

THE STATE OF ARIZONA
INDEPENDENT REDISTRICTING COMMISSION

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF VIDEOCONFERENCE PUBLIC MEETING

Via GoogleMeets

January 21, 2022

9:02 a.m.

Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
PO Box 513, Litchfield Park, AZ 85340
(P) 623-975-7472 (F) 623-975-7462
www.MillerCertifiedReporting.com

Reported By:
Angela Furniss Miller, RPR
Certified Reporter (AZ 50127)

I N D E X

	<u>AGENDA ITEM:</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
1		
2	<u>AGENDA ITEM:</u>	
3	ITEM NO. I	4
4	ITEM NO. I(A)	4
5	ITEM NO. I(B)	5
6	ITEM NO. II	6
7	MOTION TO APPROVE THE MINUTES	6
8	VOTE	6
9	ITEM NO. III	7
10	ITEM NO. IV	7
11	ITEM NO. V	7
12	ITEM NO. V(A) - CONGRESSIONAL MAP	7
13	DISCUSSION	8
14	MOTION TO REAFFIRM THE VOTE ON FINAL	9
15	CONGRESSIONAL MAP	9
16	VOTE	10
17	ITEM NO. V(B) - LEGISLATIVE MAP	10
18	DISCUSSION	10
19	MOTION TO APPROVE THE LEGISLATIVE MAPS AS	11
20	FINAL	11
21	VOTE	12
22	ITEM NO. V(C)	26
23	MOTION TO APPROVE THE COMMISSION REPORT	26
24	DISCUSSION	26
25	VOTE	27
26	ITEM NO. V(D)	28
27	MOTION TO AUTHORIZE TRANSMITTAL OF THE MAPS	28
28	AND REPORT TO THE ARIZONA SECRETARY OF STATE	28
29	VOTE	29
30	ITEM NO. VI	29
31	ITEM NO. VII	29
32	ITEM NO. VIII	30
33	ITEM NO. IX	30
34	MOTION TO ADJOURN	30
35	VOTE	31
36		
37		
38		
39		
40		
41		
42		
43		
44		
45		
46		
47		
48		
49		
50		

1 PUBLIC MEETING, BEFORE THE INDEPENDENT
2 REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, convened at 9:02 a.m. on
3 January 21, 2022, via GoogleMeets, Arizona, in the presence
4 of the following Commissioners:

5 Ms. Erika Neuberg, Chairperson
6 Mr. Derrick Watchman, Vice Chairman
7 Mr. David Mehl
8 Ms. Shereen Lerner
9 Mr. Douglas York

10 OTHERS PRESENT:

11 Mr. Brian Schmitt, Executive Director
12 Ms. Loriandra Van Haren, Deputy Director
13 Ms. Valerie Neumann, Executive Assistant
14 Ms. Michele Crank, Public Information Officer

15 Mr. Roy Herrera, Herrera Arellano
16 Mr. Daniel Arellano, Herrera Arellano
17 Mr. Brett Johnson, Snell & Wilmer

18 Mr. Mark Flahan, Timmons Group
19 Mr. Brian Kingery, Timmons Group
20 Mr. Randy Trott, Timmons Group
21 Mr. Douglas Johnson, National Demographics Corp.
22 Ms. Ivy Beller Sakansky, National Demographics,
23 Corp.
24
25

P R O C E E D I N G

1
2
3 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Okay everyone, first I would
4 just like to apologize for the abrupt interruption on
5 Tuesday. I had a medical incident beyond my control, and I
6 look forward to getting our work done today.

7 Agenda Item I, call to order and roll call.

8 I(A), call for quorum. It is 9:02 a.m. on Tuesday,
9 January 21, 2022. I call this meeting of the Independent
10 Redistricting Commission to order.

11 For the record, the executive assistant Valerie
12 Neumann will be taking roll. When your name is called,
13 please indicate you are present. If you are unable to
14 respond verbally, we ask that you please type your name.

15 Val.

16 MS. NEUMANN: Thank you, Madam Chair.

17 Commissioner Lerner.

18 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Present.

19 MS. NEUMANN: Commissioner Mehl.

20 COMMISSIONER MEHL: Present.

21 MS. NEUMANN: Commissioner York.

22 COMMISSIONER YORK: Present.

23 MS. NEUMANN: Thank you.

24 Chairperson Neuberg.

25 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Present.

1 MS. NEUMANN: And for the record also in attendance
2 is Executive Director Brian Schmitt, Deputy Director Lori
3 Van Haren, Public Information Officer Michele Crank; from
4 our legal team we've got Brett Johnson from Snell & Wilmer,
5 Roy Herrera and Daniel Arellano from Herrera Arellano; and
6 our mapping consultant we've got Mark Flahan and Randy
7 Trott, Brian Kingery all from Timmons, and Doug Johnson and
8 Ivy Beller Sakansky from NDC Research; and Angela Miller our
9 transcriptionist.

10 That's everyone, Madam Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Okay. Thank you. Please
12 note for the minutes that a quorum is present.

13 Agenda Item I(B), call for notice.

14 Val, was the notice and agenda for the Commissioner
15 meeting properly posted 48 hours in advance of today's
16 meeting?

17 MS. NEUMANN: Yes, it was, Madam Chair.

18 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Okay. Thank you.

19 With that, it is 9:04, we will -- let's take a
20 ten-minute recess hope that Vice Chair Watchman will be on
21 by then.

22 Thank you.

23 (Recess taken from 9:04 a.m. to 9:15 a.m.)

24
25 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Please note for the minutes,

1 Val, that Vice Chair Watchman joined us at 9:15.

2 We will return to our agenda; we are on Agenda
3 Item II, approval of minutes from January 18th; we have (A),
4 the general session, we have (B) the executive session for a
5 legal review of our final maps.

6 Is there any discussion on the minutes from
7 January 18th?

8 If there's no discussion, I'll entertain a motion
9 to approve the general session and executive session minutes
10 from January 18th.

11 COMMISSIONER YORK: I make a motion to approve the
12 minutes from January 18th.

13 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Do I have a second?

14 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Commissioner Watchman
15 seconds.

16 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: If no further discussion,
17 Vice Chair Watchman.

18 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Aye.

19 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Mehl.

20 COMMISSIONER MEHL: Aye.

21 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Lerner.

22 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Aye.

23 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner York.

24 COMMISSIONER YORK: Aye.

25 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Chairwoman Neuberg is an aye.

1 And with that, the minutes are approved.

2 We'll move to Agenda Item No. III, opportunity for
3 public comments.

4 Public comment will now open for a minimum of
5 30 minutes and remain open until the adjournment of the
6 meeting. Comments will only be accepted electronically in
7 writing on the link provided in the notice and agenda for
8 this public meeting and will be limited to 3,000 characters.

9 Please note members of the Commission may not
10 discuss items that are not specifically identified on the
11 agenda. Therefore, pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.01(H), action
12 taken as a result of public comment will be limited to
13 directing staff to study the matter, responding to any
14 criticism, or scheduling the matter for further
15 consideration and decision at a later date.

16 With that we move to Agenda Item No. IV, discussion
17 on comments received prior to today's meeting.

18 Does anybody have anything to add?

19 Nor do I, so with that we will move to Agenda
20 Item No. V, discussion and final map vote and certification
21 transmittal to the Arizona Secretary of State.

22 Given the interruption on Tuesday, we will -- on
23 V(A) open it up if there's any additional congressional map
24 discussion; and, if not, we'll take a vote to reaffirm the
25 final congressional map.

1 Any discussion?

2 If there's no discussion, I'll entertain --

3 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Madam Chair, point of order.
4 Didn't we already vote for Item VIII(A), so...

5 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Yes. Yes, we did,
6 Vice Chair Watchman, but just out of abundance of caution
7 just given that, you know, I wasn't feeling that well, just
8 out of, you know, again just caution, we would like to
9 reaffirm the final vote.

10 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Is that --

11 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Procedural --

12 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: I'm sorry, Madam Chair. Is
13 that from legal counsel?

14 MR. B. JOHNSON: It is.

15 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Because we already voted, so
16 we've already spent too much time on it, so the vote is
17 vote.

18 MR. B. JOHNSON: Commissioner Watchman, this is
19 Brett. The vote is the vote and nobody needs to actually
20 speak again unless they have something additional. You can
21 refer back to your previous comments and then vote
22 appropriately as you -- as you deem fit. We do recommend
23 just making sure that the record is clear on any votes.

24 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Well, then, if I could,
25 Madam Chair, just another point of order, we only took the

1 final vote for congressional, so the agenda is wrong, should
2 be reaffirm the vote for Item (A).

3 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: That's what it is --

4 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: No, it's not.

5 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: -- it's congressional --
6 excuse me?

7 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: I'm sorry, Madam Chair. It
8 says "final map vote." We already took the final map vote
9 on the congressional maps and so the agenda is not
10 written --

11 MR. B. JOHNSON: It does say, Chair -- Vice Chair
12 Watchman, it does say "congressional map discussion and
13 reaffirmation."

14 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Okay. All right.

15 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Yes. This is -- is just
16 again we're on V(A), and it is just a reaffirmation of -- of
17 our vote; and if there's -- is there any discussion?

18 And if not, I'll entertain a motion to reaffirm --
19 do -- legal counsel, can I take a vote on the map or do we
20 actually need a motion to reaffirm it?

21 MR. B. JOHNSON: Just a motion to reaffirm the vote
22 from January 20th -- or January 18th, in regards to the
23 congressional map.

24 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Okay. I will entertain a
25 motion to reaffirm the vote on our final congressional map.

1 COMMISSIONER YORK: So moved --

2 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Do I have a second?

3 COMMISSIONER YORK: -- Commissioner York.

4 COMMISSIONER MEHL: Commissioner Mehl seconds.

5 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: If no further discussion,
6 Vice Chair Watchman.

7 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: I vote no.

8 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Mehl.

9 COMMISSIONER MEHL: I reaffirm all the comments I
10 made at our last meeting; and I vote yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Lerner.

12 COMMISSIONER LERNER: I will follow Commissioner
13 Mehl's way of saying it; I reaffirm my comments and I vote
14 no.

15 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner York.

16 COMMISSIONER YORK: I vote yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: And Chairperson Neuberg I
18 also reaffirm my comments and vote yes.

19 And so with that, the final congressional map is
20 reaffirmed and approved with a 3-2 vote.

21 Agenda Item No. V(B), legislative map discussion
22 and approval.

23 Is there any -- before we take a vote on the final
24 legislative map, is there any discussion that anybody would
25 like to add to our conversation from Tuesday?

1 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Chairwoman, I don't have any
2 specific on the legislative, but I would like to respond to
3 respond to some comments from Tuesday, if that would be
4 okay.

5 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Of course.

6 COMMISSIONER LERNER: All right.

7 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: You're welcome to respond at
8 whatever points in these items as you'd like.

9 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Well, I just wanted to be
10 sure it was the appropriate time.

11 MR. B. JOHNSON: Commissioner Lerner, you could do
12 it now -- just so process-wise, you can do it now, it's
13 called for discussion, or you explain your vote at the time
14 you vote, however -- whichever way you prefer.

15 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Oh. Whatever is easiest,
16 doesn't matter to me.

17 MR. B. JOHNSON: Your discretion.

18 COMMISSIONER LERNER: I'll wait until my vote then,
19 maybe that will be faster.

20 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Okay. So -- so if there's no
21 further discussion at this point, I will entertain a motion
22 to approve the legislative maps as our final draft.

23 COMMISSIONER MEHL: This is Commissioner Mehl, I
24 make a motion that we reapprove -- that we approve our
25 legislative map as our final map.

1 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Do I have a second?

2 COMMISSIONER YORK: Commissioner York seconds.

3 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Discussion -- well, we'll --
4 we'll take a vote and people can add their comments at that
5 point.

6 Commissioner Mehl.

7 COMMISSIONER MEHL: I reaffirm the comments I made
8 at our January 18th meeting; and I vote yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Thank you.

10 Commissioner Lerner.

11 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Chairwoman, I have a few
12 comments to make on this at this time.

13 So I -- I just want to say that I was really taken
14 aback on the personal attacks that I received on Tuesday. I
15 have abs- -- we have disagreements, we have differences of
16 opinions on how we see the maps; but it was the -- and my
17 comments have really tried to focus most on the
18 constitutional issues, but I feel they were personal attacks
19 on my integrity.

20 We're colleagues and I feel we should be respectful
21 to each other. But in the time on this Commission I feel we
22 had been, but the personal attacks accusing me of things
23 that were -- I will review a few of those today, I feel was
24 inappropriate.

25 Differences of opinion are just that. We have

1 differences of way -- we may see the world differently, but
2 I don't feel that's a reason for some of the accusations and
3 what I see as inappropriate language.

4 This process is not personal. It was to develop
5 the best maps for the State and my comments on the district
6 and maps were focused on my view of their constitutionality
7 and why I felt they could be approved.

8 I did not tack -- attack either Commissioner Mehl
9 or Chairwoman Neuberg for the difference of opinions or your
10 views. The fact that you made so many, I feel warranted
11 (verbatim) accusations, to justify the maps from your
12 perspectives I feel is wrong.

13 Commissioner Mehl, I've already responded to many
14 of the comments that you made on the congressional, many of
15 them overlap with the comments on the legislative; there
16 were a number of things that you said that I feel were
17 incorrect in your comments. For the sake of time, I'm not
18 going to go through all of them at this point. I just want
19 to make the point that there were a number of things that
20 you commented on that were not true in terms of things that
21 I said or did and things that you said or did as the way
22 that you presented it.

23 The one that I will mention because it was part of
24 our last deliberation on the legislative maps was
25 District 2.

1 During the District 2 discussion, I did everything
2 I could to try to find a compromise. I asked for four
3 alternatives. I spoke to my Republican colleagues about
4 options during breaks. I tried to do everything I could
5 from the perspective of communities of interest; and instead
6 I kept getting an absolute no from my Republican colleagues
7 with threats to change District 13, knowing that that was a
8 district that had been adjusted and that the Chairwoman
9 liked. So instead of actually having a negotiation, having
10 a discussion, it was a threat to blow up the maps. All over
11 one district that had been changed two days prior
12 significantly.

13 That's an example from my perspective of how I
14 reached out, tried to compromise, tried to find some balance
15 and, instead, was rebuffed on every front. And so when the
16 discussion about me trying to do things unilaterally or not
17 making adjustments, not compromising is completely incorrect
18 just based on our last day of meetings as an example; but
19 that happened time and again where I tried to find
20 compromise. And it would not lead -- those compromises that
21 I tried to find time and again were not to lead to ultimate
22 Democratic districts, they -- just as with District 2, it
23 would have remained a Republican district, but I was looking
24 at it from a community of interest.

25 Chairwoman Neuberger, I was really surprised that you

1 went back to the beginning of our time together a year ago
2 on the votes that we had for Executive Director, the mapping
3 team, attorneys all of which were early in the process to
4 try to discredit me. I don't disagree that I voted no on a
5 lot of those things, the record speaks for itself. But if
6 you follow the record, you would see that since that time I
7 have praised all of those individuals and companies as we
8 moved forward; and those things can happen. You can change
9 your perspective as you -- as things go forward.

10 I regularly let the mapping team know I trusted
11 them and I often asked them to see what they could do with
12 the request I had because I didn't have ideas. If I didn't
13 trust them, I wouldn't have done that. You can ask Doug
14 Johnson and Mark Flahan, I thanked each of them for their
15 integrity and the work they did. I have repeatedly,
16 publicly and privately, thanked our entire staff.

17 There was never a question that I was concerned
18 about competitive districts; that has been something I said
19 from the beginning. I expressed an interest in having as
20 many competitive as possible and to imply that I was
21 inconsistent is incorrect. I've always wanted the most
22 competitive districts possible.

23 The issues I raised in my comments on both
24 legislative and congressional districts were consistent with
25 comments I made throughout the process. You probably can

1 tell that there was some districts I never discussed. When
2 you talked about locking in districts, there were a number
3 of them I never felt I had comments on, but there were
4 others that I mentioned that I repeatedly went back to
5 because I felt that we had not yet addressed all of the
6 constitutional criteria.

7 I did not say we had a 50/50 state in terms of
8 partisanship. I consistently said we were 30-30-30 state,
9 which is why I believed we needed to have a balance in our
10 representation.

11 And I know there are more Republicans registered
12 than Democrats, I know it's not exactly 30-30-30, but it's
13 approximate in that way.

14 And yes, I did say as you noted, Chairwoman, that I
15 wanted a 15/15 legislature, I don't deny that comment that I
16 said that. It was counter to -- and it may have been the
17 wrong thing to say at the time; I don't disagree with that.
18 It -- Commissioner Mehl and I had had a previous discussion
19 where he had been telling me he wanted 17/13 or 18/12 and
20 that was part of why the 15/15 was on my mind, so just to
21 give that context.

22 And despite what you said, I do not believe it is a
23 weakness to be aware of the past. Of course it's my
24 background and it's my degree, my academic degree. It is
25 useful to understand the past so we understand what worked

1 and what did not work.

2 The decision to throw out anything that was done
3 before rather than consider if it's not broken, don't fix it
4 was limiting. And of course we have to look forward, of
5 course we start with a clean slate and a blank state, but
6 you can't do that without understanding where we've been.

7 Now to one of the bigger comments that you made
8 that I really object to. I've never been directed by anyone
9 as both you and Commissioner Mehl accused me. And, in fact,
10 I want to be honest here, you said I was being directed by
11 Democrats and there was a sixth person in the room. Let's
12 add the seventh and eighth person.

13 If you're being completely upfront and if
14 Commissioner Mehl is being Commissioner upfront, you would
15 admit that the Republicans were also on their phones during
16 our meetings constantly with the Arizona and national
17 Republicans, as well as making calls at every break.

18 The eighth person is our Executive Director who you
19 were meeting with and receiving messages from during
20 meetings.

21 So let's be honest, all of us be honest, we all had
22 people talking to us. It's our decision on who we listen to
23 and who we don't, but don't accuse me of something that you
24 and the Republicans were also doing.

25 What's most striking is that you didn't acknowledge

1 how many times I compromised and worked to find agreement.
2 There were numerous times I didn't like what we were doing
3 but for the sake of moving forward -- which I often would
4 state -- I would vote yes. If I disagree, I'm allowed to
5 vote no. A no vote is not against you, Chair Neuberg,
6 that's not what that is implying. A no vote is not
7 personal, it's just about our own views.

8 In addition, during breaks I would often speak with
9 my Republican colleagues to find -- to see if we could find
10 a compromise. Time and again I went over to them looking
11 for things that we could do together; and I think you
12 could -- you even commented on how pleased you were to see
13 us working together, that we were speaking together and
14 working together. That's not the sign of somebody who is
15 not trying to find compromise, that's the sign of somebody
16 who is reaching out, which is what I did over and over
17 again.

18 So I will comment on the fact that you only thanked
19 the Republicans for their integrity and support, which I
20 find ironic because many of the reasons I can't support the
21 map has to do with things that were done that were so
22 clearly for partisan gain that they violated my sense of
23 fairness. Moving lines for sitting legislators, drawing
24 lines to increase vote spreads, selectively ignoring
25 communities of interest that didn't fit the lines that were

1 wanted and more; and that happened time and again. That's
2 not what I believe in.

3 I have the same interest as you, Chairwoman. I
4 want to get rid of the toxicity of mistrust and tribalism
5 and do what's right for our state and country. The personal
6 attacks on me violates what you said you wanted. And please
7 remember, I defended you, your interest in doing the right
8 thing for the state, your integrity when others were not and
9 when you were being attacked. In contrast you chose to
10 attack me personally as we include our time together.

11 We all come to the table with our own worldviews
12 and what we think is best. You said that you did things
13 that made sense to you. Well, so did I. And I shouldn't be
14 condemned for having that different perspective.

15 Time after time I wanted you to express your views
16 so we would better understand the direction you wanted, most
17 of the time you said I want to hear from everybody else
18 first before I express mine. So to me it's disingenuous now
19 that you're upset if I disagreed with something when it
20 wasn't always clear what you wanted.

21 There are many things, other things that you said
22 were absolutely untrue, but I'm not going to go through
23 them. Suffice to say I'm just disappointed that this became
24 personal, that it was a personal attack on my integrity
25 because of the disagreements on the map.

1 It's been an honor for me to work on the
2 Independent Redistricting Commission. I thank the public
3 for their engagement in the process; I thank the staff and
4 all of our consultants for their hard work and
5 responsiveness to our requests.

6 And finally, I thank all of our Commissioners, all
7 of my colleagues. In particular my Democratic colleague
8 Vice Chair Watchman, but I do thank all of you for the
9 incredible time commitment and dedication to the process.
10 We all came into this wanting to do the best for the state.
11 We came in with different perspectives, different
12 worldviews, different ways of accomplishing it, but it
13 doesn't mean that we came into this without the same goals
14 of trying to do the right thing, and for that, I thank you.
15 I thank each of you.

16 That concludes my comments, Madam Chair.

17 And with that, then I vote no on the maps.

18 Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Thank you very much.

20 Commissioner York.

21 MR. B. JOHNSON: Commissioner York you're on mute.

22 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: We still can't hear you.

23 COMMISSIONER YORK: I unmuted.

24 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Now we can hear you.

25 COMMISSIONER YORK: All right. I vote aye.

1 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: And do you -- would you like
2 any further discussion?

3 COMMISSIONER YORK: (No audible response.)

4 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Okay. And I believe
5 Vice Chair Watchman, we started with you, correct?

6 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Yeah.

7 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Just make sure that we --

8 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: I haven't voted yet, but I
9 just wanted to, if I could, Madam Chair and colleagues, just
10 echo what my colleague Shereen Lerner has indicated.

11 I am troubled, however, you know, this is a process
12 and I appreciate working with everybody. And I appreciate
13 also the attention to our brothers and sisters who live on
14 reservations here in the state. And so, you know, I was
15 appointed as -- as an individual to represent the indigenous
16 communities of the state because I went back and looked at
17 my appointment letter. And so being -- being a member of
18 the Navajo Nation myself, you know, I hold that in high
19 regard.

20 And so that was my -- my primary mission to make
21 sure that -- that there was a voice on the Commission for
22 the 22 tribes here in the state. And so I'm -- I'm
23 appreciative to you, Madam Chair and my colleagues, for, you
24 know, for recognizing that. You know, obviously many of us
25 in the community, many people of color have had, you know,

1 trials and tribulations; but here in this state, Indian
2 country, Native Americans have had, you know, long battles
3 and long hauls, you know, and it was only recent that, you
4 know, I -- I as an individual, I as a member of a tribe were
5 able to vote, 1964 as an example. Even though the Navajo
6 Reservation was created 1868, the state of Arizona was
7 created 1912, Native Americans in this state were not
8 allowed to vote until only a few years ago, so that's
9 troubling in and of itself.

10 But, you know, I -- I hold this position in high
11 regard. Any time you serve the public, you know, you have
12 to, you know, be honest and forthright and do the right
13 thing.

14 I do believe in fairness. As I said before, you
15 know, my -- my -- my role and one of my goals was to make
16 sure that we had a fair and balanced, if you will, set of
17 lines that represent, you know, the parties, the communities
18 of interest, you know, things that -- that are spoken to in
19 the constitution and, so.

20 But it is a process and sometimes, you know, things
21 get personal which I don't think is the right thing to do.
22 But, you know, I again appreciate the staff.

23 And yes, you know, we did vote like we did, but
24 that was at the time, you know, and that's all right 'cause
25 you vote the way we feel and, so.

1 But I'll -- I'll conclude my short, brief statement
2 here that it's been a pleasure working with everybody on
3 this call, our lawyers, our consultants and the staff, and
4 then representing each and every citizen of the state, the
5 7 million-plus.

6 You know, it's been an honor, you know, as -- as a
7 member of -- of Northern Arizona, as a member of the Navajo
8 Nation, and as someone that has worked very, very hard in my
9 career to ensure, you know, that -- that the political
10 process recognizes and includes Indian country. That's been
11 my life-long work, to make sure Native American people --
12 even though we're only a small percent of the community and
13 for the most part even though we -- we have reservations,
14 and I think it's a good thing, Indian reservations, some
15 think to the contrary, but that's been my life-long work.

16 So with that, my vote is still a no, you know, for
17 principal reasons, but I do appreciate the recognition and
18 positive consideration for the tribes.

19 So thank you, Madam Chair.

20 Yá'át'ééh in Navajo. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: You're welcome.

22 Well, I too am greatly appreciative of all of the
23 contributions and hard work and diligence and -- and, you
24 know, study over the past year.

25 And, you know, I -- I am sorry if -- if my words

1 hurt anybody, I did try to avoid ad hominem attacks and
2 really focus on facts and behavior that I felt were relevant
3 to doing what I feel is my responsibility, which is to
4 vigorously defend the legitimacy and constitutionality of
5 our process and our maps.

6 So I felt that, you know, my comments were all
7 given with that intention in mind. I am aware,
8 Commissioner Lerner, that your alternatives were rebuffed on
9 the legislative map. Quite honestly, you know, I -- I felt
10 that I needed to value and put the integrity of the maps
11 first above simply compromise and there wasn't an
12 alternative that I felt better captured our state. So I
13 felt that it was more important for me to honor what I feel
14 is right for Arizona than, you know, make compromises
15 that -- that maybe would make me feel good or look good or
16 whatever; and it was a very, very tough decision and I wish
17 I could have satisfied more people in our state.

18 And so with that, I vote yes.

19 And so the legislative maps are approved with a 3-2
20 vote.

21 We will move to Agend- -- Agenda Item Number --

22 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Madam Chair, could I just say
23 one thing?

24 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Uh-huh.

25 COMMISSIONER LERNER: I appreciate that, your

1 comment about that, my only concern was that you weren't
2 recognizing the attempt to compromise. So I certainly
3 respect your decision; I don't question your decision, but
4 your comments indicated -- seemed to indicate that that was
5 not part of the practice that was working, so that was my
6 focus.

7 I have no problem with you making decisions that
8 you think are in the best -- that you feel are the best
9 decisions.

10 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: You know what, I -- I do not
11 recall ever saying anything about a lack of compromise, I'll
12 go back and read my -- my, you know, remarks, you know.
13 But, yes, I think you've tried to hard to find different
14 solutions along the way.

15 COMMISSIONER YORK: Well, we all did, I believe,
16 tried to find compromise in a lot of areas.

17 I think the Princeton Project that we had talked to
18 us for an hour and a half, they gave us a pretty high
19 remark. We didn't get an A, I believe, but I think we got a
20 B on their rating of how we did. I don't think they gave
21 that rating to any other state, so I think we did a pretty
22 good job.

23 So with that.

24 COMMISSIONER LERNER: I agree there was a lot of
25 efforts to compromise, my concern was only in the comments.

1 Thank you. Sorry to interrupt you.

2 COMMISSIONER YORK: No, no. We're good.

3 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: All right. Is everybody
4 ready to move to Agenda Item V(C)?

5 COMMISSIONER YORK: Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commission report discussion
7 and approval. We have a very comprehensive, I think, great
8 analysis of our process and our maps.

9 Is there any discussion we can now -- I'll
10 entertain a motion to approve the Commission report and then
11 we can hold our discussion after we -- we do through the
12 motion if that works for all of you.

13 So I'll need a motion or entertain a motion to
14 approve the Commission report that you've all had to time to
15 review.

16 COMMISSIONER MEHL: This is Commissioner Mehl, I
17 move that we approve the -- the reports for both the
18 congressional and legislative map.

19 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Do I have a second?

20 COMMISSIONER YORK: Commissioner York seconds.

21 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Okay. With that, I'll open
22 it up to discussion.

23 Does anybody have any discussion?

24 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: I do, Madam Chair.

25 It's -- it's a great report, lengthy report. Well,

1 not as inclusive as I was thinking, but it does it hit the
2 points and does speak to the responsibilities that we as a
3 Commission are responsible to do. And so, you know, I guess
4 for me a few additional thoughts would have been -- would
5 have been appropriate for me but, you know, notwithstanding
6 the timing and the work that went into it, it's a good
7 report as I said.

8 I thought it was thorough enough to meet the
9 comments of the constitution and what we as a Commission
10 have to do. So great, great job. For the most part.

11 Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Any other conversation?

13 COMMISSIONER LERNER: This is Commissioner Lerner,
14 there were a few minor things that I saw that I didn't
15 completely agree with, but nothing that's so striking that
16 it shouldn't be moved forward.

17 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Okay. And I just, I believe
18 everybody has had this, so we've all had opportunities to
19 share feedback.

20 Okay. We'll take a vote.

21 Commissioner Mehl if I can -- oh. There you are.
22 Commissioner Mehl -- oh. I'm starting wrong Vice Chair --
23 see, I'm out of order today.

24 Vice Chair Watchman.

25 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Thank you, Madam Chair. I

1 vote aye.

2 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Mehl.

3 COMMISSIONER MEHL: Aye.

4 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Lerner.

5 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Aye.

6 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner York.

7 COMMISSIONER YORK: Aye.

8 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Chairperson Neuberg is an
9 aye.

10 And with that the Commission report is approved
11 5-0.

12 We move to Agenda Item No. V(D), which is authorize
13 the Chair to submit -- to transmit the maps and report to
14 the Arizona Secretary of State.

15 I'll entertain a motion to move and authorize
16 myself to transmit the maps and report to the Arizona
17 Secretary of State.

18 COMMISSIONER LERNER: This is Commissioner Lerner,
19 so move.

20 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Do I have a second?

21 COMMISSIONER MEHL: Commissioner Mehl seconds.

22 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Vice Chair Watchman seconds.

23 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Just for the record,
24 Vice Chair Watchman, can you say it again?

25 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: I'm sorry.

1 Vice Chair Watchman seconds that motion.

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Any further discussion?

4 Vice Chair Watchman.

5 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Aye.

6 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Mehl.

7 COMMISSIONER MEHL: Aye.

8 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Lerner.

9 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Aye.

10 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner York.

11 COMMISSIONER YORK: Aye.

12 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Chairperson Neuberg is an
13 aye.

14 And with that, we are authorized and will submit
15 the report and the maps to the Arizona Secretary of State.

16 And, you know, I just want to -- want to conclude
17 that section by saying that it is my sincere hope that these
18 maps will encourage the best and the brightest in our state
19 to run for these new districts and really serve Arizonans as
20 I believe they deserve.

21 So we will move to Agenda Item No. VI, discussion
22 of future agenda item requests.

23 Given all the uncertainty, I'm not sure anybody
24 has -- would have anything to add at that point.

25 So we'll move to Agenda Item No. VII,

1 announcements.

2 I do not have any announcements. I don't know if
3 staff or Legal, anybody have anything they would like to --
4 to share?

5 Okay. Agenda Item No. VIII, next meeting date.

6 To be determined. It's unclear what the needs will
7 be from a budgetary perspective, litigation perspective.
8 Just to give you a general sense of reference, I believe the
9 previous Commission met every few months or so in that first
10 year. But, again, to be determined and -- and I'm sure
11 staff will be staying in touch.

12 We'll move to Agenda Item No. IX, closing of public
13 comments.

14 Please note members of the Commission may not
15 discuss items that are not specifically identified on the
16 agenda. Therefore, pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.01(H), action
17 taken as a result of public comment will be limited to
18 directing staff to study the matter, responding to any
19 criticism, or scheduling the matter for further
20 consideration or decision at a later date.

21 With that, we move to adjournment. I will open it
22 up -- open up to a motion to adjourn.

23 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Vice Chair motions to
24 adjourn.

25 COMMISSIONER YORK: Commissioner York seconds.

1 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: With no further discussion,
2 Vice Chair Watchman.

3 VICE CHAIR WATCHMAN: Aye.

4 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Mehl.

5 COMMISSIONER MEHL: Aye.

6 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner Lerner.

7 COMMISSIONER LERNER: Aye.

8 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: Commissioner York.

9 COMMISSIONER YORK: Aye; and thank you,
10 Commissioner Neuberg.

11 CHAIRPERSON NEUBERG: And Chairperson Neuberg is an
12 aye.

13 And with that, with my greatest of gratitude and
14 appreciation for all of my colleagues, all of the staff and
15 consultants who I believe, you know, read the report, read
16 the transcripts, we've done a remarkable job and from the
17 bottom of my heart, I thank you.

18 So bye-bye and 'til next time.

19 (Whereupon the proceeding concludes at 9:49 a.m.)

20

21

22

23 "This transcript represents an unofficial record.

24 Please consult the accompanying video for the official

25 record of IRC proceedings."

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF ARIZONA)
) ss.
COUNTY OF MARICOPA)

BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings were taken before me, Angela Furniss Miller, Certified Reporter No. 50127, all done to the best of my skill and ability; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter reduced to print under my direction.

I CERTIFY that I am in no way related to any of the parties hereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome thereof.

I FURTHER CERTIFY that I have complied with the requirements set forth in ACJA 7-206. Dated at Litchfield Park, Arizona, this 24th of January, 2022.



Angela Furniss Miller, RPR, CR
CERTIFIED REPORTER (AZ50127)

* * *

I CERTIFY that Miller Certified Reporting, LLC, has complied with the requirements set forth in ACJA 7-201 and 7-206. Dated at LITCHFIELD PARK, Arizona, this 24th of January, 2022.



Miller Certified Reporting, LLC
Arizona RRF No. R1058