18th, we
10 only are available 'til noon and there is no other
11 compatibility -- at least next week -- for the Commissioners
12 to convene at another time.

13 So I'd like to propose, you know -- and we've
14 gotten just a tremendous amount of work done today, which is
15 excellent -- for a little of a buffer. How do people feel
16 starting early on the 11th and 18th?

17 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: That works.

18 COMMISSIONER YORK: I'm good.

19 COMMISSIONER LERNER: That's fine with me.

20 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: 8:00 or 8:30? 8:00 is great
21 for me, I mean, but. You know, we have a whole team here,
22 and I know that's taxing.

23 COMMISSIONER YORK: 8 o'clock works.

24 COMMISSIONER LERNER: 8 o'clock works. If it's
25 okay for the -- for our team, then 8 o'clock is fine for me.

1 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Okay. Sp let's plan for the
2 next two weeks for 8:00 a.m. to noon.

3 We -- we have on the agenda a travel schedule;
4 we're excited to welcome our PIO coming on board early June.
5 I think, you know, prior to that, I don't have much to add
6 with regard to a specific travel schedule unless anybody
7 else does.

8 COMMISSIONER LERNER: So, Chair Neuberg, once --
9 now that we have the mapping consultant, we got a bit of --
10 a bit of a handle on where things are going, should we start
11 thinking about as part of our travel schedule our first
12 round of public meetings, is that part of what you're
13 thinking?

14 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Yes. But I -- I don't have
15 anything in particular to recommend because I think it's
16 going to take a little time to marry our whole team -- and
17 -- and get, you know, and we also have IT issues to
18 consider. Because we can travel but if we don't have the
19 technology to go along with it, that that doesn't work. And
20 so, you know, I'm looking forward to very shortly getting
21 the entire team so that we can flesh it out I think more
22 effectively.

23 COMMISSIONER LERNER: I guess I like to have
24 something maybe -- it probably be something I could work
25 with our Executive Director a little bit on, but I'm just

1 looking at the next agenda item, public comments.

2 There's a number of different ways people give
3 public comments now and I'm wondering if -- and we may need
4 to wait for our IT person. But it would be nice if we could
5 somehow figure out a common method for people to give their
6 public comments because now I think when the meeting is
7 over, there are other ways with "contact me." Our e-mails
8 are not listed or our staff.

9 I just don't know what the answer is; I don't have
10 any suggestions. Other than maybe this is something we need
11 to look into it what can we do to make it a little more
12 efficient, and then it's more efficient for us to look at
13 them as well.

14 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: We can -- we can certainly
15 ask an IT person to help us with the transmission of the
16 information.

17 I -- I would like to reassure the public there are
18 two ways to reach us, it's essentially 24/7 and we receive
19 all the information. While public comments are open during
20 the public meeting, those comments are compiled, shared with
21 us, and they are eventually posted on our website.

22 When public comments are closed, anybody in the
23 public has the ability to reach us through the "Contact Us"
24 link on our website; that is shared with us. That is not
25 posted online as public comments. However, I'd like the

1 public to be aware that that material is subject to public
2 records request so anybody contacting us through either
3 means should understand that the content and their identity
4 is a matter of public record.

5 But as of right now I understand technology,
6 there -- there are gaps. It doesn't work sometimes; it's a
7 little confusing, but between the link on our agenda for
8 public comments and the "Contact Us" site on our website, we
9 are open for comments 24/7 when there's not a blackout
10 period.

11 Okay. Back to -- I think we've finished our future
12 meetings.

13 No. XII, an announcement. Next meeting will be
14 May 11th at 8:00 a.m. with a stop at noon.

15 With that, we will move to Agenda Item No. XIII,
16 which is the closing of public comments.

17 Please note members of the Commission may not
18 discuss items that are not specifically identified on the
19 agenda. Therefore, pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.01(H), action
20 taken as a result of public comment will be limited to
21 directing staff to the matter, responding to any criticism,
22 or scheduling the matter for further consideration and a
23 decision at a later date.

24 And, with that, we move to Agenda Item No. XIV,
25 which is adjournment.

1 I will entertain a motion to adjourn.

2 COMMISSIONER YORK: So moved.

3 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Second?

4 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Second.

5 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Any further discussion?

6 Vice Chair Watchman.

7 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Aye.

8 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Mehl.

9 COMMISSIONER MEHL: Aye.

10 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Lerner.

11 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Aye.

12 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner York.

13 COMMISSIONER YORK: Aye.

14 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Neuberg is an
15 aye.

16 And, with that, we will adjourn, and I look forward
17 to seeing everybody next Tuesday at 8:00 a.m.

18 Thank you for everybody's time and, you know,
19 patience today; it has been a long day.

20 (Whereupon the meeting concludes at 4:02 p.m.).

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF ARIZONA)

) ss.

COUNTY OF MARICOPA)

BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings were taken before me, Angela Furniss Miller, Certified Reporter No. 50127, all done to the best of my skill and ability; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter reduced to print under my direction.

I CERTIFY that I am in no way related to any of the parties hereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome thereof.

I FURTHER CERTIFY that I have complied with the requirements set forth in ACJA 7-206. Dated at Litchfield Park, Arizona, this 19th of May, 2021.



Angela Furniss Miller, RPR, CR
CERTIFIED REPORTER (AZ50127)

* * *

I CERTIFY that Miller Certified Reporting, LLC, has complied with the requirements set forth in ACJA 7-201 and 7-206. Dated at LITCHFIELD PARK, Arizona, this 19th of May, 2021.



Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
Arizona RRF No. R1058

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC